Health care citizenship for all?

Theoretical puzzles between universalism and sustainability

by Nicola Pasini

Facts beyond Figures. Communi-Care for Migrants

European Public Health Association - EUPHA & CERGAS and Carlo F. Dondena, Università Bocconi

4th Conference on Migrant and Ethnic Minority Health in Europe

UNIVERSITA’ BOCCONI, MILANO 21-23 June 2012

Thursday, June 21, 2012
Ismu-INMP research: some open questions

- Right to health care for irregular immigrants (i.e., vulnerable subjects)

- (Social) citizenship in liberal-democratic regimes: polity and the nation-state (citizens vs. foreigners). Which borders? Who decides?

- **HEALTH** = primary and universal good. Which public claim? Which ownership?

- Universalism (human rights) vs. Selectivity (priority, choice)
Research context and aims

- **PART ONE**: Conceptual framework (social and political theories); international (Europe and USA) and comparative (comparison among countries) frame

- **PART TWO**: The Italian case: sub-national cases (six regions: Lombardia, Friuli Venezia Giulia, Emilia Romagna, Lazio, Puglia, Sicilia)

- Principles and models of solidarity and welfare policies. Which welfare? Which citizenship? And for whom?

- Comparison, multi-level analysis between *government* and *governance*: ascendant and descendant phase

- Decision-making process analysis and *policy network*: institutional and not institutional actors
Multi-level analysis

GLOBAL POLICIES

UE social model: which reforms?

MESO LEVEL (REGIONS)

Institutional and not Institutional conference, Pressure group, University, Research centers, Third Sector

EUROPE STATE REGIONS LOCAL AUTHORITIES

Health policy orientations for irregular immigrants

DECISION-MAKING PROCESS

ASL, AO, Offices

NATIONAL LEVEL

OECD WHO
Theoretical perspective

- Concurrent rights, weak borders, evolving social and institutional models (Keating, 2009)

- (Irregular) immigrants: do rights exist despite of territorial borders? Debate on *jus soli* vs. *jus sanguinis*

- Is the right to health care worthy to be recognized as universal (*Fundamental Rights Agency*- FRA)?

- Failure of the project of *international health care cooperation* as mentioned at Alma Ata in 1978 by WHO: *Targets for Health for All*?

- Human rights, health citizenship and national sovereignty (erosion of power towards sub-national and supra-national levels): which welfare?

- «New» cultural, political, and social context among civil cohabitation, social cohesion and collective well-being
Differentiated welfare, multiculturalism, health care citizenship

- New cultural context: a multiethnic and multicultural society implies a redefinition of citizenship in a heterogeneous way?

- Evolution of citizenship right constantly negotiated and debated. Particular demands along with differentiated (and not standard) answers: a more expensive welfare!?

- New interpretative and cultural model of concepts like medicine, health and illness

- New challenges to the traditional social citizenship: demands of health care by irregular immigrants vs. demands of health care by polity members (Nation-state). Problems of consent and legitimacy
Welfare crisis between (un)conditioned universalism and tendencies

- Rights to health care for irregular immigrants vs. reforms and recalibration of national social security systems (less resources for citizens)

- Western democracy welfare systems: crisis of universal access to various health care services. A less generous welfare

- Redefinition of distributional criteria and resource allocation: who and what has to be cared? Principle of sustainability

- A greater autonomy for individual and collective, public and private, associated or not associated actors: from welfare state towards a welfare society or community (big society?) Vertical and horizontal subsidiarity

- Welfare pluralism: a stronger flexibility and adaptation to new
**Immigration and welfare: debate and tendencies**

- Scenario: supply of social services through a more selective approach


- (Negative and positive) correlation between weakening of the welfare state and presence of ethnic minorities?

- Can a more generous welfare state cohabit with a heterogeneous society from a cultural and ethnic point of view? Does exist an empirical evidence between a stronger immigration and a weaker welfare state performance?

- **MULTICULTURALISM policies**: an approach more flexible to diversity and more compliant of human rights? Is this sustainable?

- Which mediation between the universal principle of democratic citizenship and cultural specificities of a plural society?
**Which citizenship?**

- **Polity:** pattern of cooperation and conflict between members (equal rights and duties: citizenship equality)

- **Nation-state puzzle:** hosting only those people belonging to its nation (sense of nationality)

- **Contemporary democracies:** intersection between citizenship and nationality concepts (cultural dimension: historical and religious roots, customs). Where multiethnic population are present, there are strong tensions between citizenship and nationality (no harmony)

- **Supra-national level:** is the principle of solidarity able to extend to immigrants (to irregulars as well) universal rights like the health care?

- **Empirical analysis:** access to irregular immigrants is not granted (adverse economic and historical contingency)