Contents lists available at ScienceDirect

Atherosclerosis

journal homepage: www.elsevier.com/locate/atherosclerosis

Gonadal sex vs genetic sex in experimental atherosclerosis

Jasmine Nour, Fabrizia Bonacina, Giuseppe D. Norata

Department of Pharmacological and Biomolecular Sciences "Rodolfo Paoletti", University of Milan, Italy

ARTICLE INFO

Keywords: Experimental atherosclerosis Sexual hormones Sexual chromosomes Lipids Inflammation

ABSTRACT

Epidemiological data and interventional studies with hormone replacement therapy suggest that women, at least until menopause, are at decreased cardiovascular risk compared to men. Still the molecular mechanisms beyond this difference are debated and the investigation in experimental models of atherosclerosis has been pivotal to prove that the activation of the estrogen receptor is atheroprotective, despite not enough to explain the differences reported in cardiovascular disease between male and female.

This casts also for investigating the importance of the sex chromosome complement (genetic sex) beyond the contribution of sex hormones (gonadal sex) on atherosclerosis. Aim of this review is to present the dualism between gonadal sex and genetic sex with a focus on the data available from experimental models. The molecular mechanisms driving changes in lipid metabolism, immuno-inflammatory reactivity and vascular response in males and females that affect atherosclerosis progression will be discussed.

1. Introduction

The incidence of ischemic heart disease differs in relation to sex and gender; women present a lower cardiovascular disease (CVD) risk till menopause that increases thereafter [1], becoming comparable to men [2]. In concomitance, menopause comes along with a rise in risk factors such as hypertension, high circulating levels of cholesterol [3], development of carotid atherosclerotic plaque [4] and higher incidence of myocardial infarction (MI) [2]. Of note, women who experienced premature menopause had a 33% higher risk of heart failure and 9% higher risk of atrial fibrillation compared to those who did not [5]. While estrogens were identified as key players in cardiovascular protection, additional mechanisms, independent of hormones, but related to sexual chromosomes, have been proposed [6-9]. Aim of this review is to discuss factors differentially affecting atherosclerosis development in males and females as a consequence of either gonadal sex (pointing to sexual hormone differences) or of genetic sex (indicating the effect of genes selectively expressed in sexual chromosomes) with a focus on the evidence emerged from the use of experimental animal models.

2. Are experimental animal models reliable to study sex differences in atherosclerosis?

Since its introduction at the beginning of the XX century, the use of animal models has been crucial for understanding the molecular mechanisms driving atherosclerotic plaque formation and progression. However, the importance of reporting sex-differences in experimental studies of atherosclerosis has been so far underestimated [10-12], despite sex has been increasingly recognized as an independent variable of disease severity even in animal studies [13].

Indeed, the analysis of sex-related effects observed in humans through the investigation of specific molecular mechanisms in animal models is not a standard practice [14]. While experimental studies on the pathophysiology of atherosclerosis span from the use of cold vertebrate to non-human primates, few works systematically reported the results for both males and females and even less performed a statistical comparison of the differences in the two sexes [11,14].

Although rodents are the most used species for experimental research in the context of cardiovascular research, also zebrafish or larger animals like pigs or non-human primates are used (Table 1).

Zebrafish became popular in cardiovascular studies thanks to the similarity of its genome to humans [15], coupled with its rapid and large

* Corresponding author. E-mail address: Danilo.Norata@unimi.it (G.D. Norata).

https://doi.org/10.1016/j.atherosclerosis.2023.117277

Received 31 March 2023; Received in revised form 9 June 2023; Accepted 1 September 2023 Available online 27 September 2023

0021-9150/© 2023 The Authors. Published by Elsevier B.V. This is an open access article under the CC BY license (http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/).



Review article



EAS 🍈

Table 1	
Sexual dimorphism in atherosclerosis	development in experimental models.

Species	Genetic modification	Intervention	Vascular bed	Sexual dymorphism in atherosclerosis development
Non-human	N/A	High fat high cholesterol diet	Coronary and iliac artery	M > F [21]
primates	N/A	High fat high cholesterol diet + Ovariectomy (F)	Coronary, carotid, iliofemoral artery	OVX $F > sham F$ [22]
	N/A	High fat high cholesterol diet + Psychological stress (F)	Coronary artery	M < F [23–25]
Minipigs	N/A	High fat high cholesterol diet	Coronary artery	$M \le F^*$ [26]
	GOF PCSK9	High fat high cholesterol diet	Coronary artery, aorta (whole and arch)	$M \le F^*$ [27,28]
	GOF PCSK9	High fat high cholesterol diet + Orchiectomy (M)	Aorta (arch, thoracic, abdominal) and iliac artery	↑ necrotic core in orchiectomized pigs [29]
Rabbits	None, NZW, WHHL	Normal or high cholesterol diet	Aorta (arch, thoracic, abdominal)	$M \leq F^*$ (reviewed in [14])
Mice	ApoE KO (C57BL/6 J background)	Normal or high cholesterol diet	Aorta (arch, thoracic, abdominal)	$M \leq F^* \text{ (reviewed in [14])}$
	ApoE KO (C57BL/6 J	High cholesterol diet	Proximal aorta and aortic sinus	OVX $F > sham F$ [45]
	background)	+ Ovariectomy (F)		
	ApoE KO (C5/BL/6 J	High cholesterol diet	Proximal aorta and aortic sinus	OVX F > OVX + E2 F [45]
	background)	+ Ovariectomy (F) + 17-beta-estradiol (E2) administration	A state (such such sla)	
	LDLR KO (C5/BL/6 J background)	Normal or high cholesterol diet	Aorta (arch, whole)	$M \le F^{*}$ (reviewed in [14])
	ApoE KO (C57BL/6 J background)	High cholesterol diet + E2 (M)	Proximal aorta and aortic sinus	lesion size [45]
	LDLR KO (C57BL/6 J	High cholesterol diet + Orchiectomy (M) + E2 or testosterone	Aorta (root)	ORX M > ORX M + hormones [46]
	background)	administration		
	hApoB100 and CETP Tg	High cholesterol diet + E2 administration	Aorta (arch and sinus)	\downarrow lesion size [44]
	ΕRα ΚΟ	+/- E2 administration	Aorta (whole)	\downarrow early stage lesion size by E2 [48]
	CYP17a1/ApoE DKO	Standard and high cholesterol diet Low levels of and rogens and estrogen \rightarrow phenotypically F	Aorta (whole)	↑ lesion size [47]
Zebrafish	N/A	High cholesterol diet	Aorta	N/A due to the lack of sex chromosomes [18,19]

> Studies showing incressed atherosclerosis; = Studies showing no differences in atherosclerosis; < Studies showing reduced atherosclerosis. F stands for females and M for males; OVX stands for ovariectomy and ORX for orchiectomy.

Studies with direct statistical comparison.



Fig. 1. Estrogen-mediated atheroprotective effects. Estrogens exert their atheroprotective effects both locally on vascular and on immune cells but also on metabolic organs.

Specifically, in endothelial cells, estrogens promote vasodilatation and reduce the expression of adhesion and inflammatory molecules while in vascular smooth muscle cells limit lipid accumulation and proliferation. In macrophages, estrogens inhibit the release of pro-inflammatory cytokines and prevent the M1 classical activation, favoring the skewing toward an alternative phenotype (M2-like).

Systemic effects of estrogens include the reduction of non-alcoholic fatty liver disease development, hepatic inflammation, and insulin-resistance, thus dampening cardiovascular disease manifestations.

breeding. Zebrafish develops fatty streaks in the aorta upon cholesterol-rich diet feeding [16,17], but the lack of sex chromosomes limits the translation of genetic sex on disease development, despite sexual dimorphic characteristics have been reported [18,19]. Large animals, such as pigs and non-human primates, develop coronary artery disease similar to humans but practical and ethical considerations limit their use in experimental atherosclerosis [20]. Non-human primates show a sex-dependent risk of atherosclerosis similar to humans with increased coronary atherosclerosis in male compared to female, and the same is true in ovariectomized animals compared to controls [21,22]. Reduced levels of circulating estrogens as a consequence of psychological stress have been shown also to increase atherosclerosis compared to males [23–25].

In contrast, available data indicates that female minipigs develop equal or larger atherosclerotic lesions compared to males [26–28], but the literature about sex-specific difference in this species is limited, with a recent report showing that castration in hypercholesterolemic male Yucatan minipigs (which results in testosterone deficiency) does not alter the burden of dyslipidemia and atherosclerosis but increases necrotic core area in fibroatheromas [29].

Rodents remain the key species tested, with the impact of female sex frequently reported on atherosclerosis development in mice, hamsters, guinea pigs and rabbits [14,20] (Table 1). Mice are in general resistant to atherosclerosis development, although the strain C57BL6/J was shown to present an increased susceptibility to atherosclerosis when fed a cholesterol rich diet [30,31] and thus, by time, it has been genetically manipulated to exacerbate dyslipidemia and promote atherosclerotic plaque formation. The most used experimental models of dyslipidemia and atherosclerosis are mice lacking the apolipoprotein E (ApoE) or the low-density lipoprotein receptor (LDL-R). Additional experimental models include those overexpressing human ApoB, CETP or PCSK9, that is specifically induced via an adeno-associated virus vector and causes a reduced LDL-R expression in the liver [32,33], and those with the expression of a specific apoE variant (ApoE3-Leiden) (Table 1). In the following paragraphs, we will discuss how aspects related to gonadal-sex versus gender-sex influence atherosclerosis in murine experimental models.

3. Impact of gonadal sex on atherosclerosis

The cardiovascular protection reported in pre-menopausal women, usually associated to a less vulnerable and advanced lesion compared to males, has been directly linked to the favorable effects of estrogens and supported by the observation of a similar CVD risk between men and post-menopausal women, corresponding to a drop in estrogen levels. However, the contribution of aging itself, through a progressive degeneration of cardiovascular structures (arterial stiffening, heart hypertrophy, left ventricular wall thickening) as well as functions (endothelial dysfunction, hypertension, reduced protection from oxidative metabolism) independently of sex [34,35], should be taken into account. Nevertheless, in women, it has been reported that the higher is the age of natural menopause, the lower is the risk of mortality from coronary heart disease (CHD). Accordingly, oophorectomized young women present an increased CVD risk, further supporting the atheroprotective role of estrogens [36–39]. In spite of these findings, the atheroprotective function of estrogens has been challenged by the controversial result from different clinical studies with hormone replacement therapy (HRT) in post-menopausal women. Single versus combined administration of estrogens and progestins, might explain the different outcomes of these studies [40,41], and coupled to the observation that the earlier the HRT is started the better is the benefit [41,42]. The atheroprotective benefit of estrogens is evident in animal models and could be explained only in part by reduced plasma cholesterol [43], despite controversial results have been reported also in experimental studies [43].

Most studies on sex impact on atherosclerosis have reported an increased or at least equal atherosclerosis development in females compared to male mice [14] (Table 1). Estrogen administration in transgenic atherosclerotic mice overexpressing human ApoB100 and CETP resulted in a 2-3 times higher circulating cholesterol levels compared to other studies on dyslipidemic mice (Apo $E^{-/-}$ and Ldl $r^{-/-}$ mice), but still prevented atherosclerotic plaque development [44]. Ovariectomized $ApoE^{-/-}$ mice displayed increased atherosclerotic lesion development compared with female mice with intact ovarian function, independently of changes in plasma cholesterol levels [45]; of note this phenotype was reverted by subdermal delivery of 17-beta-estradiol (E2) at early atherosclerotic stage [45]. Estrogens have a protective role also in male: orchidectomy increases atherosclerotic lesion size in $Ldlr^{-/-}$ males and the administration of both E2 and testosterone limits atherosclerosis development. This protective function is lost in the presence of an inhibitor of aromatase [46], suggesting that testosterone mediated protection is guided by its conversion to estrogen. In agreement, male mice lacking the expression of CYP17A1, that is essential for the production of androgens and estrogens, are phenotypically females due to the low levels of testosterone and exhibit increased plasma cholesterol levels and atherosclerotic plaque when crossed with $ApoE^{-/-}$ mice [47].

A study investigating the protective effect of estrogens in early-stage atherosclerosis clearly showed that neither endogenous estrogens nor the estrogen receptor ER α are responsible for increased levels of HDL cholesterol, observed when exogenous estrogens are administrated to mice [48]. However, despite elevated levels of HDL-C are usually believed to contribute to the atheroprotection observed in pre-menopausal women, in mice HDL-C levels are not correlated with atherosclerotic plaque burden [48], suggesting that the atheroprotection of estrogens might be independent of the regulation of plasma lipid levels.





Fig. 2. Features of mouse models used to compare the impact of sex hormones or of sex chromosomes on atherosclerosis.

The four-core genotype (FCG) model can be used to understand if a sex-related characteristic is determined by sex hormones or sex chromosomes. In the FCG model, the *Sry* gene, responsible of the development of male reproductive system, is expressed on chromosome 3 instead of Y, now called Y^- , thus leading to mice with gonadal sex independent of the sex chromosome complement. Atherosclerosis-prone FCG mice prove the role of XX chromosomes on increasing atherosclerotic lesion size and circulating HDL cholesterol beyond the gonadal sex and circulating hormones, compared to the mice carrying the XY chromosomes that are associated with an overall atheroprotective lipid profile and decreased atherosclerotic lesion.

Further understanding on the role of sex chromosome dosage on a trait of interest can be obtained with the use of the XY* model, characterized by an improper recombination of the Y chromosome with the X chromosome, leading to X0 and XXY combination in addition to common XX and XY sex chromosomes. Thanks to this experimental model a higher increase in aortopathies has been associated with X monosomy when compared to XX mice, in line with what has been reported in Turner women.

Although important, the dimension of atherosclerotic plaque is not the only determinant of increased risk of events, and other factors such as lesion vulnerability and inflammation are to be considered. This is well established in pre-clinical studies where collagen content, smooth muscle cells and leukocyte infiltration are often evaluated as markers of disease stage, but not yet when regarding sex-driven differences. Atherosclerotic plaques of postmenopausal women are usually characterized by increased vulnerability and erosion with age, probably in concomitance with the drop in the protective effect of estrogens on the vasculature and inflammation [49,50], calling to ad hoc studies to weigh the contribution of these factor on top of aging on CV risk in women. In this issue, sex-specific effects on plaque characteristics are discussed in [51,52] and the cellular and molecular mechanisms in [53,54].

4. Estrogen receptor dependent-atheroprotective effects

In premenopausal women estradiol is released by ovaries, circulates mainly bound to the sex-hormone-binding globulin and acts on distant targets. Instead after menopause, similar to men, adipose tissue contributes almost completely to the amount of circulating estrogen through the conversion of stored or circulating androgens by aromatase, locally expressed [55,56].

The activity of estrogens is then mediated by activation of estrogen receptors (ERs) which are located in the cytosol and, upon binding with E2, dimerize and migrate to the nucleus where they interact with the estrogen responsive element, ERE, and regulate the expression of downstream genes. There are two estrogen receptors, namely type α (ER α) and type β (ER β) which are encoded respectively by *Esr1* and *Esr2* genes [57,58]. Both receptors are present in the nervous and cardiovascular systems, but Era in female and male reproductive organs, liver and adipose tissue, while $ER\beta$ is found mainly in the prostate, bladder, ovary, but also adipose tissue, and immune system [59]. ERa is highly expressed in endothelial cells and plays a role in mediating the effects of estrogens on the vascular endothelium, whereas $ER\beta$ stimulates the production of nitric oxide; the activation of both promotes a hypotensive effect (Fig. 1) [60]. The activation of ER α also limits the proliferation of vascular smooth muscle cells (VSMCs) in high-glucose conditions, their differentiation, the production of reactive oxygen species (ROS), and lipid accumulation (Fig. 1); in this context, the role of ER β remains more controversial [61]. These findings have suggested that $ER\alpha$ activation by E2 plays an atheroprotective role on the vasculature [62], while studies on ER β have led to divergent conclusions [63–65]. Of note, it has been shown that ERs can differently regulate gene expression in the same tissue, with ER α primarily upregulating, whereas ER β downregulating the expression of genes related to extracellular matrix synthesis, electron transport in the mitochondria, and reactive oxygen species pathways in murine aorta [66].

Additionally, the level of both ERs in the vasculature can be regulated by sexual hormones: the analysis on endothelial cells from peripheral veins of premenopausal women showed that $ER\alpha$ expression is 30% lower during the early follicular phase compared to the late follicular phase [38], while increased ERα and decreased ERβ expression have been reported under long-term estrogen treatment in in vitro experiments [67,68]. By contrast, estrogen has been described to suppress vascular inflammation by decreasing the production of proinflammatory molecules, including cytokines and adhesion molecules [69-71] (Fig. 1). However, increased expression of ER^β over ER^α has been described during aging and associated with higher oxidative stress in experimental models. This dichotomic inflammatory response is related to the different signaling pathways of ERs [72,73] and influenced by the phase of the estrous cycle in rodents [74], as well as by HRT in humans [75]. To note, the impact of HRT on inflammation is not unequivocal, and this discrepancy has been potentially associated to differences in the hormone combination or the route of administration [75,76]. In parallel, in mice levels of E2, that depend on the phase of estrous cycle - increasing in diestrus (D), and proestrus (P), while decreasing in estrus (E) and

metestrus (M) over a period of 4–5 days [77,78] – have been shown to be associated to arterial stiffening [79], with higher levels of E2 resulting in a more favorable gene expression profile associated to improved cardiac and vascular function [80]. In addition to ERs, E2 can signal through the G Protein-coupled Estrogen Receptor (GPER), a receptor mainly expressed on endothelial cells and VSMCs. Its activation promotes vasodilation and inhibits VSMCs proliferation [81]. Accordingly, GPER deletion resulted in reduced vasodilation, increased inflammation and atherosclerosis [82].

Estrogens target also the liver [83]; more than 1000 genes were shown to present a sex-bias in their expression, with genes involved in triglyceride and cholesterol metabolism, or in fatty acid oxidation presenting sexual dimorphism and fluctuation during the estrous cycle [84–86]. Estrogens can mediate these effects on hepatic metabolism via both transcriptional activation or post-translational modification of ER α , ER β and GPER [87]. Estrogens indirectly affect hepatic metabolism also by regulating growth hormone (GH) action [88]; this occurs in the central nervous system, by the regulation of pituitary GH secretion, and at the tissue levels by the activation of GH signaling [63]. Indeed, GH controls a network of transcription factors related to energetic and lipid metabolism (PPAR α , CAR, FXR, SHP, SREBP, CRBP), and the absence of estrogen signaling has been associated to a metabolic-like syndrome described in GH deficiency [89].

A proper response to estrogens in the liver protects from metabolicdriven inflammation and non-alcoholic fatty liver disease (NAFLD) [88] (Fig. 1). Estrogen deficiency in ovariectomized mice, vice versa, results in hepatic insulin resistance (Fig. 1), increased fatty acid uptake but not oxidation, leading to fat accumulation in the liver and in the adipose tissue [90,91]. This phenotype was observed also in $Era^{-/-}$ mice and liver specific (LERKO) ER α knockout mice [92,93], but not in $Er\beta^{-/-}$ mice [94].

Evolutionarily, this specific metabolic response mediated by estrogens could be related to the different energetic requirements for reproduction that depend on increased metabolic flexibility of female liver [95].

Given the key role of the immunoinflammatory response during atherosclerosis, it is conceivable to speculate that the sexual dimorphism observed in the immune response might also impact the progression of CVD. It is known that rheumatoid arthritis (RA) and multiple sclerosis (MS) are more frequent in women [96], while men show a higher mortality for infectious diseases and a higher risk of developing fatal cancers [97].

In vitro, estradiol was shown to reduce the pro-inflammatory activation of both murine and human monocytes and macrophages [98,99] (Fig. 1), and their chemotaxis [100]. *In vivo*, estrogen receptor activation has been shown to modulate the production of myeloid cells, at the level of the hematopoietic niche [101]. Experimental female mice lacking the expression of ER α in hematopoietic or myeloid cells manifest obesity-induced insulin resistance and atherosclerosis [102], suggesting an immunomodulatory effect of estrogen during cardiometabolic diseases (Fig. 1). This is confirmed by the ability of estrogens to promote an alternative activation of macrophages from human PBMCs [103,104] (Fig. 1), and directly reduce metalloproteinase 12 macrophage expression in the atherosclerotic plaque [105].

5. Impact of genetic sex on atherosclerosis

When investigating the impact of sexual dimorphic characteristics, it is critical to consider not only the contribution of sexual hormones (gonadal sex) but also that of genes present in sexual chromosomes, that might present a different expression pattern in males and females (genetic sex) [106–108].

The evaluation of CVD risk in transgender people after a genderaffirming hormone-based therapy has been pivotal to evaluate the impact of gonadal versus genetic sex. Relevant to report is that transgender subjects display increased risk of myocardial infarction



Fig. 3. Impact of gonadal sex *vs* genetic sex on atherosclerosis and atherosclerosis-related risk factors.

On the left, the impact of gonadal hormones on atherosclerosis is presented. Estrogens mediate a series of atheroprotective effects on the vasculature, on liver metabolism and on immune inflammation through the activation of nuclear and surface receptors. Testosterone directly dampens immune activation and can also be converted in estrogen thus inducing atheroprotection.

On the right, the role of genetic sex on atherogenesis is shown. The presence of two X chromosomes associates with a more atherogenic lipid profile, increased atheroma and adiposity, and increased susceptibility to autoimmune conditions. Although the Y chromosome presents a lower number of genes when compared to the X chromosome, its loss was associated to increased clonal hematopoiesis, thus predisposing to an increased risk of major cardiovascular events and worse heart failure.

compared to cisgender age-matched individuals [109,110]. In addition, a consistent change in circulating lipid profile [111,112], hemostasis and inflammation [113] are observed in people undergoing gender-affirming hormone therapy. Trans women have decreased total cholesterol, LDL-C, and triglycerides while trans men, in contrast, present an increase in these lipid parameters [111,112], with a reduction in HDL-C levels and also in HDL functionality (lower HDL cholesterol efflux capacity, HDL-CEC) [114].

The impact of genetic sex on atherosclerosis development can be investigated also in individuals with genetic conditions affecting the number of sex chromosomes, such as Klinefelter syndrome (KS), leading to male individuals with XXY chromosomes, and Turner syndrome (TS), females with X0 chromosomes. Individuals affected by any of these syndromes develop congenital cardiovascular abnormalities [115,116]. In details, KS is associated with increased cardiometabolic risk, starting from early age [117], and overall increased carotid intima-media thickness [115] and hyperlipidemia [118]. TS women display an atherogenic lipid profile [119] and intima-media thickness [120], coupled to early onset hypertension [121], and higher risk of ischemic heart disease [119].

Recently, the importance of Y chromosome has been pointed out in several studies. The loss of Y (LOY) is normally observed with aging in blood cells and, recently, has been associated with the occurrence of major cardiovascular events in patients with severe atherosclerosis, independently of the increased lesion size or plaque inflammation [122]. In addition, mosaic LOY (mLOY), a common acquired structural mutation in the leukocytes of aging men, correlates with worse cardiac fibrosis and heart failure [123], and the use of mice with mLOY, obtained through CRISPR-Cas9 technique, pointed out a role of TGF β signaling in this phenomenon [124].

Manipulation of genetic and gonadal sex in experimental animal models offers a platform to unveil the impact of sexual chromosomes on sex-dependent mechanisms. From a biological perspective, the genetic basis of sex determination resides in the presence of XX chromosomes in females or XY in males, while the development of dimorphic sexual gonads depends on the expression of *Sry* gene (Sex determining Region Y protein) on the Y chromosome that promotes the development of a male reproductive system, while its lack, commonly due to the absence of the Y chromosome, leads to the development of female-like hormone profile and female gonads. However, epigenetic mechanisms of transcriptional repression have been identified in the regulation of female puberty. These were described as involved in the control of gonadotropin-releasing hormone (GnRH) secretion [125], thus adding further complexity to the regulation of male and female phenotype.

To discriminate genetic versus gonadal sex, one of the first models developed was the four core genotype model (FCG) [126]. This model was created by deleting the *Sry* from chromosome Y, leading to a XY⁻ mouse model presenting Y chromosome and female gonads. *Sry* insertion in the autosome 3 in the XY⁻ *Sry* mouse, results in a fertile mouse which develops male gonads. The crossing of XY⁻ *Sry* male mice with XX females leads to four possible genotypes: XX *Sry* and XY⁻ *Sry* with testis, and XY⁻ and XX with ovaries, also referred to as XXM, XYM, XYF, and XXF respectively [127] (Fig. 2).

The four-core genotype model is useful to investigate whether the sexual dimorphic characteristic of interest is caused by sex-specific gonadal hormones or the sex chromosomes per se. X chromosomes for example contain genes known to escape the X chromosome inactivation, which are thus expressed more in individuals with two X chromosomes [128]. Intriguingly, the X-inactivation escaping genes include chromatin-modifying enzymes that regulate gene expression. Indeed, sex-biased genes are enriched for proteins that are involved in deposition of epigenetic marks (such as histone modifications) and for genes that are adjacent to a subset of transcription recognition sequences, including hormone-related transcription factors, thus accounting for gene expression differences between males and females [129].

The contribution of sex chromosomes in atherosclerosis has been investigated in the FCG model crossed with $Ldlr^{-/-}$, $ApoE^{-/-}$, and WT C57BL6/J mice fed with a high-cholesterol diet (WTD). The XX chromosome complement, independently of the presence of ovaries or testes (XXF or XXM), has been associated to increased atherosclerosis,

circulating levels of cholesterol and TG, and intestinal fat absorption, while both XYM and XYF showed improved atherogenic lipid profile and lower atherosclerosis [130] (Fig. 2). Of note, this work mainly focused on lipid metabolism and lesion size as determinants of atherosclerosis development; further studies should be designed to evaluate how changes in gonadal hormones or sex chromosome complement affect plaque stability or the immuno-inflammatory response. A novel mouse model where a mutated Y chromosome (Y*) can pair with the X chromosome leading to the generation of 4 possible genotypes, comparable with XX, XY, XXY and X0 [131,132] might help understand these aspects (Fig. 2).

6. Role of genetic sex on atherosclerosis-related risk factors

6.1. Lipids and lipoprotein metabolism

In line with findings reported above, hepatic triglyceride levels under fasting show a sex dimorphism and are higher in female mice [133,134]. This was shown to strongly depend upon modifications by the epigenetic "writer" protein METTL14. The expression of this gene is higher in the presence of two X chromosomes, and liver-specific deletion of *Mettl14* from male and female mice significantly diminishes sex-specific differences in steatosis suggesting a sex-dimorphic regulation of lipid metabolism [135].

Intriguingly, also HDL-C levels are strongly related to XX chromosomes and not on gonadal hormones. XX mice present increased HDL-C levels when compared to XY mice, even after gonadectomy [136]. This difference is hypothesized to depend on the gradient of X chromosome available, as mice with two X chromosome have higher HDL-C independently of gonadal sex [136], but further studies should point out the exact mechanism underlying this phenomenon.

6.2. Vascular homeostasis

Aortopathies (i.e. aortic aneurysms, aortic dissection) which share a number of risk factors with atherosclerosis, such as inflammation, hyperlipidemia, and hypertension [137], exhibit sexual dimorphism.

In particular, angiotensin II induced abdominal aortic aneurysm (AAA) occurs 4-fold more frequently in men and in male mice compared to females [138,139]. Notably a higher frequency is observed also in women with X monosomy (Turner syndrome), suggesting that the number of X chromosomes modulate the susceptibility to aortopathies.

AlSiraj and colleagues showed that although testosterone promotes angiotensin-induced AAA [139,140], the profiling of the FCG model and XY* models highlighted a key role for sex chromosome complement. The presence of XY chromosomes in mice results in increased inflammatory gene expression pattern in the aorta which contributes to the formation of aneurysm. Interestingly, the administration of testosterone to XYF mice promotes aneurysm rupture, suggesting an influence of gonadal hormones on a phenotype already defined by sex chromosomes [141].

Furthermore, via the use of XY* model it was clarified that it is the increase in the number of X chromosomes that confers resistance to AAAs; X0F mice (which mimic the chromosome setting of the Turner syndrome) develop aortopathies at higher incidences, comparable to XY females and to XYM [142]. This has been correlated with a difference in the expression of genes escaping X-inactivation, including *Kmd5c* and *Kmd6a*, which encodes for histone-modifiers.

6.3. Immune response

While direct testing of the contribution of genetic sex on the immune response during atherogenesis has not been fully explored, it is clear that men and women present differences in the immune response that are independent of sexual hormones. The exact mechanisms explaining these differences are still elusive [143,144].

Sex-associated differences in the immune system are observed from

pre-puberal age, thus it was initially hypothesized to be independent of gonadal hormones. However, a recent study using the FCG model showed how differences in T cell distribution and thymic T cell egression were correlated with levels of testosterone in the perinatal period, suggesting a regulation dependent on gonadal hormones [145]. In addition, *Sry* gene expression and male gonads development were associated with a reduced response to delayed-type hypersensitivity and the number of cells in the draining lymph nodes [146].

On the other hand, the use of the FCG model led to characterize sexdetermined susceptibility to some autoimmune diseases. XX chromosomes in comparison to XY are associated with a greater susceptibility to experimental autoimmune encephalomyelitis (EAE) and lupus erythematosus [147,148]. Further studies conducted with the use of the FCG model pointed out that *Kdm6a*, a gene on the X chromosome escaping the inactivation, might be a key determinant of these differences. A lower expression of this gene, which is observed physiologically in male mice compared to female, improves the disease pathology in the CD4⁺ T cell-mediated autoimmune EAE [149].

Immune system development and activation are therefore conditioned by both gonadal hormones and epigenetic mechanism driven by genetic sex.

7. Concluding remarks

The increasing awareness about the importance of experimental research for addressing molecular differences in atherogenesis between men and women, is improving our understanding of the role of hormones and sex chromosomes in cardiovascular risk and incidence. This information should help first to better stratify cardiovascular risk according to sex and age, second to clarify which women will benefit more from hormone replacement therapy in post-menopause, and third to explore whether gender-affirming hormone-based therapy in transgender individuals might differently affect their cardiovascular risk (Fig. 3).

Declaration of competing interest

The authors declare that they have no known competing financial interests or personal relationships that could have appeared to influence the work reported in this paper.

Acknowledgments

This work was supported by: Telethon Foundation (GGP19146 to GDN); Progetti di Rilevante Interesse Nazionale (PRIN 2017 K55HLC to GDN); Ricerca Finalizzata, Ministry of Health (RF-2019-12370896 to GDN); PNRR Missione 4 (Progetto CN3 - National Center for Gene Therapy and Drugs based on RNA Technology to GDN); PNRR Missione 4 (Progetto MUSA- Multilayered Urban Sustainability Action to GDN); PNRR Missione 6 (PNRR-MAD-2022-12375913 to GDN); Cariplo Foundation (1560–2019); Roche Foundation to FB and EUROPEAID 173691/DD/ACT/XK "Nanokos". All figures were created with Biorender.com.

References

- L. Groban, S.H. Lindsey, hAO. Wang, A.K. Alencar, Sex and gender differences in cardiovascular disease, in: S. Oertelt-Prigione, vERA) Regitz-Zagrosek (Eds.), 61–87 (Sex Differences in Physiology, 2016.
- [2] D.J. Lerner, W.B. Kannel, Patterns of coronary heart disease morbidity and mortality in the sexes: a 26-year follow-up of the Framingham population, Am. Heart J. 111 (1986) 383–390.
- [3] K.A. Matthews, L.H. Kuller, K. Sutton-Tyrrell, Y.F. Chang, Changes in cardiovascular risk factors during the perimenopause and postmenopause and carotid artery atherosclerosis in healthy women, Stroke 32 (2001) 1104–1110.
- Y. Li, et al., Association of menopause with risk of carotid artery atherosclerosis, Maturitas 143 (2021) 171–177.
- [5] J. Shin, et al., Age at menopause and risk of heart failure and atrial fibrillation: a nationwide cohort study, Eur. Heart J. 43 (2022) 4148–4157.

- [6] H. Ji, et al., Sex differences in myocardial and vascular aging, Circ. Res. 130 (2022) 566–577.
- [7] S.C.A. de Jager, et al., Preeclampsia and coronary plaque erosion: manifestations of endothelial dysfunction resulting in cardiovascular events in women, Eur. J. Pharmacol. 816 (2017) 129–137.
- [8] Y. Sato, et al., Sex differences in coronary atherosclerosis, Current Atherosclerosis Reports vol. 24 23–32 Preprint at, https://doi.org/10.1007/s11883-022 -00980-5, 2022.
- [9] R.J.G. Hartman, et al., Sex-stratified gene regulatory networks reveal female key driver genes of atherosclerosis involved in smooth muscle cell phenotype switching, Circulation 143 (2021) 713–726.
- [10] F.D. Ramirez, B. Hibbert, Letter by ramirez and hibbert regarding article, 'consideration of sex differences in design and reporting of experimental arterial pathology studies: a statement from the arteriosclerosis, thrombosis, and vascular biology council', Arterioscler. Thromb. Vasc. Biol. 38 e99 (2018) https://doi.org/ 10.1161/ATVBAHA.118.310942. -e100 Preprint at.
- [11] H.S. Lu, et al., Reporting sex and sex differences in preclinical studies, Arterioscler. Thromb. Vasc. Biol. 38 (2018) E174–E184.
- [12] H.S. Lu, et al., Annual report on sex in preclinical studies arteriosclerosis, thrombosis, and vascular biology publications in 2018, Arterioscler. Thromb. Vasc. Biol. 40 (2020) E1–E9.
- [13] L.R. Miller, et al., Considering sex as a biological variable in preclinical research, FASEB (Fed. Am. Soc. Exp. Biol.) J. 31 (2017) 29–34.
- [14] J.J. Man, J.A. Beckman, I.Z. Jaffe, Sex as a biological variable in atherosclerosis, Circ. Res. (2020) 1297–1319, https://doi.org/10.1161/ CIRCRESAHA.120.315930.
- [15] K. Howe, et al., The zebrafish reference genome sequence and its relationship to the human genome, Nature 496 (2013) 498–503.
- [16] K. Stoletov, et al., Vascular lipid accumulation, lipoprotein oxidation, and macrophage lipid uptake in hypercholesterolemic zebrafish, Circ. Res. 104 (2009) 952–960
- [17] C. Liu, et al., Modeling hypercholesterolemia and vascular lipid accumulation in LDL receptor mutant zebrafish, J. Lipid Res. 59 (2018) 391–399.
- [18] W.C. Liew, L. Orbán, Zebrafish sex: a complicated affair, Brief Funct Genomics 13 (2014) 172–187.
- [19] S.L.J. Lee, J.A. Horsfield, M.A. Black, K. Rutherford, N.J. Gemmell, Identification of sex differences in zebrafish (Danio rerio) brains during early sexual differentiation and masculinization using 17α-methyltestoterone, Biol. Reprod. 99 (2018) 446–460.
- [20] A. Gisterå, D.F.J. Ketelhuth, S.G. Malin, G.K. Hansson, Animal models of atherosclerosis-supportive notes and tricks of the trade, Circ. Res. 130 (2022), https://doi.org/10.1161/CIRCRESAHA.122.320263, 1869–1887 Preprint at.
- [21] T.E. Hamm, J.R. Kaplan, T.B. Clarkson, B.C. Bullock, Effects of Gender and Social Behavior on the Development of Coronary Artery Atherosclerosis in Cynomolgus Macaques. Atherosclerosis, vol. 48, 1983.
- [22] Adams, M. R., Kaplan, J. R., Clarkson, T. B. & Koritnik, D. R. Ovariectomy, Social Status, and Atherosclerosis in Cynomolgus Monkeys. http://ahajournals.org.
- [23] J.R. Kaplan, S.B. Manuck, T.B. Clarkson, F.M. Lusso, D.M. Taub, Social status, environment, and atherosclerosis in cynomolgus monkeys, Arteriosclerosis 2 (1982) 359–368.
- [24] J.R. Kaplan, T.B. Clarkson, J.R. Kaplan, T.B. Clarkson, Social instability and coronary artery atherosclerosis in cynomolgus monkeys I, Neurosci. Biobehav. Rev. 7 (1983).
- [25] C.A. Shively, T.C. Register, T.B. Clarkson, Social stress, visceral obesity, and coronary artery atherosclerosis in female primates, Obesity 17 (2009) 1513–1520
- [26] Y. Kobari, M. Koto, M. Tanigawa, Regression of Diet-Induced Atherosclerosis in Gottingen Miniature Swine, vol. 25, Laboratory Animals, 1991.
- [27] R.H. Al-Mashhadi, et al., Familial hypercholesterolemia and atherosclerosis in cloned minipigs created by DNA transposition of a human PCSK9 gain-of-function mutant. www.ScienceTranslationalMedicine.org.
- [28] L. Jacobsson, Comparison of experimental hypercholesterolemia and atherosclerosis in male and female mini-pigs of the Göttingen strain, Artery 16 (1989) 105–117.
- [29] J.T. Shim, et al., Effects of castration on atherosclerosis in Yucatan minipigs with genetic hypercholesterolemia, PLoS One 15 (2020).
- [30] W. Shi, et al., Determinants of Atherosclerosis Susceptibility in the C3H and C57BL/6 Mouse Model Evidence for Involvement of Endothelial Cells but Not Blood Cells or Cholesterol Metabolism, 2000. http://www.circresaha.org.
- [31] X. Yang, et al., Identification and validation of genes affecting aortic lesions in mice, J. Clin. Invest. 120 (2010) 2414–2422.
- [32] V.L. Vedder, Z. Aherrahrou, J. Erdmann, Dare to compare. Development of atherosclerotic lesions in human, mouse, and zebrafish, Frontiers in Cardiovascular Medicine 7 (2020), https://doi.org/10.3389/fcvm.2020.00109. Preprint at.
- [33] G.S. Getz, C.A. Reardon, in: Atherosclerosis, D. Ramji (Eds.), Pig and Mouse Models of Hyperlipidemia and Atherosclerosis, Springer, 2022, https://doi.org/ 10.1007/978-1-0716-1924-7_24.
- [34] B.J. North, D.A. Sinclair, The intersection between aging and cardiovascular disease, Circ. Res. 110 (2012) 1097–1108.
- [35] M. Abdellatif, P.P. Rainer, S. Sedej, G. Kroemer, Hallmarks of cardiovascular ageing, Nat. Rev. Cardiol. (2023), https://doi.org/10.1038/s41569-023-00881-3.
- [36] E. Barrett-Connor, T.L. Bush, Estrogen and coronary heart disease in women, JAMA 265 (1991). http://jama.jamanetwork.com/.
- [37] B.K. Jacobsen, S. Nils~en, I. Heudq3, G. K&de4, Does Age at Natural Menopause Affect Mortality from Ischemic Heart Disease? J Cl i n Epidemiol 50 (1997).

- [38] Y.T. Van Der Schouw, Y. Van Der Graaf, W. Steyerberg, J.C. Eijkemans, J. D. Banga, Age at menopause as a risk factor for cardiovascular mortality, Lancet (1996), https://doi.org/10.1016/s0140-6736(96)90075-6.
- [39] O. Joakimsen, K.H. Bønaa, E. Stensland-Bugge, B.K. Jacobsen, Population-based study of age at menopause and ultrasound assessed carotid atherosclerosis the Tromsø Study, J. Clin. Epidemiol. 53 (2000).
- [40] R.K. Dubey, B. Imthurn, L.C. Zacharia, E.K. Jackson, Hormone replacement therapy and cardiovascular disease: what went wrong and where do we go from here? Hypertension 44 789 (2004) https://doi.org/10.1161/01. HYP.0000145988.95551.28, 795 Preprint at.
- [41] J.A.E. Manson, et al., Menopausal hormone therapy and health outcomes during the intervention and extended poststopping phases of the women's health initiative randomized trials, JAMA 310 (2013) 1353–1368.
- [42] H.N. Hodis, et al., Vascular effects of early versus late postmenopausal treatment with estradiol, N. Engl. J. Med. 374 (2016) 1221–1231.
- [43] J.B. Hodgin, N. Maeda, Minireview: estrogen and mouse models of atherosclerosis, Endocrinology 143 4495 (2002), https://doi.org/10.1210/ en.2002-220844, 4501 Preprint at.
- [44] S.H. Zuckerman, G.F. Evans, J.A. Schelm, P.I. Eacho, G. Sandusky, Estrogenmediated increases in LDL cholesterol and foam cell-containing lesions in human ApoB100CETP transgenic mice, Arterioscler. Thromb. Vasc. Biol. 19 (1999). htt p://www.atvbaha.org.
- [45] P.-A.K. Bourassa, P.M. Milost, B.J. Gaynor, J.L. Breslowt, R.J. Aiello, Estrogen reduces atherosclerotic lesion development in apolipoprotein E-deficient mice, Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. USA 93 (1996) 10022–10027.
- [46] L. Nathan, et al., Testosterone inhibits early atherogenesis by conversion to estradiol: critical role of aromatase, Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. USA 98 (2001), 35893593.
- [47] R. Aherrahrou, et al., CYP17A1 deficient XY mice display susceptibility to atherosclerosis, altered lipidomic profile and atypical sex development, Sci. Rep. 10 (2020).
- $\label{eq:alpha} \begin{array}{l} \mbox{[48]} A.C. \mbox{ Villablanca, et al., $17$$$$$$$$$$$$$$$$-estradiol prevents early-stage atherosclerosis in estrogen receptor-alpha deficient female mice, J Cardiovasc Transl Res 2 (2009) 289–299. \end{array}$
- [49] L.M. Seegers, et al., Sex differences in culprit plaque characteristics among different age groups in patients with acute coronary syndromes, Circ. Cardiovasc. Interv. 15 (2022), E011612.
- [50] Y. Kataoka, et al., Sex differences in nonculprit coronary plaque microstructures on frequency-domain optical coherence tomography in acute coronary syndromes and stable coronary artery disease, Circ. Cardiovasc. Imaging 9 8 (2016).
- [51] P.L.M. Kerkhof, F. Tona, Sex differences in diagnostic modalities of atherosclerosis in the macrocirculation, Atherosclerosis 384 (2023), 117275.
- [52] F.L. Gurgoglione, E. Solinas, B. Pfleiderer, A. Vezzani, G. Niccoli, Coronary atherosclerotic plaque phenotype and physiopathologic mechanisms: is there an influence of sex? Insights from intracoronary imaging, Atherosclerosis 384 (2023), 117273.
- [53] T.R. Sakkers, M. Mokry, M. Civelek, J. Erdmann, G. Pasterkamp, E. Diez Benavente, H.M. den Ruijter, Sex differences in the genetic and molecular mechanisms of coronary artery disease, Atherosclerosis 384 (2023), 117279.
- [54] J. Robert, Sex differences in vascular endothelial cells, Atherosclerosis 384 (2023), 117278.
- [55] L.R. Nelson, S.E. Bulun, Estrogen production and action, J. Am. Acad. Dermatol. 45 (2001) S116–S124.
- [56] E.R. Simpson, Sources of estrogen and their importance, J. Steroid Biochem. Mol. Biol. 86 (2003) 225–230.
- [57] S. Green, et al., Human oestrogen receptor cDNA: sequence, expression and homology to v-erb-A, Nature 320 (1986) 134–139.
- [58] G.G.J.M. Kuiper, et al., Cloning of a novel estrogen receptor expressed in rat prostate and ovary PCR-Amplification and Complementary DNA Cloning 93 (1996).
- [59] I. Paterni, C. Granchi, J.A. Katzenellenbogen, F. Minutolo, Estrogen receptors alpha (ERα) and beta (ERβ): subtype-selective ligands and clinical potential, Steroids 90 13 (2014), https://doi.org/10.1016/j.steroids.2014.06.012. -29 Preprint at.
- [60] Y. Zhu, et al., Abnormal vascular function and hypertension in mice deficient in estrogen receptor β, Science 295 (1979) 505–508, 2002.
- [61] L. Aryan, et al., The role of estrogen receptors in cardiovascular disease, Int. J. Mol. Sci. (2020), https://doi.org/10.3390/ijms21124314, 21 1–26 Preprint at.
- [62] J.B. Hodgin, et al., Estrogen receptor α is a major mediator of 17 β -estradiol's atheroprotective effects on lesion size in Apoe-/- mice, J. Clin. Invest. 107 (2001) 333–340.
- [63] R.H. Karas, et al., Estrogen inhibits the vascular injury response in estrogen receptor-deficient female mice, Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. USA 96 (1999). www.pnas. org.
- [64] V. Lindner, et al., Increased expression of estrogen receptor-mRNA in male blood vessels after vascular injury, Circ. Res. 83 (1998) 224–229.
- [65] C. Villard, et al., Differential expression of sex hormone receptors in abdominal aortic aneurysms, Maturitas 96 (2017) 39–44.
- [66] R. O'Lone, et al., Estrogen receptors α and β mediate distinct pathways of vascular gene expression, including genes involved in mitochondrial electron transport and generation of reactive oxygen species, Mol. Endocrinol. 21 (2007) 1281–1296.
- [67] C.E. Ihionkhan, et al., Estrogen causes dynamic alterations in endothelial estrogen receptor expression, Circ. Res. 91 (2002) 814–820.
- [68] K.M. Gavin, D.R. Seals, A.E. Silver, K.L. Moreau, Vascular endothelial estrogen receptor α is modulated by estrogen status and related to endothelial function and

Atherosclerosis 384 (2023) 117277

endothelial nitric oxide synthase in healthy women, J. Clin. Endocrinol. Metab. 94 (2009) 3513–3520.

- [69] S. Stork, K. Baumann, C. Von Schacky, P. Angerer, A. Angerer, The effect of 17bestradiol on MCP-1 serum levels in postmenopausal women, Cardiovasc. Res. 53 (2002). www.elsevier.com/locate/cardiores.
- [70] K.E. Kip, et al., Global inflammation predicts cardiovascular risk in women: a report from the Women's Ischemia Syndrome Evaluation (WISE) study, Am. Heart J. 150 (2005) 900–906.
- [71] H. Sumino, et al., Effect of transdermal hormone replacement therapy on the monocyte chemoattractant protein-1 concentrations and other vascular inflammatory markers and on endothelial function in postmenopausal women, Am. J. Cardiol. 96 (2005) 148–153.
- [72] L. Novensà, et al., Aging negatively affects estrogens-mediated effects on nitric oxide bioavailability by shifting ERα/ERβ balance in female mice, PLoS One 6 (2011).
- [73] J. Kim, et al., Epigenetic changes in estrogen receptor β gene in atherosclerotic cardiovascular tissues and in-vitro vascular senescence, Biochim. Biophys. Acta, Mol. Basis Dis. 1772 (2007) 72–80.
- [74] L. Sunday, M. Minh Tran, D.N. Krause, S.P. Duckles, Estrogen and progestagens differentially modulate vascular proin-flammatory factors, Am. J. Physiol. Endocrinol. Metab. 291 (2006) 261–267.
- [75] S. Störk, Y.T. Van Der Schouw, D.E. Grobbee, M.L. Bots, Estrogen, inflammation and cardiovascular risk in women: a critical appraisal, Trends Endocrinol. Metabol. 15 66 (2004), https://doi.org/10.1016/j.tem.2004.01.005. –72 Preprint at.
- [76] K.K. Koh, B.K. Yoon, Controversies regarding hormone therapy: insights from inflammation and hemostasis, Cardiovasc. Res. 70 22 (2006), https://doi.org/ 10.1016/j.cardiores.2005.12.004. –30 Preprint at.
- [77] E. Allen, The oestrus cycle in the mouse, Am. J. Anat. 30 (3) (1922) 297–371.
- [78] C.S. Caligioni, Assessing reproductive status/stages in mice, Curr Protoc Neurosci Appendix 4 (2009).
- [79] M.N. Kehmeier, et al., In vivo arterial stiffness, but not isolated artery endothelial function, varies with the mouse estrous cycle, Am. J. Physiol. Heart Circ. Physiol. 323 (2022) H1057–H1067.
- [80] Y. Zhou, et al., A multi-tissue transcriptomic landscape of female mice in estrus and diestrus provides clues for precision medicine, Front. Cell Dev. Biol. 10 (2022), 983712.
- [81] C.M. Revankar, D.F. Cimino, L.A. Sklar, J.B. Arterburn, E.R. Prossnitz, A transmembrane intracellular estrogen receptor mediates rapid cell signaling, Science 307 (1979) 1625–1630, 2005.
- [82] M.R. Meyer, et al., G protein-coupled estrogen receptor protects from atherosclerosis. Sci. Rep. 4 (2014).
- [83] P. Ciana, et al., In vivo imaging of transcriptionally active estrogen receptors, Nat. Med. 9 (2003) 82–86.
- [84] Y. Zhang, et al., Transcriptional profiling of human liver identifies sex-biased genes associated with polygenic dyslipidemia and coronary artery disease, PLoS One 6 (2011).
- [85] B.W. Parks, et al., Genetic architecture of insulin resistance in the mouse, Cell Metabol. 21 (2015) 334–347.
- [86] H. Gao, S. Fält, A. Sandelin, J.Å. Gustafsson, K. Dahlman-Wright, Genome-wide identification of estrogen receptor α-binding sites in mouse liver, Mol. Endocrinol. 22 (2008) 10–22.
- [87] B.T. Palmisano, L. Zhu, J.M. Stafford, Role of estrogens in the regulation of liver lipid metabolism, in: Advances in Experimental Medicine and Biology, 1043 vols. 227–256, Springer New York LLC, 2017.
- [88] S. Della Torre, Non-alcoholic fatty liver disease as a canonical example of metabolic inflammatory-based liver disease showing a sex-specific prevalence: relevance of estrogen signaling, Front. Endocrinol. 11 (2020), https://doi.org/ 10.3389/fendo.2020.572490. Preprint at.
- [89] L. Fernández-Pérez, B. Guerra, J.C. Díaz-Chico, A. Flores-Morales, Estrogens regulate the hepatic effects of growth hormone, a hormonal interplay with multiple fates, Front. Endocrinol. 4 (2013), https://doi.org/10.3389/ fendo.2013.00066. Preprint at.
- [90] T.M. D'Eon, et al., Estrogen regulation of adiposity and fuel partitioning: evidence of genomic and non-genomic regulation of lipogenic and oxidative pathways, J. Biol. Chem. 280 (2005) 35983–35991.
- [91] S. Della Torre, V. Benedusi, R. Fontana, A. Maggi, Energy metabolism and fertility - a balance preserved for female health, Nat. Rev. Endocrinol. (2014), https://doi. org/10.1038/nrendo.2013.203 hgPreprint at.
- [92] S. Hart-Unger, et al., Hormone signaling and fatty liver in females: analysis of estrogen receptor α mutant mice, Int. J. Obes. 41 (2017) 945–954.
- [93] L. Zhu, M.N. Martinez, C.H. Emfinger, B.T. Palmisano, J.M. Stafford, Estrogen signaling prevents diet-induced hepatic insulin resistance in male mice with obesity, Am. J. Physiol. Endocrinol. Metab. 306 (2014) 1188–1197.
- [94] G. Bryzgalova, et al., Evidence that oestrogen receptor-α plays an important role in the regulation of glucose homeostasis in mice: insulin sensitivity in the liver, Diabetologia 49 (2006) 588–597.
- [95] S. Della Torre, A. Maggi, Sex differences: a resultant of an evolutionary pressure? Cell Metabol. 25 499 (2017) https://doi.org/10.1016/j.cmet.2017.01.006, 505 Preprint at.
- [96] S.T. Ngo, F.J. Steyn, P.A. McCombe, Gender differences in autoimmune disease, Front. Neuroendocrinol. 35 (2014) 347–369, https://doi.org/10.1016/j. yfrne.2014.04.004. Preprint at.
- [97] S.L. Klein, K.L. Flanagan, Sex differences in immune responses, Nat. Rev. Immunol. 16 (2016) 626–638, https://doi.org/10.1038/nri.2016.90. Preprint at.

- [98] R. Deshpande, H. Khalili, R.G. Pergolizzi, S.D. Michael, M.D.Y. Chang, Estradiol down-regulates LPS-induced cytokine production and NFkB activation in murine macrophages, Am. J. Reprod. Immunol. 38 (1997) 46–54.
- [99] M. Lake Polan, et al., Progesterone and estradiol modulate interleukin-1/3 messenger ribonucleic acid levels in cultured human peripheral monocytes*, J. Clin. Endocrinol. Metabolis. Copyright© 89 (1989).
- [100] S. Pervin, et al., Estradiol suppresses MCP-1 expression in vivo implications for atherosclerosis, Arterioscler. Thromb. Vasc. Biol. 18 (1998). http://ahajournals. org.
- [101] A. Dama, C. Baggio, C. Boscaro, M. Albiero, A. Cignarella, Estrogen receptor functions and pathways at the vascular immune interface, Int. J. Mol. Sci. 22 (2021), https://doi.org/10.3390/ijms22084254. Preprint at.
- [102] V. Ribas, et al., Myeloid-specific estrogen receptor α deficiency impairs metabolic homeostasis and accelerates atherosclerotic lesion development, Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. U. S. A. 108 (2011) 16457–16462.
- [103] A. Toniolo, et al., Alternative activation of human macrophages is rescued by estrogen treatment in vitro and impaired by menopausal status, J. Clin. Endocrinol. Metab. 100 (2015) E50–E58.
- [104] C. Bolego, A. Cignarella, B. Staels, G. Chinetti-Gbaguidi, Macrophage function and polarization in cardiovascular disease: a role of estrogen signaling? Arterioscler. Thromb. Vasc. Biol. 33 (2013) 1127–1134.
- [105] S. lin Liu, et al., Cardiovascular protection in females linked to estrogendependent inhibition of arterial stiffening and macrophage MMP12, JCI Insight 4 (2019) 1–11.
- [106] F. Aguet, et al., The impact of sex on gene expression across human tissues, Science 369 (1979), 2020.
- [107] J.M. Eales, et al., Human Y chromosome exerts pleiotropic effects on susceptibility to atherosclerosis, Arterioscler. Thromb. Vasc. Biol. 39 (2019) 2386–2401.
- [108] F.J. Charchar, et al., Inheritance of coronary artery disease in men: an analysis of the role of the Y chromosome 379 (2012) 915–937.
- [109] M.S. Irwig, Cardiovascular health in transgender people, Rev. Endocr. Metab. Disord. 19 (2018) 243–251, https://doi.org/10.1007/s11154-018-9454-3. Preprint at.
- [110] D.M. Van Velzen, et al., Cardiometabolic effects of testosterone in transmen and estrogen plus cyproterone acetate in transwomen, J. Clin. Endocrinol. Metab. 104 (2019) 1937–1947.
- [111] C.N. Murphy, C. Delles, E. Davies, P.J. Connelly, Cardiovascular disease in transgender individuals, Atherosclerosis 384 (2023), 117282.
- [112] C. Cocchetti, et al., Does gender-affirming hormonal treatment affect 30-year cardiovascular risk in transgender persons? A two-year prospective European study (ENIGI), J. Sex. Med. 18 (2021) 821–829.
- [113] M.H. Schutte, et al., The effect of transdermal gender-affirming hormone therapy on markers of inflammation and hemostasis, PLoS One 17 (2022).
- [114] D.M. van Velzen, et al., The effect of transgender hormonal treatment on high density lipoprotein cholesterol efflux capacity, Atherosclerosis 323 (2021) 44–53.
- [115] D. Pasquali, et al., Cardiovascular abnormalities in Klinefelter syndrome, Int. J. Cardiol. 168 (2013) 754–759.
- [116] M. Silberbach, et al., Cardiovascular health in turner syndrome: a scientific statement from the American Heart Association, Circulation: Genomic and precision medicine 11 (2018), e000048. Preprint at, https://doi.org/10.1161/H CG.0000000000000048.
- [117] C. Mameli, et al., Metabolic and nutritional aspects in paediatric patients with klinefelter syndrome: a narrative review, Nutrients vol. 14 Preprint at, https ://doi.org/10.3390/nu14102107, 2022.
- [118] A. Bojesen, et al., The metabolic syndrome is frequent in Klinefelter's syndrome and is associated with abdominal obesity and hypogonadism, Diabetes Care 29 (2006) 1591–1598.
- [119] C.H. Gravholt, S. Juul, R. Weis Naeraa, J. Hansen, Morbidity in turner syndrome, J. Clin. Epidemiol. 51 (1998).
- [120] J.E. Ostberg, et al., Vasculopathy in Turner syndrome: arterial dilatation and intimal thickening without endothelial dysfunction, J. Clin. Endocrinol. Metab. 90 (2005) 5161–5166.
- [121] K. Sandahl, J. Wen, M. Erlandsen, N.H. Andersen, C.H. Gravholt, Natural history of hypertension in turner syndrome during a 12-year pragmatic interventional study, Hypertension 76 (2020) 1608–1615.
- [122] S. Haitjema, et al., Loss of y chromosome in blood is associated with major cardiovascular events during follow-up in men after carotid endarterectomy, Circ Cardiovasc Genet 10 (2017).
- [123] S. Mas-Peiro, et al., Mosaic loss of Y chromosome in monocytes is associated with lower survival after transcatheter aortic valve replacement, Eur. Heart J. (2023), https://doi.org/10.1093/eurheartj/ehad093.
- [124] S. Sano, et al., Hematopoietic loss of Y chromosome leads to cardiac fibrosis and heart failure mortality, Science 377 (1979) 292–297, 2022.
- [125] A. Lomniczi, et al., Epigenetic control of female puberty, 3 16, Nat. Neurosci. 16 (2013) 281–289, 2013.
- [126] G.J. De Vries, et al., A Model System for Study of Sex Chromosome Effects on Sexually Dimorphic Neural and Behavioral Traits, 2002.
- [127] S. Yanai, et al., Gene expression and functional abnormalities in XX/Sry Leydig cells, Sci. Rep. 11 (2021).
- [128] C.J. Brown, J.M. Greally, A stain upon the silence: genes escaping X inactivation, Trends Genet. 19 (2003) 432–438, https://doi.org/10.1016/S0168-9525(03) 00177-X. Preprint at.
- [129] K. Reue, C.B. Wiese, Illuminating the mechanisms underlying sex differences in cardiovascular disease, Circ. Res. 130 (2022) 1747–1762.

Atherosclerosis 384 (2023) 117277

- [130] Y. AlSiraj, et al., XX sex chromosome complement promotes atherosclerosis in mice, Nat. Commun. 10 (2019).
- [131] E.M. Eicher, et al., The mouse Y* chromosome involves a complex rearrangement, including interstitial positioning of the pseudoautosomal region, Cytogenet. Cell Genet. (1991) 221–230.
- [132] P.S. Burgoyne, A.P. Arnold, A primer on the use of mouse models for identifying direct sex chromosome effects that cause sex differences in non-gonadal tissues, Biol. Sex Differ. (2016), https://doi.org/10.1186/s13293-016-0115-5, 7 1–21 Preprint at.
- [133] X. Chen, et al., The number of X chromosomes causes sex differences in adiposity in mice, PLoS Genet. 8 (2012).
- [134] T. Zore, M. Palafox, K. Reue, Sex differences in obesity, lipid metabolism, and inflammation—a role for the sex chromosomes? Mol. Metabol. (2018) https:// doi.org/10.1016/j.molmet.2018.04.003, 15 35–44 Preprint at.
- [135] D.A. Salisbury, et al., Transcriptional regulation of N 6-methyladenosine orchestrates sex-dimorphic metabolic traits, Nat. Metab. 3 (2021) 940–953.
- [136] J.C. Link, et al., Increased high-density lipoprotein cholesterol levels in mice with XX versus XY sex chromosomes, Arterioscler. Thromb. Vasc. Biol. 35 (2015) 1778–1786.
- [137] P. Lacolley, V. Regnault, A. Nicoletti, Z. Li, J.B. Michel, Aortic aneurysm in defense of the vascular smooth muscle cell, Cardiovasc. Res. 95 (2012) 194–204.
- [138] K. Singh, et al., Prevalence of and Risk Factors for Abdominal Aortic Aneurysms in a Population-based Study The Tromsø Study 154 (2001). https://academic.oup. com/aje/article/154/3/236/125840.
- [139] T.A. Henriques, J. Huang, S.S. D'Souza, A. Daugherty, L.A. Cassis, Orchidectomy, but not ovariectomy, regulates angiotensin II-induced vascular diseases in apolipoprotein E-deficient mice, Endocrinology 145 (2004) 3866–3872.

- [140] T. Henriques, X. Zhang, F.B. Yiannikouris, A. Daugherty, L.A. Cassis, Androgen increases AT1a receptor expression in abdominal aortas to promote angiotensin II-induced AAAs in apolipoprotein E-deficient mice, Arterioscler. Thromb. Vasc. Biol. 28 (2008) 1251–1256.
- [141] Y. Alsiraj, et al., Female mice with an XY sex chromosome complement develop severe Angiotensin II-induced abdominal aortic aneurysms, Circulation 135 (2017) 379–391.
- [142] Y. Al Siraj, et al., Monosomy X in female mice influences the regional formation and augments the severity of angiotensin II-induced aortopathies, Arterioscler. Thromb. Vasc. Biol. 41 (2021) 269–283.
- [143] C. Libert, L. Dejager, I. Pinheiro, The X chromosome in immune functions: when a chromosome makes the difference, Nat. Rev. Immunol. 10 (2010) 594–604, https://doi.org/10.1038/nri2815. Preprint at.
- [144] K.M. Palaszynski, et al., A yin-yang effect between sex chromosome complement and sex hormones on the immune response, Endocrinology 146 (2005) 3280–3285.
- [145] M.K. Ghosh, et al., Sex differences in the immune system become evident in the perinatal period in the four core genotypes mouse, Front. Endocrinol. 12 (2021).
- [146] R. Dill-Garlow, K.H.E. Chen, A.M. Walker, Sex differences in mouse popliteal lymph nodes, Sci. Rep. 9 (2019).
- [147] M.V. Sasidhar, N. Itoh, S.M. Gold, G.W. Lawson, R.R. Voskuhl, The XX sex chromosome complement in mice is associated with increased spontaneous lupus compared with XY, Ann. Rheum. Dis. 71 (2012) 1418–1422.
- [148] D.L. Smith-Bouvier, et al., A role for sex chromosome complement in the female bias in autoimmune disease, J. Exp. Med. 205 (2008) 1099–1108.
- [149] Y. Itoh, et al., The X-linked histone demethylase Kdm6a in CD4+ T lymphocytes modulates autoimmunity, J. Clin. Invest. 129 (2019) 3852–3863.