# Brand New Consumers. A social practice approach to young immigrants coping with material culture in Italy

Journal:	Cultural Sociology
Manuscript ID	CS-16-0153.R4
Manuscript Type:	Original Manuscript
Keywords:	Consumption, Material Culture, Habitus, Visual Ethnography, Hysteresis Effect, Social Practice
Abstract:	While the role of material culture in reproducing everyday routines and representations has been widely studied, only specific social groups – mostly US or Europe based – have been studied qua 'consumers'. This article draws on the heuristic potential of materiality for the analysis of consumption practices, and on Bourdieu's theory of practice and notions of habitus and hysteresis, in order to explore what happens when immigrants bring their earlier dispositions to new social and material settings. In accordance with the Bourdieusian notion of hysteresis, the article investigates the extent of creative adaptations made possible by the lagging of habitus. Findings from a two-year research project are presented, focusing on both verbal and visual representations of taste of a sample of boys and girls of different national origins recently arrived in Italy. Furthermore the article discusses the potential of the photoelicitation technique for analyzing social consumption practices and its overall contribution to the study of the wider relationship between consumption practices and ethnic identification.

SCHOLARONE<sup>™</sup> Manuscripts

## 

## Introduction

Social research on consumption has so far failed to incorporate and account for the place, practices and existence of immigrants to any significant degree. While scholars have often investigated the role of material culture in reproducing everyday routines and representations (Douglas, Isherwood 1979; Bourdieu 1984; Miller 1998), only specific social groups have been studied *qua* 'consumers', mostly US or European citizens (Brewer, Trentmann 2006).

In fact, in the same way as Cook (2008) exposed the lack of study of children's consumption practices, I contend that scholars have not been concerned to situate immigrants' consumption *practices* as such: the present paper starts from such acknowledgment, that it is necessary to recognize immigrants as well as children as "vital and integral to creation and development of the varied meanings surrounding the world of goods, presently and historically" (Cook 2008: 221).

I will refer to Bourdieu's theory of practice (1984) and mainly to his notion of *habitus*, in order to explore what happens when immigrants bring their original dispositions to a new social and material setting. Bourdieu's notion of *hysteresis* effect (Bourdieu 2000) is particularly appropriate to operationalize the moment when a field changes abruptly and to explain how consumers with different social backgrounds make sense of their new environment based on their capacity to decipher similarities between their

previous life context and the new one (Kerr and Robinson 2009; Nowicka 2015).

Thus, the main research question concerns whether migrants' consumption practices contribute to manage a split *habitus*, trying to reduce the dissonance between the norms and practices acquired prior to and post migration, or whether and to what extent their lagging *habitus* may call into question what is normally taken for granted about consumption practices. Therefore, I chose to focus not just on *moments of disorientation* that reveal the anxious conditions linked to the mismatch between consumers' *habitus* and the new material setting, as the mainstream literature on consumer acculturation suggests (Luedicke 2011). Instead, in accordance with the Bourdieusian notion of *hysteresis*, I will mostly investigate the *creative adaptations* made possible by the lagging of the *habitus*.

The article is organized as follows. After a brief presentation of the main theoretical attempts to deal with consumption and ethnic identification, I begin by discussing the issue of the transforming *habitus* and its *hysteresis* effect (Bourdieu 1977; 2000) in the field of consumption, focusing especially on the heuristic potential of *materiality* in analyzing consumption practices (Warde 2015; XXX 2012). I then briefly discuss the methodological strategies developed in my empirical research: I present the specific visual ethnography (Pink 2006) that I conducted on a small sample of respondents and I discuss the potential of the photo-elicitation technique

(Harper 2002) for analyzing social practices. The two subsequent sections offer a discussion of the main research findings around modes of material engagement by respondents when they *encounter*, *evaluate* and *act* with objects (Rinkinen et al 2015). I conclude by reflecting on the contribution of this paper to the study of the wider relationship between consumption practices and ethnic identification.

## Consumption practices, material culture and ethnic identity

The main theoretical framework with the explicit aim of investigating the relationship between consumption and migration is the so-called 'consumer acculturation theory'. This approach tries to keep together attention to low income – typical of segmented assimilation theory<sup>1</sup> – with a focus on transnationalism and the multidimensional trajectories of identification in migration (O'Guinn et al., 1986; Beck and Sznaider 2006, Hofmeister and Breitenstein 2008). This stream of literature started in the 1980s by exploring the complexities of migrants' adaptation to Western consumer cultures. The field of 'consumer acculturation research' has since then been established by assessing the levels of assimilation through differences in consumption choices particularly vis-à-vis American mainstream consumers. Recently there have been significant adjustments and reviews of that theory, paying more attention to intra-ethnic differentiations (Ogden *et al* 2004; Wakiuru *et al* 2007) and power relations (Üstüner and Holt 2007; Askegaard *et al*.

2005). A sort of 'post-assimilationist' view is adopted, even though assimilation perspectives are lingering on (Luedicke 2011).

However, my point is that there is a need to go beyond this kind of approach based on declared attitudes of consumers and begin to understand consumption as a *social praxis* embedded in complex structures of power relations (Lamont 1992; Lizardo 2008; Bennett et al. 2009). Sociological engagement with 'the practice turn' has been promising in this respect (Schatzki et al. 2001). Although it is not easy to specify what the exponents and implementers of practice theories have in common, most claim that explanation should rely on routine, shared understanding, the embodied and, above all, the material (Reckwitz 2002a,b; Shove et al. 2012)

All in all, practice theories seem appealing for the study of consumption because they promise an alternative to models of individual choice and uncover phenomena normally concealed in the cultural analysis of consumption. As Warde neatly clarified:

Against the model of the sovereign consumer, practice theories emphasize routine over actions, flow and sequence over discrete acts, *dispositions over decisions*, and practical consciousness over deliberation. In reaction to the cultural turn, emphasis is placed upon doing over thinking, *the material over the symbolic*, and embodied practical competence over expressive virtuosity in the fashioned presentation of self. (2014: 286)

Accordingly, the practice turn in consumption studies has drawn on the idea that consumption is mostly a mundane process of appropriation and appreciation of goods and services, and not merely acquisition through market exchange and communicative display. Moreover, early works in this

vein (Shove et al. 2012) paid particular tribute to the decisive role of equipment of practice – objects, tools, material artefacts and infrastructures – drawing mostly on anthropological studies of consumption and the notion of appropriation (Appadurai, 1986; Kopytoff, 1986; Miller, 1987).

This material orientation of theories of social practice (Shove et al. 2012), is well suited to the analysis of the embodied dispositions of young children of immigrants and their consumption practices as opposed to those of more or less acculturated individuals.

## The social practice approach and the hysteresis effect

When an approach based on theories of practice is adopted (Shove et al. 2012), the focus shifts to human / non-human interaction. In fact, "the social significance of material objects lies in the ways in which they are "handled", in how they are mobilized in practice and how they combine in practice-arrangement nexuses." (Rinkinen et al. 2015: 871). Accordingly, the social practice approach investigates the *distributed agency* between humans and things (Sahakian and Wihilite 2014): it looks at *both humans and things as elements of a particular social practice* in order to empirically grasp and eventually reconstruct their specific practical co-dependency (Preda 1999). This approach makes it possible to understand how knowledge embodied by human agents and knowledge incorporated by materials *empirically* 

http://mc.manuscriptcentral.com/culturalsociology

converge into one social practice. This means focusing on the practical encounters between specific embodied dispositions and particular materials.

The notion of *hysteresis* (Bourdieu 2000) has already been employed in migration studies (Nowicka 2015) in order to understand specific processes developing in the context of resettlement and demands on migrants for the "transformation of [their] embodied capacities, and the formation of a new set of bodily capacities" (Noble 2013: 343)

When a field changes abruptly, habitus might be lagging behind this change, it might misfit the field. Bourdieu uses the term 'hysteresis' for this situation which he borrowed from scientific experimentation context and which means a mismatch between two elements which were previously coordinated, (...). If the field changes abruptly, for example due to some external intervention that offers new opportunities, the participants of the field might not be equipped with the attitudes and practices that are needed to recognize, grasp and occupy these new field positions. (Nowicka 2015: 13)

However, it is important not to confuse the *hysteresis* effect with the Bourdieusian notion of *inertia* of the *habitus*. In fact, following Wacquant, *hysteresis* "is a constitutive property of every *habitus* referring to the builtin lag between the time it is forged and the moment it is activated (a *temporal* gap between cause and effect rooted in remanent embodiment)" (2014: 9). This is quite different from the misalignment between *habitus* and *doxa* that makes the agent feel out of place and out of sync. In other words, according to Bourdieu's theory of practice (2000) it is possible to find *hysteresis* without any necessary or complete realignment with the "rules of the game" – that is, between *habitus* and *doxa* – which would in fact amount to once again turning to the consumer acculturation thesis. In other words,

the peculiarity of the notion of *hysteresis* is its heuristic capacity to explain how *open and dynamic* structures react late to the tensions applied in a previous time. In fact, it is such a lag that generates the possibility for both disorientation *and* creativity in dealing with objects, artifacts and material settings.

In spite of many criticisms of Bourdieu's "reproduction theory" (Sewell 1992; King 2000) and the rigidity of the notion of *habitus* that cannot "be regarded as a source of creativity" (Crossley 2014: 108), such creative potentialities of habitus are clearly activated in unfamiliar fields, such as those experienced by children of immigrants. In fact, according to Wacquant "habitus can be a source of creativity whenever it is composed of disparate dispositions in tension or contradiction with one another; *whenever it encounters settings that challenge its active proclivities*" (Wacquant 2014: 5)

There are three main competing approaches to the relationship between consumption and social stratification mediated by the mechanism of *class habitus* (Chan and Goldthorpe 2007): the homology thesis (Holt 1998; Ollivier 2004; Brisson and Bianchi 2017); the individualization argument (Giddens 1991, Bauman 2007), and the omnivore-univore argument (Peterson and Simkus 1993; Bennett et al. 2009; Lizardo and Skiles 2012). Despite their differences (Lizardo 2008), what is at the stake in all these attempts is dealing with the issue of power in the field of consumption,

### **Cultural Sociology**

especially questioning the reproductive and conservative effect of *class habitus* within different social structures. There are many classic examples in this regard, in many countries, like Australia (Bennett et al. 1999), USA (Lamont 1992), France (Coulangeon and Lemel 2009) and Germany (Blasius and Friederichs 2008), to name but a few.

Nevertheless, insofar as one is concerned with the role of *habitus* in orienting tastes, when we draw on Bourdieu's theory of practice "it is on consumption *as a form of social action* that attention must focus" (Chan and Goldthorpe 2007: 3). In other words, as recent studies indicate, it is necessary to move from tastes to activities (Coulangeon and Lemel 2009), from the 'what' to the 'how' of cultural consumption (Daenekindt and Rose 2017.

Instead of focusing on group entities reproduced by the mechanism of *habitus*, therefore, we may examine how particular consumption practices are carried out by social agents, and finally how symbolic violence (Bourdieu 2000) operates *via habitus* when exposure to "objective conditions" leads to actions "pre-adapted to objective demands" despite agents' aspirations and ambitions (Bourdieu 1990: 63). Bourdieu's theory of practice is important for studying the consumption practices of immigrant children especially because of its contrast between the notion of hysteresis and the notion of complicit action brought about by symbolic violence. According to Strand and Lizardo, in fact, "Hysteresis refers to

#### **Cultural Sociology**

asynchronicity (...) and a lack of institutional scaffolding, as the space of possibilities mismatches the actor with available possibilities. (...) Reflexiveness instead of complicity emerges as the dispositional trait associated with this tangled, asynchronic relationship.." (Strand and Lizardo 2017: 23)

When a hysteresis mismatch occurs, modalities of reflexiveness can emerge between the slower temporality of practice and the faster temporalities of environments. Then agents are in the position to follow novel or unexpected lines of action, "violating regularities that (to observers) appear as normal conduct" (Strand and Lizardo 2017: 11).

Finally, in the space between the constraints of symbolic violence and the openness of reflexiveness created by the hysteresis effect, there is room for empirically investigating consumption practices without relying on any theories of consumer acculturation or on a deterministic reproduction of social groups. Therefore, instead of assuming a linear system of integration into a group, a society or a culture – that is, basically the adjustment of *habitus* and *doxa* – the notion of *hysteresis* effect, especially when it is mobilised within theories of practice, makes it possible to conceive of the interaction between immigrant *habitus* and the material setting as open and dynamic, and as a space in which the social agent begins to 'play'.

## Visual ethnography and photo-elicitation interviewing

http://mc.manuscriptcentral.com/culturalsociology

What I will discuss further below are the results of a specific *case-study* (Flyvbjerg 2006), which is part of a larger research project on young children of immigrants in Italy and their relatives.<sup>2</sup> While the overall project investigated the complex category of 'second generation' immigrants (Crul and Vermeulen 2003), in this case I will refer to respondents as merely 'children of immigrants' in a sort of *emic* manner, since this is what they call themselves in their daily lives. This is because I am not interested in studying individuals and the impact of their national origins. Instead, as explained above, I will focus on practices and their material basis, as well as the identification processes taking shape in such practices.

Drawing on some previous attempts (Massey and Sanchez 2007) to mix verbal and visual methodology (Rose 2001; Harper 2003), I worked with a combination of different methods, as is customary of the 'ethnographic gaze' (Hammersley and Atkinson 1995). I conducted a visual ethnography (Mason 2005; Pink 2006) mixing three different techniques to produce data: classic participant observation in schools and in households during which I collected photos by myself; narrative interviews with children of immigrants and with some of their parents; 'autodriven' photo-elicitation interviews (Clark 1999; Harper 2002; Meo 2010). However, I will now discuss mainly the use of photo elicitation interviews (PEI).

I chose autodriven PEI (Clark 1999) as a strategic tool for two main reasons. First, a practical one: PEI makes it possible to resolve the

communication impasse (Harper 2002), since most of my young respondents were used to talking and trading with images in their daily lives. This is, of course, a significant issue when interviewing young boys and girls from different linguistic communities. Second, in the case of migrant narratives, PEI is proven to be particularly suited to reducing power imbalances between researcher and participants (Ortega-Alcazar, Dyck 2011), since it enables participants to establish or add themes to the research questions. Also, it was significant especially in order to test the relevance of things and materials without me directing the focus to them.

During my field research, I started by interviewing a specific section (14 boys and 24 girls, aged from 17 to 23) extracted from the broad sample of 73 participants in the overall research project, which provided me with the first stream of information about their social trajectories and their relationship with objects and materials. The reason why I selected such a particular group was because all the interviewees had arrived in Italy in the recent past (from 1 to 5 years). Consequently, I could capture the particular empirical situation of a *mismatch* between *habitus* acquired in the country of origin and the new material setting of the host country.

Moreover, the research took place in various "distressed neighborhoods" (Blasius and Friederichs 2008) of Milan and my respondents comprised boys and girls attending different kinds of high school situated in those

areas. Also, as regards their parents' occupations and income, they all shared a condition similar to that of the lower classes.

In this way, while most authors who adopt Bourdieu's approach concentrate on upper and middle classes (Lamont 2002; Bennett et. al 2009; Coulangeon and Lemel 2009), I focused on *a particular fraction of the lower classes*. My purpose was then to test if and to what extent the hysteresis effect illustrated above could at least partially change the "taste of necessity" usually associated with such class fractions (Bourdieu 1984; Blasius and Friederichs 2008). In fact, *habitus* is related to agents' social location – and hysteresis is about change in social locations. This includes geographical mobility, of course, but also mobility within (and among) social structures, which is exactly what migrants generally experience.<sup>3</sup>

I followed the classic strategy of autodriven PEI (Clark-Ibanez 2004; Meo 2010), and asked all participants to take some photographs around the city of Milan. I invited them for individual follow-up interviews in order to discuss their photographs. Yet, contrary to other researching using such a tool, I provided each respondent with *two* disposable cameras: one for his/her likes and the other for his/her dislikes. Accordingly, each of them was asked to take pictures of anything that they might find 'cool' or 'uncool' in their daily lives, every day for a two-week period. This cool/uncool request was only a pretext in order to let them be as free as possible without addressing their attention to anything in particular.

#### Cultural Sociology

From the 14 boys and 24 girls to whom I assigned the task, I eventually collected 24 'photo diaries' of 10 boys (from 17 to 20 years old) and 14 girls (from 18 to 21 years old), with a resulting set of 251 'cool' images and 169 'un-cool' images. A second round of interviews was then conducted with the group of 10 boys and 14 girls that had completed the task. This second interview was focused on the photos that they had produced, allowing them to elaborate on the specific meanings of their images as they interpreted them.

Finally, I conducted detailed observations both in their schools and homes, sharing and discussing several daily moments with them, in order to gain a more in-depth understanding of the social world that they inhabit. This took place after coding their answers to the first and second rounds of interviews.

The following section presents results, specifically bearing on how the participants coped with the everyday world of things, beyond their verbal accounts *about* the material culture, in order to grasp their possibly new ways *of looking at* materiality (Hurdley 2007; Datta 2012). As will be seen, the social narratives generated are quite different from those found in the conventional analysis of spoken representations, for two reasons.

First, this is due in my view to the "collaborative categorization" process made possible by such method (Harper 2002): in fact, PEI enables respondents to contribute to generating hypotheses (2002). At the beginning

of each interview, the entire set of pictures was displayed on a table and each participant was asked to group the photos into categories as they saw fit. They were then invited to talk about the pictures that they had selected. Thus, during the PEI, questions were not determined a priori but arose in response to the images they took.

Second, the technology of the camera is itself an integral part of this process (Ortega-Alcazar, Dyck 2011): in taking photos, participants produce *their* aesthetic, ethical and political choices about how they want to represent their cultural practices, instead of relying on academic categories like ethnicity or nationality. In doing so, they "destabilize the gaze of the disembodied and distanciated observer and replace it with that of the mobile migrant subject." (Datta 2012: 1728).

## Living in a (new) material world: acting and evaluating objects

In order to show how the *hysteresis* effect works as a dynamic and open system of interaction between immigrant *habitus* and the material setting, I draw on the work of Rinkinen et al. (2015), and their discussion of three co-existing modes of material engagement: *encountering* the material world, *acting* in a material constituted word, *evaluating* the material world.

Yet, as I worked with photos collected on the basis of the explicit request to evaluate the coolness/uncoolness of objects, I attuned the above typology on the basis of my research. Thus, on the one hand, encountering and

#### **Cultural Sociology**

evaluating were combined in the practice of photographing objects and it provided a first cluster of evidence. On the other hand, acting in a materially constituted world furnished a second, less expected, set of evidence.

## Encountering and evaluating objects: new elements of practices

According to the definition of consumption adopted here, that finds its logic not in the selection of items but in how people accomplish the tasks and practices that compose their daily lives (Warde 2014), it is worth starting with a very mundane practice such as "walking the city", as a way of "fabricating the city" (de Certeau 1984).

Within the field of 'cool' images collected by participants in their walking around the city, the most recurrent themes were food (Pic 1) and fashion (Pic 2). Both the homemade ice cream and the pairs of shoes portrayed below were photographed from behind shop windows. These pictures make clear the importance of the lived material space of the city (Datta 2012): that is, the mundane, ordinary and relevant space that these youngsters encountered as they walked around the city (de Certeau 1984).

Picture 1 here

Picture 2 here

The subjects' point of view also indicates some ease and comfort with such a particular display of commercial culture. Together with these images, in fact, many others considered to be 'cool' referred to shops, showcases or malls. Yet, on the other hand, the very same commercial culture was quite often selected in order to question its un-cool side. Some respondents took pictures that strongly represented the negative side of their everyday lives in a specific urban periphery, which they illustrated through a picture of *graffiti* on a wall (Pic 3); while on other occasions they explicitly condemned the commodity system for its dangerous potential effects, portraying, for example, a fur coats shop sign (Pic 4) as a stigmatized counterpart of commercial culture.

Picture 3 here

## Picture 4 here

When the author of Picture 3 saw her photo during the photo-elicitation interview, she recalled her first arrival in Italy, when she encountered a similar wall. Starting from this practical encounter, she became able to account, once again, for the difference of walking the city in Italy and in her home country. In fact, she could *learn what difference means by encountering and staring at this wall*.

Materials work here as *significant elements of practices* in daily life entangled in webs of moral judgments. When a new element shows up it

<sup>(...)</sup> I don't know... in our country? it simply doesn't happen... I mean... you don't see stuff like that... really, you don't... the first time I came here in Italy, I took the train from Malpensa [the airport]... and the very first thing I noticed was such writings on the walls... (L., girl, 19 yrs old, born in China, in Italy for 3 yrs, note to pic 3)

may activate judgments coming from dispositions built in the past, in a different environment, according to the *hysteresis* effect discussed above. In this way, even a mundane practice like walking the city sustains and reproduces specific understandings of what is cool or uncool, and how things should be done.

In fact, a close reading of the data shows how numerous contrasting meanings coming from different private and public spheres seem to affect material culture.

## Acting with objects: mobilizing and combining new elements

In regard to consumption practices, a particular mode of material engagement emerges in accounts of practical, ongoing and responsive problem-solving (Warde 2015). In the cases of young children of immigrants, indeed, materials appear to be very significant tools for the enactment of specific practices. Participants in the PEI suggested how objects are instruments that can be handled in variously effective ways.

For example, a set of participants pointed to the potential power of things as sorts of 'cultural bridges' (Douglas, Isherwood 1979) in the sense that objects support everyday practices without removing either their everyday Italian lives or their parents' home past.

It is worth focusing a little more on this idea of 'cultural bridges' in order to understand *its being generated by practices*. This is, in fact, the case of many objects photographed inside the respondents' homes in Italy: these objects, coming from specific cultural biographies (Appadurai 1986), eventually acquired a sort of double meaning or, more precisely, a 'hybrid' one (Canclini 1995; Tomlinson 1999).

We may consider one of them, observing what happens in the specific practice of 'giving and receiving a present':

Picture 5 here

The author of this photo described her experience as follows:

(...) well... this is my doll... it's a present my boyfriend gave to me... you know... because he lives in Sri-Lanka now ... but he gave me some presents when I go there... so, I took a picture of this doll because I always take her with me as a talisman in difficult situations.. you know.. in this way... *It's like taking him and my birth-place with me*...(D., girl, 22 yrs old, born in Sri-Lanka, in Italy for 2 yrs, note to pic 5)

Objects like this have been removed by respondents from the global circuit of commodities and then re-contextualized in order to evoke memories of their parents' home country and people still living there, or maybe very particular episodes of their past lives. What is interesting, however, is that such de-commodification (Kopytoff 1986) is *a practical work* itself that is possible only by repeatedly mobilizing the object during specific 'difficult' moments of disorientation until it becomes 'a talisman'.

#### **Cultural Sociology**

In challenging conditions like this, the object is specifically mobilised in order to serve as a 'bridge' – for this young girl, this means taking her home country relationships with her.

In such a particular interaction between embodied dispositions and material meanings the object becomes an *active agent* able to connect the past and the future, well exemplifying the *hysteresis* effect at work.

Another example supports this argument, from another point of view, in the case of the practice of 'shopping for a cake':

## Picture 6 here.

Material elements convey and preserve specific skills and practical forms of competence (Rinkinen et al. 2015). The case of the baked cake in the previous image supports this idea. The girl who took the picture explained her photo shoot as follows:

(...) it was at the end of my Italian course at school... there was a party... (...) and everybody was supposed to cook something Italian, you know... and initially... well... I didn't know what to do... I don't know Italian cuisine... so, I made this cake... I searched for and used Italian ingredients... but, well... actually... it's a recipe from my country!... (L., girl, 18 ys old, born in China, in Italy for 5 yrs note to Pic 6)

Once again, there is a practical task to solve on the basis of material equipment. While an object serves as a support to carry out a practice, the

thing is re-framed as a potential 'bridge' between two different social worlds through the practical co-dependency between embodied dispositions and the material apparatus available. The idea of objects as 'cultural bridges' is thus the outcome of a specific material engagement in the social practice.

Once again, the presence of different material elements ("I don't know Italian cuisine") inhibits the practical anticipation of the *habitus* (Bourdieu 1997) and, conversely, the consequent lag ("initially... I didn't know what to do...") makes room for creativity by mobilizing new elements ("a recipe from my country") without eliminating disorientation.

Thus, a shift in the material base of the mundane practice of shopping in order to bake a cake, allows a different reaction thanks to the lagging *habitus*. Finally, *the specific affordances of material elements intensify the hysteresis effect*, so that past and present dispositions conflate and may eventually generate a different practice.

## Learning to be (different) consumers: how to use a tool

As the previous examples help to show, the mismatch between a set of past dispositions as consumers and a new material setting is not necessarily equivalent to trouble and disorientation only. Instead, the shifting of material elements within consumption practices may often involve some level of creativity even alongside disorientation.

In order to exemplify the potential consequences of the modes of material engagement illustrated in the previous section, I now show a quite evocative photograph taken in the center of Milan by an 18-year-old Chinese girl within the field of her cool images<sup>4</sup>, as a particular case of the very common practice of shopping.

Picture 7 here.

Later, when I went back to interview her about her photos, she described her choice quite clearly:

"(...) I like sales... I mean... usually I buy stuff in China... because over there it all costs a lot less... so, when I decide to go back... I usually leave from here with some empty bags and then I come back with about 40 kilos of stuff... mostly clothes... and... I don't know... pens and stuff I may use at school, or even make-up... all the things I need, basically... in China it all costs really less than here... they are not of the same high quality as here but high quality usually costs too much... but when it comes to the sales... here in Italy... I found that I can get high quality stuff but with very low prices... so I go there... all the time" (L., girl, 18 yrs old, born in China, in Italy for 5 yrs, note to Pic 7)

Both the picture and the description seem to address a positive judgment about the commercial culture and its opportunities in choosing between quality and quantity, especially since this feature is framed as the most significant difference with the respondent's birth country. Nevertheless, at the beginning, she recounted her physical encounter with the 'sales' poster;

then she explained how that encounter led to a transformation of her habitual choice between quantity and quality. Hence, acting on a new basis of materiality led to a new chain of action, simply following the practical accomplishment of finding stuff for daily needs. Some links with the respondent's home country between humans and objects had been eroded, some new others had been created (Shove et al. 2012). In short, a new practical co-dependency was eventually established and a different distribution of agency between humans and materials was fixed. Thus, a potentially new consumption practice was in the making.

To take a step further in the argument, I cite the case of another participant who photographed herself in the practice of wearing the veil. In fact, there are situations where very particular clothes or sorts of apparel were chosen from the material world of respondents' parents. In such conditions, the main consumer acculturation explanation is often to interpret such practice as an endeavor to merge signs of belonging to the parents' culture with those taken from global youth fashion culture (Oswald 1999). However, as well shown by the following extract taken from the interview with an 18-year-old girl born in Egypt, there is something more involved.

I have worn my veil for a couple of years now, and it has been definitely my choice... to me it's natural, it's part of my sense of decency... and the expression of my religion too (...) Sometimes I think people may look askance at me, maybe they even think things like: "poor girl"... and so on... but *I continue with my choice*... they should understand that *this* 

#### Cultural Sociology

*is a choice of freedom for me*, not the opposite!... (S., 18 years old, born in Egypt, in Italy for 3 yr).

While the respondent defends the practice of wearing a material element considered to be new within the Western world of things, the emphasis is on her claim to be a subject capable of *a choice of freedom* – in a word, a 'consumer' (Trentman 2007; Sassatelli 2007). What is interesting, however, is that she indicates – as did many others respondents in this regard – the opportunity she found in the object to start learning to cope with an unfamiliar context ("people may look askance at me"). She dealt with the classic immigrant experience of disorientation and reorientation explicitly through her chance to engage with the veil, according to creative as much as practical modes of material engagement.

She continued to emphasize this point:

Many girls still don't even know that... but I do now... I mean.. you can choose between a lot of veils... *if you know how to use the tool*... there are those with solid colors, those in different colors, others with flowers or embroidery. Some of them have an ornament, some others have a knot on the right. You can use originality and imagination in the mixing and matching... eventually... covering your hair, rather than veiling your presence, it could make you feel better instead (S., 18 years old, born in Egypt, in Italy for 3 yr).

These narratives show that while the respondents' parents often continued to consider these clothes – like certain foodstuffs or other objects – as vehicles to manifest their native origins and their distance from the

Western arena of consumers, these teenagers used the selfsame objects to explore their habits, establishing new practical co-dependencies and eventually displaying new potential consumption practices.

Thus, through their lagging *habitus* the respondents found themselves needing to learn how to operate with such tools within the new field. At the same time, they learned what it means to be consumers, creatively engaging with objects, artifacts and infrastructures without eliminating, the troubles and disorientation linked to the experience of migration, as all the cases Re Ce above have shown.

## Conclusions

Although the Western commercial culture forces migrants and their children to place themselves socially within it, this never happens in a simply passive and neutral way (Sassatelli 2007; Brewer, Trentmann 2006). To investigate this issue, I drew on theories of social practices as they specifically deal with materiality in the field of consumption (Warde 2015; Shove et al. 2012), and I focused on the practical co-dependency between habitus and materials, rather than on individuals or national communities (Rinkinen et al. 2015). Thus, the analysis of the ways in which young migrants cope with material culture through the lenses of theories of social practice aimed to investigate the extent to which post-migration resettlement entails the transformation of the embodied capacities of migrants

#### **Cultural Sociology**

in the field of consumption, possibly leading to the fabrication of new abilities.

The empirical evidence presented supports the idea that for the youngsters studied it is never just a matter of being enchanted by brands as unique means of integration or, conversely, being completely untouched by commercial culture, being confined within their ethnic group, sharing common deprivations. As I tried to show when discussing the active role of objects as metaphorical 'cultural bridges', there is an underestimated yet pervasive *material* basis on which identification can count that works at least partially irrespective of national frames (Beck, Sznaider 2006).

Respondents seemed to mobilise understandings and skills from their past which enabled them to *creatively engage with materials as tools* and to eventually discover new ways of being a 'consumer'. Becoming a consumer, in fact, is far from being a linear process of constantly approaching a given standard of values or a struggle to capture a new sense of normality, as the mainstream consumer acculturation literature suggests on the basis of a strict and partially misleading revision of the homology thesis (Coulangeon and Lemel 2009; Brisson and Bianchi 2017). Rather, it seems to be *a practical process of learning by doing, actively addressed by materiality*, with all its contradictions and disorientation often remaining explicit (Warde 2015; Noble 2013).

As Bourdieu taught us, the basic mechanism accounting for the reproduction of social stratification in taste is dissociation from the necessary (Bourdieu 1984). Yet, people living in conditions of scarcity act according to the principle of conformity to necessity(1984). This has been proved in previous research (Blasius and Friederichs 2008) and I cannot reject the 'taste of necessity' thesis on the basis of my data. Accordingly, in the particular class fraction that I studied, constituted by the children of immigrants living in distressed neighborhoods in Milan, the members – due to their economic and educational restrictions – were unable to use their educational attainment to increase their economic capital (2008).

Nevertheless, as I have tried to show, if we look at their consumption practices through the lens of the theory of practice and particularly searching for the hysteresis effect (Bourdieu 2000; Strand and Lizardo 2017), it is not only possible to grasp the disorientation and constraints typical of being a consumer in a 'new world'; it is also possible to explore the creativity and the space of possibilities for such agents to construct a version of their own taste.

On learning to cope with new and different things, or learning to find a new place for old things, young children of immigrants realize day by day what it means to be a 'consumer' in the host country, concomitantly with the shifting of material elements of practice. In the practical process of becoming part of a new world of things, these 'new' consumers not only

#### **Cultural Sociology**

find a way to live in a new place, but also become more and more accustomed to such a practice of aligning and dealing with mismatches (Noble 2013).

In fact, because hysteresis occurs within environments that change at a rate different from the practical belief embodied in the social agent, it provokes a change in the relationship between *habitus* and social location (Strand and Lizardo 2017). Hence, within these particular occasions, it allows the social agent, to a certain extent, to free him/herself from the symbolic violence that, as a rule, operates synchronizing *habitus* and field, and in so doing it creates space for variousmodes of reflexivity, which in turn make the agent if not able to exit from the 'taste of necessity', at least able to reframe the very definition of what 'necessity' means.

Drawing on their ineradicable sense of disorientation, the participants in my research gradually *became* consumers in their daily experience, learning to engage with different materials, which in turn may become tools to fabricate new consumption practices.

1	
2	
3	
4	
5	
6	
7	
8	
9	
10	
11	
12	
13	
14	
15	
16	
17	
18 19	
20	
21	
22	
23	
24	
25	
26	
27	
28	
29	
30	
31	
32	
33 34	
34 35	
36	
37	
38	
39	
40	
41	
42	
43	
44	

http://mc.manuscriptcentral.com/culturalsociology

tor per period

# **Pictures**



Picture 1



Picture 3



Picture 2



Picture 4











Picture 7

## References

Appadurai A (1986) The Social Life of Things: Commodities in Cultural Perspective, Chicago: Univ. of Chicago Press.

Askegaard S, Arnould E J, Kjeldgaard D (2005) Postassimilationist Ethnic Consumer Research: Qualifications and Extensions, *Journal of Consumer Research* 32: 160-70.

Bauman Z (2007) Consuming life, Cambridge-Malden, MA: Polity Press.

Beck U, Sznaider N (2006) Unpacking cosmopolitanism for the social sciences: A research agenda, *British Journal of Sociology* 57 (1): 1-23

Bennett T, Emmison M and Frow J (1999) *Accounting for Tastes: Australian Everyday Cultures*, Cambridge University Press.

Bennett T, Savage M, Silva EB, Warde, A, Gayo-Cal M, Wright D (2009) *Culture, Class, Distinction*, London: Routledge.

Blasius J, Friedrichs J (2008) Lifestyles in distressed neighborhoods: A test of Bourdieu's "taste of necessity" hypothesis, *Poetics* 36: 24-44.

Bosisio R, Colombo E, Leonini L, Rebughini P (2009) Different but not stranger: Everyday Collective Identifications among Adolescent Children of Immigrants in Italy, *Journal of Ethnic and Migration Studies*, 35 (1): 37-59

Bourdieu P (1977) *Outline of the Theory of Practice*, Cambridge: Univ. Press.

Bourdieu P (1984) *Distinction. A Social Critique of the Judgment of Taste.* Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press.

## **Cultural Sociology**

1	
2	
3	
4 5	
5 6 7	Bourdieu P (1990) The logic of practice, Cambridge: Polity Press.
8	Bourdieu P (2000) Pascal Meditations, Cambridge : Polity Press.
10 11	Brewer J, Trentmann F (eds.) (2006) Consuming Cultures, Global
12 13	Perspectives: Historical Trajectories, Transnational Exchanges, Oxford and
14 15	New York: Berg.
16 17 18	Brisson R, Bianchi R (2017) Distinction at the Class-Fraction Level? A
19 20	Re-Examination of Bourdieu's Dataset, Journal of Consumer Culture, First
21 22	Published Online, September 21.
23 24	Canclini N G (1995) Hybrid Cultures : Strategies for Entering and
25 26	Leaving Modernity, Minneapolis: Univ. of Minnesota Press.
27 28 29	Chan TW, Goldthorpe GH (2007) Social Stratification and Cultural
30 31	Consumption: Music in England, <i>European Sociological Review</i> 23: 1-19.
32 33	Clark CD (1999) The autodriven interview: A photographic viewfinder
34 35	into children's experiences, Visual Sociology, 14:39-50
36 37 38	Clark-Ibanez M (2004) Framing the Social World With Photo-Elicitation
39 40	Interviews, American Behavioral Scientist, 47(12): 1507-27
41 42	Cook I (2008) The missing Child in Consumption Theory', Journal of
43 44	Consumer Culture, 8(2): 219-43.
45 46 47	Coulangeon P, Lemel Y (2009) The Homology
48 49	Thesis: Distinction Revisited, in: Robson K and Sanders C., Quantifying
50 51	Theory: Pierre Bourdieu, pp. 47-60
52 53 54	
55 56	
57 58	31
59 60	http://mc.manuscriptcentral.com/culturalsociology

Crossley N (2014) Comment on Loic Wacquant's "Homines in Extremis", *Body & Society*, 20(2): 106-12

Crul M, Vermeulen H (2003) The Second Generation in Europe, International Migration Review, 37(4): 965-86.

Daenekindt S, Roose H. (2017) Ways of preferring: Distinction through the 'what' and the 'how' of cultural consumption., *Journal of Consumer Culture*, 17(1): 25-45

Datta A (2012) 'Where is the global City?' Visual Narratives of London among East European Migrants, *Urban Studies*, 49(8):1725-40.

De Certeau M (1984) *The Practice of Everyday Life*, Berkeley: University of California Press.

XXX (2012)

Flemmen M, Jarness V, Rosenlund L, (2017) Social Space and Cultural Class Divisions: The Forms of Capital and Contemporary Lifestyle Differentiation, *British Journal of Sociology*, First Online in August 17.

Flyvbjerg B. (2006). Five Misunderstandings About Case-Study Research, *Qualitative Inquiry*, 12(2): 219-245.

Giddens A (1991) *Modernity and Self-Identity: Self and Society in the Late Modern Age.* Cambridge: Polity Press.

Hammersley M, Atkinson P (2007) *Ethnography: Principles in Practice*. London: Routledge.

# Cultural Sociology

2 3	
4 5	
6 7	Harper D (2002) Talking about pictures: a case for photo elicitation,
8 9	'Visual Studies', 17, n.1: 13-26
10 11	Harper D (2003) Framing Photographic Ethnography. A case study,
12 13	Ethnography, 4: 241-66.
14 15	Holt DB (1998) Does Cultural Capital Structure American
16 17 18	Consumption?, Journal of Consumer Research 25: 1-25.
19 20	Hurdley R (2007) Focal Points: framing material culture and visual data,
21 22	Qualitative Research, 7(3): 355-74.
23 24	Kerr R, Robinson S (2009) The hysteresis effect as creative adaptation of
25 26	the habitus: dissent and transition to the 'corporate' in post-Soviet Ukraine,
27 28	Organization, 16(6): 829-53.
29 30	King A (2000) Thinking with Bourdieu against Bourdieu: a "practical"
31 32 33	critique of the habitus, Sociological Theory 18(3): 417-33.
34 35	Kopytoff I (1986) The Cultural biography of things: commoditization as
36 37	process, in: Appadurai, A. The Social Life of Things: Commodities in
38 39	Cultural Perspective, Cambridge: Cambridge Univ. Press.
40 41	Lamont M (1992) Money, Morals and Manners: The Culture of the
42 43	French and American Upper-Middle Class. Chicago: University of Chicago
44 45	Press.
46 47 48	Lizardo O (2008) The question of culture consumption and stratification
49 50	revisited, Sociologica: Italian Online Sociological Review, 2, 1–32
51 52 53	
54	
55	
56 57	33
58	
59	

Lizardo O, Skiles S (2012) Reconceptualizing and theorizing "omnivorousness" genetic and relational mechanisms, *Sociological Theory*, 30(4): 263–282.

Strand M, Lizardo O (2017) The Hysteresis Effect: Theorizing Mismatch in Action, *Journal for the Theory of Social Behaviour*, 47: 164–194.

Luedicke MK (2011). Consumer acculturation theory: (crossing) conceptual boundaries, *Consumption Markets and Culture*, 14(3): 223-244.

Mason P (2005) Visual data in applied qualitative research: lessons from experience, *Qualitative research*, 3: 325-46.

Massey D, Sanchez M (2007) Latino and America Identities as Perceived, *Qualitative sociology*, 30(1):81-107.

Meo AI (2010) 'Picturing Students' Habitus. The advantage and Limitations of Photo-Elicitation Interviewing in a Qualitative Study in the City of Buenos Aires, *International Institute for Qualitative Methodology*, 9 (2):149-70

Miller D (1998) Material Cultures: Why Some Things Matters, London: UCL Press.

Ollivier M (2004) Towards A Structural Theory Of Status Inequality: Structures And Rents In Popular Music And Tastes, *Research In Social Stratification And Mobility* 21: 187-213.

#### **Cultural Sociology**

Ogden DT, Ogden JR, Schau HJ (2004) Exploring the impact of culture and acculturation on consumer purchase decisions: toward a microcultural perspective, *Academy of Marketing Science Review*, 3: 1-22.

Ortega-Alcazar I, Dyck I (2011) Migrant narratives of health and wellbeing: Challenging ''othering' processes through photo-elicitation interviews, *Critical Social Policy*, 32(1):106-25

Oswald LR (1999) Culture Swapping: Consumption and the Ethnogenesis of Middle-Class Haitian Immigrants, *Journal of Consumer Research*, 25: 303-18.

Peterson RA, Simkus A (1993) How Musical Tastes Mark Occupational Status Groups, in: Lamont M and Fournier M, *Cultivating Differences: Symbolic Boundaries and the Making of Inequality*, Chicago: University of Chicago Press, pp. 152-186.

Pink S (2006) Doing Visual Ethnography. London: Sage.

Portes A, Rumbaut RG (2005) Introduction: The Second Generation and the Children of Immigrants Longitudinal Study, *Ethnic and Racial Studies* 28(6): 983-999.

Preda A (1999) The Turn to Things: Arguments for a Sociological Theory of Things, *The Sociological Quarterly*, 40(2), 347-66.

Reckwitz A (2002a) The status of the 'material' in theories of culture: From 'social structure' to 'artifacts', *Journal for the Theory of Social Behaviour* 32(2): 195–211. Reckwitz A (2002b) Toward a theory of social practices: A development in culturalist theorizing, European Journal of Social Theory 5(2): 243-63. Rinkinen J, Jalas M, Shove E (2015) Objects Relations in Accounts of Everyday Life, Sociology, 49(5), 870-85 Rose G (2001) Visual Methodologies. London: Sage. Sahakian M, Whilite H (2014) Making practice theory practicable: Towards more sustainable forms of consumption, Journal of Consumer *Culture*, 14(1), 25-44 Sassatelli R (2007) Consumer Culture. History, Theory, Politics. London: Sage. Sewell WH Jr (1992) A theory of structure: duality, agency, and transformation, American Journal of Sociology 98(1): 1–29. Shove E, Pantzar M, Watson M (2012) The Dynamics of Social Practice. London: Sage. Tomlinson J (1999) Globalization and Culture. Cambridge: Polity Press Trentmann F (2007) Citizenship and consumption, Journal of Consumer Culture, 7: 147-58. Tribalat M (1995) Faire France: une enquête sur les immigrés et leurs enfants. Paris: La découverte. Üstüner T, Holt DB (2007) Dominated Consumer Acculturation: The Social Construction of Poor Migrant Women's Consumer Identity Projects in a Turkish Squatter, Journal of Consumer Research 34 (1): 41-56. 

## **Cultural Sociology**

Wakiuru Wamwara-Mbugua L, Cornwell TB, Boller G (2008) Triple Acculturation: The Role of African Americans in the Consumer Acculturation of Kenyan Immigrants, *Journal of Business Research* 61(2): 83-90.

Warde A (2014) After taste: culture, consumption and the theory of practice, *Journal of Consumer Culture*. 14(3): 279–303.

Warde A (2015) The Sociology of Consumption: Its Recent Development, *Annual Review of Sociology*, 41: 117-134.

## Notes

<sup>1</sup> The so-called "segmented assimilation theory" (Portes and Rumbaut 2005) is basically a socio-economic driven perspective to measure in what point of the social scale migrants happen to be situated in a given host country. For critiques of this theory, see Tribalat (1995) and Bosisio *et al* (2009).

<sup>2</sup> This is part of a broader research project titled "*Border commercial culture: familiar networks and second generation young immigrants between consumption and solidarity*" within which we collected 73 in-depth interviews conducted with 40 young children of immigrants (15-23 years old) of different national origins and 33 members of their families. <sup>3</sup> I would like to thank one of the reviewers for this observation.

<sup>4</sup> The Italian word "Saldi" in the picture stands for "sales".