

1
2 **Interventions combining species, habitat and genetic information**
3 **reverse a downward trend in threatened peripheral amphibian**
4 **(*Triturus cristatus*) populations**

5
6 **David O'Brien^{1,2}, J.E. Hall², A. Miró³, K. O'Brien³, M. Falaschi⁴ & R. Jehle¹**

7 1. University of Salford, School of Science, Engineering and Environment, Salford M5 4WT,
8 UK.

9 2. Scottish Natural Heritage, Great Glen House, Leachkin Road, Inverness IV3 8NW, UK.

10 3. Highland Amphibian and Reptile Project, c/o Woodlands, Brae of Kinkell, Dingwall, IV7
11 8HZ, UK

12 4. University of Milan, Department of Environmental Science and Policy, Via Celoria 26,
13 20133 Milan, Italy.

14 Corresponding author: david.obrien@nature.scot

15 **Author contributions**

16 DOB, JH, AM and RJ conceived the ideas and designed methodology; field work including
17 data collection was carried out by DOB, JH, AM and KOB; DOB led on project management;
18 AM, MF and DOB analysed the data; DOB and JH led the writing of the manuscript. All
19 authors contributed critically to the drafts and gave final approval for publication

20 **Abstract**

21 Conserving genetic diversity in wild species is vital for preserving adaptations to local
22 environmental conditions. We conducted a habitat creation project for a flagship European
23 Protected Species of amphibian (northern great crested newt *Triturus cristatus*) at its north-
24 western range edge in the Scottish Highlands, combining existing knowledge about the
25 species' local habitat requirements and the genetic structure of existing populations.
26 Reconciled by a spatial connectivity model, we determined the best locations for the
27 creation or restoration of 25 ponds to facilitate their natural colonisation, and to reconnect
28 areas with similar genetic makeup whilst preserving differences between populations
29 belonging to separate genetic clusters. A dynamic occupancy model based on data derived
30 from standardised surveys revealed that both detection and occupancy probabilities strongly
31 depended on habitat features known to be locally favourable for *T. cristatus*. At least 12 of
32 the 25 new ponds were colonised within six years, representing a 26% increase in number

33 of breeding ponds in the region and offsetting a gradual decline in number of pre-existing
34 breeding sites recorded over the last 3 decades. Combining genetic evidence, spatial
35 modelling and historical knowledge with local stakeholder engagement led to a habitat
36 creation and management scheme that has met its immediate and evidence-based
37 conservation goals in a way which is transferable to a range of different systems.

38 **Keywords**

39 genetic diversity; pond creation; range edge; connectivity map; evidence-based
40 conservation; dynamic occupancy model

41

42 **1. Introduction**

43 Recent global (Díaz et al., 2019a; b) and continental-level (European Environment Agency,
44 2019b) reports have re-iterated the unprecedented current pressures on biodiversity. Whilst
45 no groups are immune to such pressures, amphibians are the most severely impacted
46 vertebrate taxon and, after cycads, the second most threatened major taxon assessed by
47 the IUCN (Díaz et al., 2019a; Hoffmann et al., 2010). Changes in land use, particularly
48 habitat loss and degradation, have long been proposed as major factors in amphibian
49 decline (e.g. Cooke and Ferguson, 1976; Cushman, 2006). Their limited powers of
50 dispersal and, in many cases, reliance on focal breeding sites, makes them particularly
51 vulnerable to isolation, leading to genetic problems such as inbreeding and loss of diversity
52 through drift (Allentoft and O'Brien, 2010).

53

54 The Convention on Biological Diversity recognises three strands to biodiversity: species,
55 ecosystems and genetic variation (CBD, 1992). However, although genetic variation is
56 crucial to ensuring that species can adapt to environmental changes, it is rarely explicitly
57 incorporated as an evidence base into practical *in situ* conservation measures (Hoban et
58 al., 2020; Pérez-Espona and ConGRESS Consortium, 2017). A formal way of bringing
59 together these three strands of biodiversity is the establishment of Gene Conservation

60 Units (GCUs), which are areas managed to allow adaptation to environmental change
61 through natural selection on the standing levels of local genetic variation (de Vries et al.,
62 2015; Minter et al., 2021).

63

64 Within Europe, the northern great crested newt *Triturus cristatus*, a pond-breeding
65 amphibian, has been designated a conservation priority, with heavy investment in
66 conservation and research (Jehle et al., 2011). Population persistence of *T. cristatus* is
67 associated with connectivity of demes (Halley et al., 1996; Griffiths et al., 2010; Griffiths
68 and Williams, 2000), and the genetic structure of local populations is determined by the
69 terrestrial habitats surrounding ponds (Cox et al., 2021).

70

71 Separated from the main British distribution by about 70 km, the Scottish Highlands has the
72 most northerly *T. cristatus* populations within the British Isles, whose native status has only
73 been clearly established in the last six years (O'Brien and Hall, 2012; O'Brien et al., 2015).

74 Local habitat preferences differ considerably from the species' core distribution, being
75 similar to those in Norway (Skei et al., 2006), even though a range of habitat types
76 favoured elsewhere, such as broadleaved woodland, are present within its Highland range
77 (Miró et al., 2017). Using information derived from polymorphic microsatellite markers,
78 O'Brien et al. (2015) described four genetic clusters within the Highlands, separated from
79 each other by intervening unfavourable habitats such as fast-flowing rivers or acidic
80 heathland. While ponds within clusters were characterised by low levels of genetic
81 differentiation between them, they were also separated from each other by geographic
82 distances exceeding known *T. cristatus* movement abilities (about 1.5 km, e.g. Haubreck &
83 Altrichter, 2016). This observation is consistent with pond loss due to changes in
84 agricultural practice during the 20th century (see also O'Brien and Hall, 2012), and suggests
85 the potential for strengthening local metapopulations by the creation of additional breeding
86 habitats.

87

88 In this paper we report on an evidence-based conservation intervention project to enhance
89 the available breeding habitat for *T. cristatus* fringe populations in the Scottish Highlands.
90 The main aims are to (i) reconnect *T. cristatus* populations of similar genetic structure
91 (those belonging to the same cluster but separated by 20th century loss of ponds) by
92 creating new ponds in areas with favourable habitat, (ii) preserve genetic distinctiveness of
93 local genetic clusters as reflected in natural barriers to gene flow, and (iii) enhance
94 populations which were considered to be most at risk of future population extinction due to
95 environmental deterioration, stochastic processes due to small population sizes or genetic
96 erosion. In order to achieve this, we evaluated the location of new habitats using a
97 landscape connectivity map, and quantified the pond-specific occurrence of *T. cristatus*
98 using a dynamic occupancy model based on targeted surveys. The paper builds upon
99 existing descriptions of colonisation of the newly created habitats by local amphibian
100 communities in conjunction with local stakeholder involvement (O'Brien et al., 2021), and
101 should form a useful case example for the conservation of isolated metapopulations of
102 threatened taxa.

103

104 **2. Methods**

105

106 **2.1 Study area**

107 The study area is situated within the Scottish Highlands (UK) adjacent to the Moray Firth
108 and Aviemore (Figure 1). This area has a relatively mild climate for its latitude (McClatchey
109 et al., 2014), and encompasses all native *T. cristatus* populations in the Scottish Highlands
110 (O'Brien et al., 2015). The present study considers 120 ponds, comprising all 46 ponds
111 where *T. cristatus* is known to have occurred since 1990, 49 control ponds without known
112 *T. cristatus* occurrence, and 25 intervention ponds (consisting of 20 new and 5 restored
113 ponds). Control ponds were selected within the same 10 x 10 km² grid as the known *T.*
114 *cristatus* ponds (4°35'-3°35'W, 57°38'-57°11'N) using a random number generator (Miró et
115 al., 2017; O'Brien et al., 2017). Ponds ranged from 4 - 168,000 m² and included those with

116 and without fish. For the present work, we use the term 'metapopulations' to refer to groups
117 of ponds which allow colonisation by immigrants from other ponds within the same
118 metapopulation (Brown and Kodric-Brown, 1977; Hanski, 1998).

119

120 **2.2 Survey and habitat intervention**

121 As a foundation for this study, we built a database of yearly *T. cristatus* detection/non-
122 detection/no survey (1/0/NA) events over 11 sampling years from 2010 to 2020 (Pollock,
123 1982). Surveys were carried out following the protocol used for the National Amphibian and
124 Reptile Recording Scheme (NARRS, Wilkinson and Arnell, 2013), a UK-wide citizen
125 science survey programme for widespread species. In brief, surveys are carried out during
126 the breeding season (April to June in Highland Scotland) using four methods (daytime egg
127 searching and netting, night-time torching (flash-lighting) and trapping). Up to three visits
128 are made per year, but survey ceases once presence is established or if the pond has fully
129 dried up. The Covid-19 pandemic meant that survey effort in 2020 was limited to ponds
130 within permitted distances from the authors' homes.

131

132 Conservation interventions took two forms: remedial management of three ponds with
133 existing populations, and the creation or re-creation of 25 ponds across three of the known
134 population clusters (Contin/Strathpeffer, Black Isle and Forres, see Figure 1). The remedial
135 management was carried out between 2012 and 2014 by a combination of volunteers and
136 government agency staff, and involved removing colonising willow *Salix spp*, deepening
137 sections to reduce desiccation risk, or temporary draining to extirpate non-native European
138 perch *Perca fluviatilis*. Pond (re)creation work was carried out in Autumn-Winter 2014-15 for
139 24 ponds, and during Winter 2017-18 for one additional pond (Table A1 in the Appendix).

140

141 A first pond creation scheme was carried out at two wooded sites within the Contin/
142 Strathpeffer pond cluster (Figure 1), managed by Forestry and Land Scotland (the

143 government agency responsible for managing Scotland's national forest estate). We
144 surveyed the woodland for potential pond sites, focusing on damp areas without
145 established trees, and with flora suggestive of less acidic conditions (e.g. with *Eriophorum*
146 *latifolium* and *Juncus spp*, but lacking *Narthecium ossifragum* and *Trichophorum*
147 *germanicum*). We created eleven ponds and recreated two previously existing ponds. All
148 ponds were adjacent to mixed *Pinus sylvestris* – *Betula* woodland (EUNIS category G4.4,
149 European Environment Agency, 2019a), and on humus-rich iron podsols or brown earths.

150

151 A second scheme was carried out in partnership with local farmers and a golf club (O'Brien
152 et al., 2021). This led to the creation of one new pond at Forres golf course, and a network
153 of 11 ponds (including re-creation of three old ponds) in farmland on the Black Isle in winter
154 2014-2015 (Figure 1). Eight of these ponds were adjacent to mixed *Pinus sylvestris* –
155 *Betula* woodland, and the remainder, including the golf course, were close to other suitable
156 habitat according to Miró et al. (2017). The golf course and seven of the farmland ponds
157 were on humus-rich iron podsols, the others on non-calcareous gleys.

158

159 Ponds were generally designed and constructed according to *T. cristatus* local habitat
160 preferences, such as slightly sloping banks, high terrestrial habitat diversity and presence
161 of adjacent mixed woodland (following Miró et al., 2017, see also Table 1). All excavation
162 work was carried out using 13t excavator on low pressure treads as recommended in
163 McKinnell et al. (2015). Ponds were profiled to give shallow margins, likely to warm quickly
164 in spring and offer easy egress for metamorphs, with $\leq 1.5\text{m}$ deep sections to reduce
165 desiccation risk and to provide ice-free over-wintering sites for *T. cristatus* and other
166 amphibians which may hibernate in ponds (*Rana temporaria*, *Lissotriton helveticus*).

167

168 **2.3 Connectivity mapping**

169 To assess the location of our intervention ponds in view of their function as stepping
170 stones, we first created a suitability map with the software Maxent, using occupied ponds
171 as presence localities (following Phillips et al., 2006). Three ponds near Aviemore were
172 excluded, as they belonged to a cluster which was not part of the intervention scheme, and
173 which is separated from the remaining ponds by unfavourable habitat and a distance by far
174 exceeding the species' known dispersal range. Landscape variables were retrieved from
175 the EUNIS land cover map of Scotland (SEWeb, 2014), with the initial 56 habitat categories
176 reclassified into ten biologically relevant variables as described in Table A4. Among these
177 variables, we considered 7 categories for the analyses: 1) constructed areas with high
178 density, 2) constructed areas with low density 3) cultivated areas, 4) woodlands, 5)
179 grasslands, 6) heathlands, 7) mires, bogs and fens. These broad categories do not include
180 for example pond features, and thus may over-estimate suitability. Because the importance
181 of terrestrial habitat surrounding *T. cristatus* breeding ponds decreases with distance (Cox
182 et al., 2021) and based on commonly documented migration distances (Baker and Halliday,
183 1999; Kupfer and Kneitz, 2000; Jehle et al., 2011), we calculated the percentage cover of
184 each variable at a radius of 400 m around each pond. In a second step, the seven variables
185 were aggregated from the initial resolution of 10 × 10 m to a resolution of 100 × 100 m. To
186 assess relationships between species occurrence and environmental variables with
187 Maxent, we considered linear and quadratic terms, using 10,000 pseudo-absences or
188 background points which were randomly selected from the study area.

189

190 In order to assess the fit of the suitability model we performed cross-fold validation, splitting
191 the dataset into five parts and using one at a time for model testing and four parts for model
192 training (Merow et al., 2013); the average cross-validated value of area under the receiver
193 operating curve was 0.871. We then averaged the five Maxent models and projected them
194 on the environmental layers to obtain a suitability map. To obtain a conductivity map, we
195 further rescaled the suitability map between zero and 1,000 and set lakes and marine

196 coastal habitats as not permeable. This map was used to run a connectivity model with
197 Circuitscape 4.0 (<https://circuitscape.org/>). Circuitscape was run in pairwise mode, and the
198 cells where the 43 occupied ponds are located were used as sources to identify possible
199 habitat corridors (McRae et al., 2008).

200

201 **2.4 Dynamic occupancy model**

202 To understand occupancy and colonisation, we used dynamic (or multi-season) occupancy
203 models (MacKenzie et al., 2003), which allow one to relate environmental covariates to
204 metapopulation parameters and account for imperfect detection (e.g. Fardell et al., 2018;
205 Haggerty et al., 2019; Vanek et al., 2019; Villena et al., 2016; Guillera-Arroita, 2017). We
206 considered first season occupancy probability (ψ), pond colonization probability (γ),
207 probability of extinction from pond (ϵ), and species detection probability (ρ). The model is
208 able to deal with gaps from incomplete surveys, such as those resulting from restrictions
209 during the Covid-19 outbreak in 2020. Following Burnham and Anderson (2004), we
210 incorporated twelve habitat variables of biological relevance (Miró et al., 2017) to fit model
211 parameter estimates and to assess the effect of conservation interventions on *T. cristatus*
212 metapopulation parameters across the study period (see Table 1).

213

214 To implement the model, we generated the year-specific binary factor “intervention pond
215 yes/no” (Table A1 in the Appendix). Each constructed pond was coded as “NA” before the
216 construction year, and as “yes” from its construction onwards. Each restored pond was
217 coded as “no” before the restoration year and as “yes” from its restoration onwards. The
218 ponds not involved in restoration works were coded as “no” across the entire study period.
219 We then added eight site-specific habitat characteristics that had been shown to be the
220 most important for *T. cristatus* occurrence in the Scottish Highlands in a previous study
221 (Miró et al., 2017): adjacent mixed woodland, organic mud pond substrate, frequency of
222 desiccation (defined by surveyor after discussion with land manager), terrestrial habitat
223 richness, fish presence (a negative factor), aquatic vegetation pond coverage, slightly

224 sloping bank pond proportion, and macroinvertebrate richness (see also Table 1). Habitat
225 characteristics were surveyed during the 2014 breeding season for the occupied and
226 control ponds (Miró et al., 2017), while intervention ponds were surveyed during 2016 and
227 2019 breeding seasons specifically for this study. For factors which change over time, we
228 used the value of the survey results for the year in which *T. cristatus* was first recorded.
229 Additionally, to investigate the role of connectivity, we generated the site-specific covariate
230 “nearest pond occupied in 2010” by computing the linear distance of each pond to the
231 nearest pond occupied by *T. cristatus* in the initial breeding season of the study period
232 (2010). Linear distance was obtained from a GIS using 1:25 000 maps from the British
233 mapping agency Ordnance Survey. Finally, to assess the existence of temporal patterns
234 across the study period, we generated one yearly categorical and one numeric variable
235 determined by the year of origin of the response data within the study period from 2010 to
236 2020 (Table 1). Whilst all intervening ponds were surveyed for *T. cristatus*, the possibility of
237 negatives cannot be discounted and the species might occur in some ponds where it was
238 classed as absent (see also Griffiths et al., 2015).

239

240 We identified the best dynamic occupancy model by fitting a set of candidate models,
241 adding covariates to the single parameter regressions shown in Table 1 (backward
242 selection) and retaining the covariates which decreased the model Akaike Information
243 Criterion estimator AICc corrected for small sample sizes (Akaike, 1974; Burnham and
244 Anderson, 2004). Model parameters were fitted in the order detection probability (ρ), initial
245 occupancy probability (ψ), colonization probability (γ), and extinction probability (ϵ).
246 Candidate models were ranked in ascending AICc order (Table A2). Then, we computed
247 model back-transformed coefficient estimates for the covariates from the top candidate
248 model with $\Delta\text{AICc} < 2$ (Burnham and Anderson, 2004). We illustrated the strength and
249 direction of covariate effects by drawing the predicted relationship of each selected
250 covariate along its range with the modelled parameters (Fiske and Chandler, 2011).

251

252 Dynamic occupancy models were fitted in *R* (*R* Core Team, 2018) using the function *colext*
253 and complementary functions in the package *unmarked* (Fiske and Chandler, 2011).

254 Numerical covariates were standardized to zero mean and unit variance to correct their
255 heterogeneous dimensions and to avoid algorithm optimization problems (Gelman and Hill,
256 2007). We also examined the covariates dataset for linear dependencies by computing
257 Variance Inflation Factors (VIF), which were <1.5 in all cases (well below 3 to 5, the
258 threshold indicative of worrisome collinearity for regressions, Zuur et al., 2009). Finally, we
259 assessed goodness-of-fit of the top model by computing the sum of squared estimate
260 errors (SSE), Chi-square, and Freeman-Tukey statistics based on 5000 parametric
261 bootstraps (following MacKenzie and Bailey, 2004; Fiske and Chandler, 2011).

262

263 **2.5 Occupancy trend**

264 We computed the derived yearly occupancy probability from 2010 to 2020 from the
265 modelled estimates of initial occupancy probability (ψ), pond colonization probability (γ) and
266 pond extinction probability (ϵ) following MacKenzie et al. (2003). Since we had surveyed a
267 proportion of the occupied ponds each year across the study period, we used derived
268 yearly occupancy estimates from the proportion of the sampled ponds that are occupied
269 (smoother estimates; Weir et al., 2009) and computed standard errors based on 1,000 non-
270 parametric bootstraps. We tested the effect of conservation interventions on the number of
271 populations by computing analyses of covariance (ANCOVA) on the yearly derived
272 occupancy as response variable against Year (from 2010 to 2020) as numeric independent
273 variable, and period of time before (2010-2014)/after (2015-2020) interventions as factor.
274 We included the interaction term Year:Period before/after to test if the trend in numbers of
275 populations (i.e. Year slope) showed differences between both periods.

276

277 **3. Results**

278 **3.1. Survey and habitat intervention**

279 In the three ponds subject to remedial management, adult populations in one case returned
280 to around former levels (increasing from 'Low' to 'Good' using the criteria of JNCC 1989). In
281 the other two ponds, numbers of adults seemingly remained stable; it is likely that larval
282 survivorship improved, but both are part of well-connected metapopulations and we have
283 not attempted to disentangle their population dynamics.

284

285 *Triturus cristatus* had colonised 12 of the 25 newly created or recreated ponds by 2020 (i.e.
286 within six years of creation), with one pond (B8) colonised in the first breeding season after
287 construction. In total, we observed 368 *T. cristatus* detection events, 2810 non-detection
288 events, and 782 NAs, based on up to three site surveys in a given year. *T. cristatus* largely
289 colonised new sites close to existing breeding ponds most rapidly. The observed
290 colonisation distances were 219 – 592m from pre-existing ponds, with one exceptional
291 pond 1,840 m from the nearest known putative source population. By 2020, intervention
292 ponds made up one quarter of *T. cristatus* breeding sites in the Highlands. One of the
293 intervention ponds now holds one of the largest breeding populations of *T. cristatus* in our
294 study area (G02, Appendix Table A1), with no detectable drop in population numbers at the
295 putative source pond. Engagement with land managers has also led to an increase in the
296 number of ponds in sites with conservation plans agreed with the owner (from eight in 2014
297 to 21 in 2020, O'Brien et al., 2021), and those where the owner has agreed to manage the
298 land sympathetically in a less formal manner (from four to five).

299

300 **3.2 Connectivity mapping**

301 The connectivity map derived through the Maxent model (Figure 2) is broadly in line with
302 the genetic clusters found in O'Brien et al. (2015). Connectivity within clusters is high,
303 decreasing with increasing distance from them. One exception is that the map suggests

304 high habitat connectivity between the genetically rather isolated Black Isle and West
305 Inverness populations. It also suggests low connectivity within the putative East Inverness
306 populations, as well as low between Forres and the adjacent populations.

307

308 **3.3 Dynamic occupancy model**

309 The model selection procedure showed support for a single top model ($\Delta AICc < 2$; Table A2
310 in the Appendix). It suggested that the *T. cristatus* detection probability (ρ) ranged from
311 0.28 to 0.48, increasing with aquatic vegetation coverage and decreasing with fish
312 presence compared to fish absence (means of 0.28 and 0.38 respectively; Table 2; Figure
313 3). Initial occupancy probability (ψ) increased with adjacent mixed wood coverage (0.20 to
314 0.86), organic mud pond substrate (0.17 to 0.64) and terrestrial habitat richness (0.04 to
315 0.94), and decreased with the frequency of desiccation (0.02 to 0.45), the distance to the
316 nearest occupied pond (0.05 to 0.42), and the absence rather than presence of fish (mean
317 0.38 and 0.22 respectively; Table 2; Figure A2 in the Appendix). Pond colonization
318 probability (γ) decreased with distance to the nearest occupied pond (0.00 to 0.99, being
319 >0.5 for distances $<470m$), and increased with conservation intervention (mean 0.23 and
320 0.00 respectively; Table 2; Figure 3). No covariates were retained for pond extinction
321 probability (ϵ). The bootstrap p-values based on the SSE, Chi-square and Freeman-Tukey
322 statistics were 0.89, 0.82 and 0.64 for the best model (fm15), respectively, suggesting that
323 it provided an adequate fit to the data (Figure A3 in the Appendix). Due to the small number
324 of recreated ponds ($n=5$), it was not possible to make a meaningful comparison between
325 them and those constructed from new.

326

327 **3.4 Occupancy trend**

328 The estimated number of occupied ponds yielded by the dynamic occupancy model was 42
329 in 2010, decreasing slightly to 40 in 2015 before increasing to 49 in 2020 (Figure 4 and
330 Table A3 in the Appendix). The period before interventions (2010-2014) showed a negative

331 trend (Year slope of $-0.41 \pm \text{SE } 0.08$, $P= 0.013$; Figure 4), while the period after
332 interventions (2015-2020) showed a positive trend (Year slope of $1.46 \pm \text{SE } 0.23$, $P= 0.003$;
333 Figure 4 and Table 3). The ANCOVA (3 on 7 DF, $P < 0.001$) supported differences between
334 the periods before and after interventions, with a significant slope for Year:period
335 interaction of $-1.88 \pm \text{SE } 0.30$ ($P= 0.001$, Figure 4).

336

337 **4. Discussion**

338 This study aimed to evaluate the effectiveness of a habitat restoration programme for the
339 conservation of *T. cristatus* in the Scottish Highlands, which sought to maintain distinct
340 local genetic lineages with the avoidance of deleterious genetic processes linked to
341 isolation. The intention is that this would foster adaptation to environmental change through
342 natural selection on the standing levels of local genetic variation, as intended for GCUs as
343 proposed by Minter et al. (2021). In order to do this, we considered barriers to movement,
344 as well as pond-specific biotic and abiotic factors that may be linked to colonisation. Our
345 intervention sites prevented a steady decline in the number of ponds occupied and resulted
346 in an increase in the number of ponds managed wholly or partly for conservation of *T.*
347 *cristatus*. As might be expected with a declining species, the original breeding sites were
348 often isolated from each other and separated by unfavourable habitat prior to the
349 intervention. Using a detailed occupancy model which takes detectability into account, our
350 results show that the programme has been effective in increasing the number of breeding
351 ponds used by *T. cristatus*.

352

353 **4.1 Effectiveness of the habitat interventions for the conservation of *T.*** 354 ***cristatus***

355

356 Our knowledge of local habitat preferences led us to situate most of the intervention ponds
357 in areas of high terrestrial habitat richness, near to mixed *Pinus sylvestris* – *Betula*
358 woodland, a habitat strongly associated with persistence of *T. cristatus* in the region (Miró

359 et al., 2017). This relationship between habitat and initial occupancy was also confirmed by
360 the dynamic occupancy model of the present study. In the case of the original Forres Golf
361 Club pond, which held an isolated and declining population with low allelic richness
362 (O'Brien et al., 2015), the priority was to construct a suitable pond which might also form a
363 stepping stone to nearby existing woodland ponds. Our findings confirmed previous studies
364 on *T. cristatus* that have highlighted the negative impact of fish (Figure 2.b1; reviewed in
365 Jehle et al., 2011). Whilst *T. cristatus* in the Highlands also demonstrated a strong
366 association with well-vegetated ponds (Miró et al., 2017; Figure 3.b2), we preferred to allow
367 plants to colonise the intervention ponds naturally rather than planting them. Colonisation
368 by helophytes was rapid, including species typically used for egg-laying by *T. cristatus*
369 (such as *Epilobium* spp, *Myosotis* spp and *Glyceria fluitans*, see Miró et al., 2017).

370

371 The rapid colonisation of ponds by *T. cristatus* suggests that our work has produced
372 attractive and accessible breeding habitat. The broadly linear colonisation process from
373 occupied sites was expected, because ponds were constructed in a way that would allow
374 sequential colonisation, and ultimately enable gene flow within reconnected
375 metapopulations. All but one of the observed *T. cristatus* colonisation distances (Figure
376 3.a2) were at a similar range compared to other studies (Baker and Halliday, 1999; Kupfer
377 and Kneitz, 2000): 219 – 592m from pre-existing ponds. The single outlier pond (C17) at a
378 distance of 1,840m may have been colonised from an extensive area of local wetland
379 containing individuals that remained undetected during surveys. Due to resource
380 constraints, a pond intended as a stepping stone was only constructed in 2017 (B07,
381 Appendix Table A1). It seems likely that this has slowed down colonisation in the area,
382 although breeding by *T. cristatus* was recorded there and in neighbouring new ponds in
383 2020.

384

385 Conservation of *T. cristatus* is best achieved by improving the functioning of their
386 metapopulations (Jehle et al., 2011). The sets of new ponds in the three pre-existing pond
387 clusters (Contin/Strathpeffer, Black Isle and Forres; Figure 1) were created to increase the
388 available breeding habitat in specific locations to reinforce local metapopulations. Griffiths
389 and Williams (2000) found that the likelihood of individual populations going extinct is
390 inversely related to the number of suitable breeding ponds within recolonization distance,
391 and Halley et al. (1996) found that even large populations located over 3km from the
392 nearest source pond had a greater than 95% chance of extinction within 20 generations.
393 Even where resources meant we were only able to construct a single new pond at one
394 cluster (Forres), these studies suggest that extinction risk might nevertheless be reduced in
395 this area from over 75% to well below 50% over 50 years, thus potentially stabilising the
396 eastern edge of the species' local range.

397

398 **4.2 Connectivity**

399 Perhaps counter-intuitively, the need for closely adjacent ponds is greatest in areas where
400 the habitat is only moderately favourable, and thus pond-level extinctions can be expected.
401 The modelled low connectivity between Forres and the other populations suggests that
402 additional pond creation may be needed in this area. O'Brien et al. (2015) found low genetic
403 diversity in this population, consistent with long-term isolation. Further breeding sites have
404 subsequently been discovered in the Forres area (Miró et al., 2017), however at a distance
405 exceeding the recorded maximum recorded migration distance of *T. cristatus* (1 650 m,
406 Haubrock & Altrichter, 2016). The newly created pond reduces the distance between them
407 and the original golf course pond, thus supporting the likelihood of gene flow. Whilst these
408 populations have persisted up to now, an increased likelihood of drought as a result of
409 climate change may lead to more frequent pond-level extinctions (Kirkpatrick Baird et al.,
410 2021), and thus the need for greater attention to meta-population dynamic processes in this
411 cluster.

412

413 The connectivity map shows high habitat connectivity between the Black Isle and West
414 Inverness populations. However, actual connectivity for *T. cristatus* is likely to be lower, as
415 the model fails to take into account an intervening fast-flowing river (the Beauly) with high
416 salinity levels close to its mouth, combined with a lack of local ponds that could serve as
417 stepping stones.

418

419 **4.3 In situ genetic conservation**

420 Knowledge of the genetic structure of the local *T. cristatus* populations served as a basis for
421 the planning of our interventions. Although the influence of pond (re)creation on the local
422 standing amount of genetic variation remains to be measured, we assume that our
423 interventions have been beneficial to the overall levels of genetic diversity: O'Brien et al.
424 (2015) highlighted low allelic richness in the Forres population, suggesting risks relating to
425 genetic erosion. Our work has led to an increase in the number of breeding ponds while
426 simultaneously reducing the inter-pond distance, promoting migration and thus possibly
427 gene flow. Ponds in the Contin/Strathpeffer cluster are now better connected, as are those
428 in the Black Isle cluster. O'Brien et al. (2015) had found low F_{ST} values between ponds in
429 the Black Isle cluster despite an absence of ponds between them, which is consistent with
430 the known loss of agricultural ponds in the area during the 20th century. The increased
431 number of breeding ponds in both areas should decrease the risk of loss of genetic diversity
432 from metapopulation demographic processes while maintaining the locally distinctive
433 population. Given the low connectivity between the East Inverness set of populations,
434 further studies to establish the local level of genetic diversity would be useful to guide
435 possible future intervention. Taken together, the conservation measures for *T. cristatus* in
436 the Scottish Highlands provide a useful case study of an approach that would meet the
437 criteria for GCUs as proposed by Minter et al. (2021).

438

439 **4.4 Breeding pond occupancy**

440 The dynamic occupancy model (Figure 4) demonstrates that the historic decline of *T.*
441 *cristatus* described in Miró et al. (2017) would have continued in the absence of
442 intervention. Between 1990 and 2012, evidence for local extinctions was observed for nine
443 ponds and severe declines were recorded in a further four ponds, principally as a result of
444 succession, desiccation or fish introduction (Miró et al., 2017), and a further pond was lost
445 in 2019. As a result of our interventions, the derived overall occupancy trend is positive.
446 The 12 newly established *T. cristatus* populations have increased the total number of sites
447 in the Highland region to 56 (records since 1990; NBN, 2019). The dynamic occupancy
448 model identified distance between ponds, desiccation and fish presence as negatively
449 associated with initial occupancy, confirming the value of the intervention work carried out.
450 However, it should be noted that occasional pond desiccation, around one year in ten,
451 appears to be favourable to *T. cristatus* (provided re-colonisation from nearby ponds is
452 possible), as it stops the establishment of fish and reduces numbers of some invertebrate
453 predators (Griffiths 1997; O'Brien et al., 2017; Oldham et al., 2000).

454

455 Our findings mirror Europe-wide causes of decline in *T. cristatus* reviewed in Jehle et al.,
456 2011 although, unlike that review, no evidence has been reported of declining water quality
457 in the Highlands (SEWeb, 2020), and water quality in all ponds with *T. cristatus* in our study
458 was high (Miró et al., 2017). Furthermore, two of the ponds suffering loss of *T. cristatus*
459 were newly created fishponds which only held *T. cristatus* briefly before fish became
460 established, and another pond was found to have been recolonised in 2018. Therefore, the
461 overall outlook based on pond occupancy seems favourable.

462

463 **4.5 Implications for conservation management of *in-situ* populations**

464 We believe that the success of this project results from the combination of habitat, genetic
465 and human societal factors. Before any landscape-scale intervention for the benefit of
466 range edge or long-isolated populations, we recommend investigation of local habitat
467 preferences, rather than relying on information from a species' core range (see also
468 O'Brien et al., 2021). Further, we recommend quantification of local genetic patterns to
469 counterbalance the risks of local genetic erosion against the potential loss of locally
470 adapted variation through reconnecting long-isolated populations. Rather than considering
471 individual populations as main units, habitat connectivity analysis, in our case combined
472 with historic data, can be used to target intervention sites that augment local
473 metapopulations without disrupting natural ecological and genetic partitions.

474

475 **Acknowledgements**

476 Onsite habitat management work was funded by SNH/NatureScot, Scotland's statutory
477 conservation agency, and Forest and Land Scotland. We would like to thank the land
478 owners, Duncan and Marjorie Fraser, Duncan Forbes, Sean and Ewan Macdonald, Forres
479 Golf Club, in particular Sandy Aird, and the project partners; Richard Lockett of Lockett Agri-
480 Environmental, Tony Seymour of The Farm Environmental and the Highland Amphibian and
481 Reptile Project. We would also like to thank two anonymous reviewers for their helpful
482 insights.

483

484 **Ethical statement**

485 Survey work was carried out under licence from Scottish Natural Heritage and adhered to
486 their ethical and biosecurity guidance.

487 **Competing interests**

488 The authors declare that they have no competing interests.

489 **Data availability**

490 Original species records, including records of non-target species are publicly available via the
491 National Biodiversity Network (<https://nbnatlas.org/>).

492

493 **References**

- 494
495 Akaike, H., 1974. A New Look at the Statistical Model Identification. *IEEE Transactions on*
496 *Automatic Control* 19, 716-723.
- 497 Allentoft, M.E., O'Brien, J., 2010. Global amphibian declines, loss of genetic diversity and
498 fitness: A Review. *Diversity* 2, 47-71.
- 499 Baker, J.M.R., Halliday, T.R., 1999. Amphibian colonisation of new ponds in an agricultural
500 landscape. *Herpetol. J.* 9, 55-63.
- 501
- 502 Brown, J.H., Kodric-Brown, A., 1977. Turnover rates in insular biogeography: Effect of
503 immigration on extinction. *Ecology* 58, 445-449.
- 504 Burnham, K.P., Anderson, D.R., 2004. Multimodel inference - understanding AIC and BIC in
505 model selection. *Sociological Methods & Research* 33, 261-304.
- 506 CBD, 1992. *Convention on Biological Diversity*. United Nations; Rio de Janeiro, Brazil.
- 507 Cooke, A.S., Ferguson, P.F., 1976. Changes in status of the frog (*Rana temporaria*) and the
508 toad (*Bufo bufo*) on part of the East Anglian Fenland in Britain. *Biol. Conserv.* 9, 191-
509 198.
- 510 Cox, K., Denoël, M., Van Calster, H., Speybroeck, J., Van de Poel, S., Lewylle, I.,
511 Verschaeve, L., Van Breusegem, A., Halfmaerten, D., Adriaens, D., Louette, G.
512 (2021) Scale-dependent effects of terrestrial habitat on genetic variation in the great
513 crested newt (*Triturus cristatus*). *Landscape Ecology*, early online.
- 514 Cushman, S.A., 2006. Effects of habitat loss and fragmentation on amphibians: A review and
515 prospectus. *Biol. Conserv.* 128, 231-240.
- 516 de Vries, S.M., et al., 2015. *Pan-European strategy for genetic conservation of forest trees*
517 *and establishment of a core network of dynamic conservation units. European Forest*
518 *Genetic Resources Programme (EUFORGEN)*. Bioversity International; Rome, Italy.
519 xii, 3.

520 Díaz, S., et al., 2019a. Pervasive human-driven decline of life on Earth points to the need for
521 transformative change. *Science* 366, eaax3100.

522 Díaz, S., et al. eds., 2019b. IPBES (2019): *Summary for policymakers of the global*
523 *assessment report on biodiversity and ecosystem services of the Intergovernmental*
524 *Science-Policy Platform on Biodiversity and Ecosystem Services*. IPBES secretariat;
525 Bonn, Germany.

526 European Environment Agency, 2019a. EUNIS habitat type hierarchical view,
527 <http://eunis.eea.europa.eu/habitats-code-browser.jsp>. Accessed 16th November
528 2019.

529 European Environment Agency, 2019b. The European environment — state and outlook
530 2020, <https://www.eea.europa.eu/publications/soer-2020>.

531 Fardell, L., Valdez, J., Klop-Toker, K., Stockwell, M., Clulow, S., Clulow, J., Mahony, M.,
532 2018. Effects of vegetation density on habitat suitability for the endangered green
533 and golden bell frog, *Litoria aurea*. *Herpetol. Conserv. Biol.* 13, 47-57.

534 Fiske, I.J., Chandler, R.B., 2011. Unmarked: An R Package for Fitting Hierarchical Models of
535 Wildlife Occurrence and Abundance. *Journal of Statistical Software* 43, 1-23.

536 Gelman, A., Hill, J., 2007. *Data Analysis Using Regression and Multilevel/Hierarchical*
537 *Models*. Cambridge University Press. Cambridge.

538 Griffiths, R.A., 1997. Temporary ponds as amphibian habitats. *Aquatic Conservation: Marine*
539 *and freshwater ecosystems*, 7(2), pp.119-126.

540 Griffiths, R.A., Sewell, D., McCrea, R.S., 2010. Dynamics of a declining amphibian
541 metapopulation: survival, dispersal and the impact of climate. *Biol. Conserv.* 143,
542 485-491.

543 Griffiths, R. A., J. Foster, J. W. Wilkinson & D. Sewell, 2015. Science, statistics and surveys:
544 a herpetological perspective. *J Appl. Ecol.* 52: 1413–1417.

545 Griffiths, R.A., Williams, C., 2000. Modelling population dynamics of great crested newts
546 (*Triturus cristatus*): a population viability analysis. *Herpetol. J.* 10, 157-163.

547 Guillerá-Arroita, G., 2017. Modelling of species distributions, range dynamics and
548 communities under imperfect detection: advances, challenges and opportunities.
549 *Ecography* 40, 15.

550 Haggerty, C.J.E., Crisman, T.L., Rohr, J.R., 2019. Direct and indirect effects of pine
551 silviculture on the larval occupancy and breeding of declining amphibian species. *J.*
552 *Appl. Ecol.* 56, 2652-2662.

553 Halley, J.M., Oldham, R.S., Arntzen, J.W., 1996. Predicting the persistence of amphibian
554 populations with the help of a spatial model. *J. Appl. Ecol.* 33, 455-470.

555 Hanski, I., 1998. Metapopulation dynamics. *Nature* 396, 41-49.

556

557 Haubrock, P.J. and Altrichter, J., 2016. Northern crested newt (*Triturus cristatus*) migration in
558 a nature reserve: multiple incidents of breeding season displacements exceeding
559 1km. *Herpetol. Bull.*, 138, pp.31-33.

560 Hoban, S., et al., 2020. Genetic diversity targets and indicators in the CBD post-2020 Global
561 Biodiversity Framework must be improved. *Biol. Conserv.* 248, 108654.

562 Hoffmann, M., et al., 2010. The impact of conservation on the status of the world's
563 Vertebrates. *Science* 330, 1503-1509.

564 Jehle, R., 2000. The terrestrial summer habitat of radio-tracked great crested newts (*Triturus*
565 *cristatus*) and marbled newts (*T. marmoratus*). *Herpetol. J.* 10, 137-142.

566 Jehle, R., Thiesmeier, B., Foster, J., 2011. *The crested newt: a dwindling pond-dweller.*
567 Laurenti; Bielefeld, Germany.

568 Kirkpatrick Baird, F., Stubbs Partridge, J. & Spray, D. 2021. Anticipating and mitigating
569 projected climate-driven increases in extreme drought in Scotland, 2021-2040.
570 NatureScot Research Report No. 1228. NatureScot; Inverness, UK.

571 Kupfer, A., Kneitz, S., 2000. Population ecology of the great crested newt (*Triturus cristatus*)
572 in an agricultural landscape: Dynamics, pond fidelity and dispersal. *Herpetol. J.* 10,
573 165-171.

574 MacKenzie, D.I., Bailey, L.L., 2004. Assessing the fit of site-occupancy models. *J. Agric.*
575 *Biol. Environ. Stat.* 9, 300-318.

576 MacKenzie, D.I., Nichols, J.D., Hines, J.E., Knutson, M.G., Franklin, A.B., 2003. Estimating
577 site occupancy, colonization, and local extinction when a species is detected
578 imperfectly. *Ecology* 84, 2200-2207.

579 McClatchey, J., Devoy, R., Woolf, D., Bremner, B., James, N., 2014. Climate change and
580 adaptation in the coastal areas of Europe's Northern Periphery Region. *Ocean &*
581 *Coastal Management* 94, 9-21.

582 McKinnell, J.M., O'Brien, D.M., Seymour, T., Gent, T., 2015. *Great crested newt*, In The
583 species action framework handbook. eds M.J. Gaywood, P.J. Boon, D.B.A.
584 Thompson, I.M. Strachan. Scottish Natural Heritage; Battleby, Perth.

585 McRae, B.H., Dickson, B.G., Keitt, T.H., Shah, V.B., 2008. Using circuit theory to model
586 connectivity in ecology, evolution, and conservation. *Ecology* 89, 2712-2724.

587 Merow, C., Smith, M.J., Silander Jr, J.A., 2013. A practical guide to MaxEnt for modeling
588 species' distributions: what it does, and why inputs and settings matter. *Ecography*
589 36, 1058-1069.

590 Miró, A., O'Brien, D., Hall, J., Jehle, R., 2017. Habitat requirements and conservation needs
591 of peripheral populations: the case of the great crested newt (*Triturus cristatus*) in the
592 Scottish Highlands. *Hydrobiologia* 792, 169-181.

593 NBN, 2019. the National Biodiversity Network's Gateway. <https://data.nbn.org.uk/>. Accessed
594 14th November 2019.

595 O'Brien, C.D., Hall, J.E., 2012. A hypothesis to explain the distribution of the great crested
596 newt *Triturus cristatus* in the Highlands of Scotland. *Herpetol. Bull.* 119, 9-14.

597 O'Brien, C.D., Hall, J.E., Miró, A., Wilkinson, J.W., 2017. Testing the validity of a commonly-
598 used habitat suitability index at the edge of a species' range: great crested newt
599 *Triturus cristatus* in Scotland. *Amphib-Reptil.* 38, 265 – 273.

600 O'Brien, C.D., Hall, J.E., Orchard, D., Barratt, C.D., Arntzen, J.W., Jehle, R., 2015.
601 Extending the natural range of a declining species: genetic evidence for native great

602 crested newt (*Triturus cristatus*) populations in the Scottish Highlands. *Eur. J. Wildl.*
603 *Res.* 61, 27-33.

604 O'Brien, D, Hall., J.E., Miró, A., O'Brien, K., Jehle, R., 2021. A co-development approach to
605 conservation leads to informed habitat design and rapid establishment of amphibian
606 communities. *Ecol. Solut. Evidence.* 2, e12038.

607 Oldham, R.S., Keeble, J., Swan, M.J.S., Jeffcote, M., 2000. Evaluating the suitability of
608 habitat for the great crested newt (*Triturus cristatus*). *Herpetol. J.* 10, 143-155.

609 Pérez-Espona, S., ConGRESS Consortium, 2017. Conservation genetics in the European
610 Union – Biases, gaps and future directions. *Biol. Conserv.* 209, 130-136.

611 Phillips, S.J., Anderson, R.P., Schapire, R.E., 2006. Maximum entropy modeling of species
612 geographic distributions. *Ecol. Modelling* 190, 231-259.

613 Pollock, K.H., 1982. A capture-recapture design robust to unequal probability of capture. *J.f*
614 *Wildl. Manag.* 46, 752-757.

615 R Core Team, 2018. R: A language and environment for statistical computing. R Foundation
616 for Statistical Computing, Vienna, Austria. URL <http://www.R-project.org/>.

617 SEWeb, 2014 EUNIS Land Cover Scotland. [https://data.gov.uk/dataset/0acb95af-f367-4408-](https://data.gov.uk/dataset/0acb95af-f367-4408-be87-f862651a6b16/eunis-land-cover-scotland)
618 [be87-f862651a6b16/eunis-land-cover-scotland](https://data.gov.uk/dataset/0acb95af-f367-4408-be87-f862651a6b16/eunis-land-cover-scotland).

619 SEWeb, 2020. Escotland's Environment. Indicator 6: Freshwater.
620 [https://www.environment.gov.scot/our-environment/state-of-the-](https://www.environment.gov.scot/our-environment/state-of-the-environment/ecosystem-health-indicators/condition-indicators/indicator-6-freshwater/)
621 [environment/ecosystem-health-indicators/condition-indicators/indicator-6-freshwater/](https://www.environment.gov.scot/our-environment/state-of-the-environment/ecosystem-health-indicators/condition-indicators/indicator-6-freshwater/).

622 Skei, J.K., Dolmen, D., Ronning, L., Ringsby, T.H., 2006. Habitat use during the aquatic
623 phase of the newts *Triturus vulgaris* (L.) and *T. cristatus* (Laurenti) in central Norway:
624 proposition for a conservation and monitoring area. *Amphib-reptil.* 27, 309-324.

625 Vanek, J.P., King, R.B., Glowacki, G.A., 2019. Landscape and management factors
626 influence the occupancy dynamics of sympatric salamanders in an urban preserve
627 system. *Global Ecol. Cons.* 20, e00742.

628 Villena, O.C., Royle, J.A., Weir, L.A., Foreman, T.M., Gazenski, K.D., Grant, E.H.C., 2016.
629 Southeast regional and state trends in anuran occupancy from calling survey data

630 (2001-2013) from the North American amphibian monitoring program. *Herpetol.*
631 *Conserv. Biol.* 11, 373-383.

632 Weir, L., Fiske, I.J., Royle, J.A., 2009. Trends in anuran occupancy from northeastern states
633 of the North American Amphibian Monitoring Program. *Herpetol. Conserv. Biol.* 4,
634 389-402.

635 Wilkinson, J.W., Arnell, A.P., 2013. *NARRS Report 2007-2012: Establishing the baseline.*
636 *ARC Research Report 13/01*, pp. 1-36. Amphibian and Reptile Conservation
637 Research Report 13/01, Bourmemouth.

638 Zuur, A.F., Ieno, E.N., Walker, N.J., Saveliev, A.A., Smith, G.M., 2009. *Mixed effects models*
639 *and extensions in ecology with R.* Springer; New York.

640
641
642
643

644

645