

SHORT REPORT

**The introduction of subsidies for grassland conservation in the Italian Alps  
coincided with population decline in a threatened grassland species, the  
Corncrake *Crex crex***

MATTIA BRAMBILLA\* and PAOLO PEDRINI

Museo delle Scienze, Sezione Zoologia dei Vertebrati, Via Calepina 14, I-38122 Trento, Italy

\*Correspondence:

Mattia Brambilla

Museo delle Scienze, Sezione Zoologia dei Vertebrati,

Via Calepina 14, I-38122 Trento, Italy.

E-mail: [brambilla.mattia@gmail.com](mailto:brambilla.mattia@gmail.com)

Phone number: +390280616140; Fax number: +390280616180

**Running head:** *Agricultural subsidies and Corncrake decline*

**Keywords:** distribution - farmland bird - grassland management - population trend - TRIM -  
within-season shift

1 **Capsule** We analysed Corncrake population trends between 1997 and 2012 and evaluated changes  
2 before and after the introduction of subsidies for grassland conservation in 2000, which indirectly  
3 promoted unfavourable mowing practices over most grasslands in Trento province. According to  
4 both early and late season counts, the species has significantly declined in the study area since the  
5 early 2000s. Agri-environmental subsidies that are not adapted to the ecological requirements of the  
6 species may fail to achieve conservation objectives.

7

8

9 Agri-environmental schemes are likely to be the most important strategy to conserve biodiversity in  
10 farmed areas. Frequently they provide benefits to wild species (Davey *et al.* 2010b), but often the  
11 design of such schemes has not been based on their potential effects on biodiversity, which may  
12 result in only partial benefits, or even negative effects on many species (Kleijn & Sutherland 2003,  
13 Birrer *et al.* 2007, Davey *et al.* 2010a), including some of conservation concern (Kleijn *et al.* 2006).  
14 Agri-environmental schemes may not be sufficiently tuned to the ecological requirements of species  
15 (Kleijn *et al.* 2004), and often fail to enhance population trends (O'Brien & Wilson 2011, Princé *et*  
16 *al.* 2012). Reasons for lack of effects include a focus on small spatial scales, a lack of coordination  
17 among farmers at the landscape scale and restricted temporal scales (Siriwardena 2010).

18 In western Europe, permanent grassland represents one of the most biologically-rich  
19 agricultural habitats. Grasslands are vanishing in many areas because they have become financially  
20 less attractive; in particular, low-intensity farmed grassland is becoming increasingly rare  
21 (Ostermann 1998, Debussche *et al.* 1999, Donald *et al.* 2001, Vickery *et al.* 2001, Donald *et al.*  
22 2002, Romero-Calcerrada & Perry 2004, Brambilla *et al.* 2010, Nikolov 2010). To counteract the  
23 decline, subsidies for grassland maintenance have been made available to farmers in the Rural  
24 Development Programme of many European countries and regions. In many cases, subsidies just  
25 focus on maintaining grazing or mowing of grasslands, whereas they do not take into account the  
26 ecological needs of the species relying on grasslands and details on management at different  
27 temporal and spatial scales are lacking.

28 Here, we focus on the population trend of Corncrakes *Crex crex*, and on its relationship with  
29 the introduction of subsidies for grassland conservation in Trento province in the Italian Alps. The  
30 Corncrake is a threatened species tied to grasslands, and especially to tall swards and to low  
31 intensity management regimes (Berg & Gustafson 2007). We assessed the effect of a non-targeted  
32 subsidy for grassland conservation on the population of this priority species.

33 We separately considered early and late counts because within-season habitat and  
34 distribution (from low to high elevation) shifts (Brambilla & Rubolini 2009, Gilroy *et al.* 2010,

35 Brambilla & Pedrini 2011, Brambilla *et al.* 2012), which can affect the estimation of population  
36 trends (Pedrini *et al.* 2012). We expected an almost immediate effect of changes in mowing  
37 practices introduced by subsidies on the population trend for late season data, and a weaker or  
38 delayed effect for early season data. This is because grassland mowing takes place in the middle of  
39 the breeding season, and so Corncrake abundance in the late season will be affected by changed  
40 mowing regimes in the first year, whereas effects on early season abundance will not be seen until  
41 at least the following year.

42 Trento province covers 6206 km<sup>2</sup> in the central-eastern part of northern Italy. Elevation  
43 ranges between 67 and 3769 m asl; 30% of the land is below 1000 m, and 50% between 1000 and  
44 2000 m. The landscape is characterized by intensively cultivated and urbanized valley floors,  
45 mountainsides covered by woodlands interspersed with pastures, vineyards and secondary  
46 (anthropogenic) grasslands, and by alpine habitats at higher elevations (above 2000 m). Rainfall  
47 values range from 700 mm/year to 1500 mm/year (locally higher). Until some decades ago,  
48 grasslands were much more widespread, but underwent a drastic reduction (from 39 000 ha in 1982  
49 to 29 000 ha in 2000; source: Trento province, Agriculture Department).

50 Subsidies for grassland conservation were introduced within the Rural Development  
51 Programme of the Trento province in 2000, and they were used to maintain 14 000 ha of grassland  
52 between 2000 and 2006; only 40 ha of grassland benefitted from agri-environmental schemes  
53 involving wildlife-friendly practices (low inputs, delayed mowing, unmown marginal strips) over  
54 the same period. In the subsequent Rural Development Programme (2007-2013), the subsidies  
55 continued to be the most adopted action in the province (over more than 20 000 ha), whereas the  
56 newly introduced measures for Corncrake conservation (delayed mowing and conservation of  
57 unmanaged patches) were applied only to 39 ha (Anon. 2010).

58 Within the province, we identified six study areas (including all main occurrence sites for  
59 Corncrakes; Tesino, 479 ha, average elevation 975 m asl; Alta Val di Non, 807 ha, 975 m; Val di  
60 Gresta, 356 ha, 1 175 m; Folgaria, 520 ha, 1 175 m; Andalo, 203 ha, 957 m; Vezzena, 114 ha, 1 401

61 m), all subjected to mowing promoted by the subsidies, although specific data on the extent of the  
62 mowing are not known. Each study area was divided into sectors that were simultaneously censused  
63 by different teams of observers. Calling males were counted by means of crepuscular/nocturnal  
64 surveys (22:30-03:00) in the six areas during 1997-2012, listening to spontaneous vocalizations  
65 every c. 300 m, and using playback (i.e. broadcast calls of males) if no male was singing (one  
66 minute of playback, three minutes of listening, repeated twice). The number of calling males is used  
67 as a population estimate for this (Schäffer 1995, Tyler & Green 1996, Schipper *et al.* 2011) and  
68 other elusive species (Poulin *et al.* 2005, Longoni *et al.* 2011). All areas were visited once in May-  
69 early June, before mowing (which in the study areas takes place around the 15<sup>th</sup> June, with inter-  
70 annual variations), and once in late June-July, after mowing. We avoided rainy and windy days.  
71 Field tests at the beginning of the research revealed how the number of males counted in  
72 consecutive field sessions before mowing was fairly constant, suggesting high vocal activity and  
73 detection rate (P. Pedrini *et al.*, unpublished data), as found for other rallids (Brambilla & Jenkins  
74 2009); previous analyses revealed weak effects of census date within the survey period (Brambilla  
75 & Pedrini 2011). Not all the areas were visited each year; out of 84 cases, early count data were  
76 available for 73 areas/years, and late count data for 60.

77 We used the program TRIM (TRends & Indices for Monitoring data) 3.54 to assess  
78 population trends by means of a generalised estimating equations approach which takes into  
79 account overdispersion and serial correlation (Pannekoek & Van Strien 2001, Soldaat *et al.* 2007,  
80 Ludwig *et al.* 2008). The proportion of missing data within our counts was relatively low  
81 (Pannekoek & Van Strien 2001). We built separate models for early and late counts due to within-  
82 season changes in abundance (see above). The value of the population index was set at 1 in 1997  
83 (first year used as reference). We ran six models: no time effects (counts vary across sites and not  
84 across time-points), time effects (effects for each site and time-point), simple linear trend (constant  
85 increase or decrease), linear trend with stepwise selection of change points (switching trend model  
86 with slope parameter changing at some time points) using default *P*-values (0.15 for entry and 0.2

87 for removal), stepwise selection of change points using more stringent  $P$ -values (0.05 for entry and  
88 0.1 for removal). Then, for each period we selected the most parsimonious model according to the  
89 relative AIC value as calculated by TRIM. Indices calculated according to the “imputed” and  
90 “model” trend (cf. Pannekoek & Van Strien 2001) were identical to the third decimal; the former  
91 ones were shown. Linear trend models with stepwise selection of change points using default  $P$ -  
92 values had by far the lowest AIC values for both periods ( $\Delta AIC > 10$  for all other models in both  
93 periods).

94 In both periods, there was an initial increase, until 2000, followed by a sudden decrease in  
95 the number of calling males (Fig. 1). As expected, the decline in the first years after the introduction  
96 of subsidies was steeper in the late than in the early part of the breeding season. In the early season,  
97 the number of calling males (imputed value  $\pm$  SE) was  $50 \pm 8$  in 1997 and  $24 \pm 5$  in 2012 (-52%; -  
98 65% from 2000 to 2012). The model for the early period included as change points the following  
99 years: 1999, 2000, 2002, 2004, 2005, 2006, 2008, 2010 (all  $P < 0.183$ ). The overall trend ( $\pm$   
100 SE) was equal to  $0.93 \pm 0.01$  and was classified as “Steep decline ( $P < 0.05$ )”. In the late season, the  
101 number of calling males (imputed value  $\pm$  SE) was  $33 \pm 12$  in 1997 and  $20 \pm 7$  in 2012 (-39%; -72%  
102 from 2000 to 2012). The model for the late period included as change points the following years:  
103 1998, 2000, 2006, 2007 (all  $P < 0.065$ ). The overall trend ( $\pm$  SE) was equal to  $0.95 \pm 0.02$  and was  
104 classified as “Moderate decline ( $P < 0.05$ )”.

105 Spatial and temporal scales are a key issue for agri-environmental schemes (Siriwardena  
106 2010), as well as the management of locally significant habitat types (MacMahon *et al.* 2012). For  
107 Corncrakes, spatial and temporal features of grass mowing are crucial: survival of adults, chicks and  
108 nests depend on methods and extent of mowing (Green *et al.* 1997a, Green *et al.* 1997b). Subsidies  
109 for grassland conservation in the Trento province, by encouraging mowing without consideration  
110 for when and where to cut the grass in relation to the ecology of target species, might have negative  
111 effects on Corncrakes. Indeed, with the introduction of the subsidies the Corncrake population  
112 started a marked decline in the province.

113 Our study covers a period regarded as favourable for Corncrakes at the Eurasian level. Most  
114 populations monitored during that time showed stability or increase, especially (but not exclusively,  
115 see Keiřs 2003, Keiřs 2004) where dedicated conservation measures were implemented (O'Brien *et*  
116 *al.* 2006). During the past 15-20 years, despite fluctuations typical for Corncrake populations  
117 (Cramp 1985), which also occurred within our area (Pedrini *et al.* 2012, Fig. 1), the species was  
118 stable or increasing in most countries for which data are available: in most western European states,  
119 a partial recovery has occurred since 1997 (with fluctuations), and the largest world population of  
120 the species (the Russian one) has been stable or increasing since 2002 (BirdLife International 2013).  
121 Therefore, the post-2000 decline in Trento province is very unlikely to be due to general/global  
122 factors, such as conditions during wintering or migration. The decline (2000-2012) followed an  
123 initial increase (1997-2000), and its onset which was coincident with the introduction of the  
124 subsidies for grassland conservation, with a stronger effect on late count data in the first two years,  
125 as expected. Subsidies changed the mowing system in the grasslands of the province.

126 Grasslands were once mown by single owners, in a mosaic fashion: each owner mowed  
127 their own land, and mowing was spread over several days or weeks, allowing birds to thrive in  
128 unmown patches. Small plots with other cultivations, small wetland patches and other marginal  
129 elements were also interspersed within the largest grasslands. With the subsidies, this system  
130 collapsed: adjacent fields belonging to different owners are now mown simultaneously by the same  
131 farmer, and marginal elements are removed to maximize the extent eligible for subsidies. This  
132 results in mowing within a short space of time over wide areas, and thus produces a homogeneous  
133 vegetation structure over large areas. Although there is no direct evidence that the introduction of  
134 subsidies caused the species' decline, it is very likely that the resulting mowing, with large extents  
135 cut simultaneously and without unmown patches, caused the disappearance of suitable habitat  
136 conditions (Berg & Gustafson 2007) and high mortality (Green *et al.* 1997b, Tyler *et al.* 1998).

137 Agri-environmental subsidies not adapted to the ecological requirements of the species may  
138 fail to promote species conservation. In this case, the lack of management recommendations in the

139 subsidies for grassland conservation is the most likely cause of the negative trend of the Corncrake  
140 population, a species highly sensitive to farming practices. The extent of grassland that benefitted  
141 from agri-environmental schemes promoting a species-friendly management were too small (c.  
142 0.1% of the total grassland extent that received subsidies) to compensate for the impact due to  
143 unfavourable mowing. The new Rural Development Programme will be launched in 2014, and to  
144 conserve Corncrakes, this should include a revision and correction of measures to address problems  
145 caused by the unsustainable mowing favoured by subsidies that are not adapted to the species'  
146 requirements. The identification of the most suitable sites for Corncrakes (Tattoni *et al.* 2012) is a  
147 priority. These sites will need targeted subsidies to promote appropriate methods for mowing  
148 (Green *et al.* 1997b) and its timing (Brambilla & Pedrini 2011), and the conservation of unmown  
149 patches with tall vegetation, especially in wetter areas (Berg & Gustafson 2007, Berg & Hiron  
150 2011). Such measures have the potential to greatly enhance the value of the agri-environmental  
151 schemes for grassland conservation for Corncrakes (Pedrini *et al.* 2012) and other wild species.

152

## 153 **ACKNOWLEDGMENTS**

154 The study was partially financed by Project Biodiversità (2001-2005) and by Trento province  
155 (Agricultural and RN2000 departments) and MuSE. We are grateful to colleagues and volunteers for  
156 help with fieldwork, to I. Farronato and C. Tattoni for collaboration, to F. Dellagiacomma, V. Fin, A.  
157 Agostini, L. Sottovia, Ufficio RN2000TN for support, to two anonymous reviewers and the Editor,  
158 W. Cresswell, for helpful comments on a first draft of the paper. D. Chamberlain kindly revised the  
159 English text.

160



## REFERENCES

- Anonymous.** 2010. Servizio di Valutazione indipendente del Programma di Sviluppo Rurale per il periodo 2007 – 2013 della Provincia Autonoma di Trento. Downloaded from [http://ec.europa.eu/agriculture/rurdev/countries/it/mte-rep-it-trento\\_it.pdf](http://ec.europa.eu/agriculture/rurdev/countries/it/mte-rep-it-trento_it.pdf) on 12/02/2013.
- Berg, Å. & Gustafson, T.** 2007. Meadow management and occurrence of corncrake *Crex crex*. *Agriculture, Ecosystems and Environment* **120**: 139-144.
- Berg, Å. & Hiron, M.** 2011. Occurrence of Corncrakes *Crex crex* in mosaic farmland landscapes in south-central Sweden - effects of habitat and landscape structure. *Bird Conserv. Int.*: 234-245.
- BirdLife International.** 2013. Species factsheet: *Crex crex*. Downloaded from <http://www.birdlife.org> on 06/02/2013. .
- Birrer, S., Spiess, M., Herzog, F., Jenny, M., Kohli, L. & Lugrin, B.** 2007. The Swiss agri-environment scheme promotes farmland birds: but only moderately. *Journal of Ornithology* **148**: 295-303.
- Brambilla, M., Casale, F., Bergero, V., Bogliani, G., Crovetto, G.M., Falco, R., Roati, M. & Negri, I.** 2010. Glorious past, uncertain present, bad future? Assessing effects of land-use changes on habitat suitability for a threatened farmland bird species. *Biol. Conserv.* **143**: 2770-2778.
- Brambilla, M., Falco, R. & Negri, I.** 2012. A spatially explicit assessment of within-season changes in environmental suitability for farmland birds along an altitudinal gradient. *Anim. Conserv.* **15**: 638-647.
- Brambilla, M. & Jenkins, R.K.B.** 2009. Cost-effective estimates of Water Rail *Rallus aquaticus* breeding population size. *Ardeola* **56**: 95-102.
- Brambilla, M. & Pedrini, P.** 2011. Intra-seasonal changes in local pattern of Corncrake *Crex crex* occurrence require adaptive conservation strategies in Alpine meadows. *Bird Conserv. Int.* **21**: 388-393.

- Brambilla, M. & Rubolini, D.** 2009. Intra-seasonal changes in distribution and habitat associations of a multi-brooded bird species: Implications for conservation planning. *Anim. Conserv.* **12**: 71-77.
- Cramp, S.** 1985. *The Birds of the Western Palearctic, Volume IV*, Oxford University Press, Oxford.
- Davey, C.M., Vickery, J.A., Boatman, N.D., Chamberlain, D.E., Parry, H.R. & Siriwardena, G.M.** 2010a. Assessing the impact of Entry Level Stewardship on lowland farmland birds in England. *Ibis* **152**: 459-474.
- Davey, C.M., Vickery, J.A., Boatman, N.D., Chamberlain, D.E. & Siriwardena, G.M.** 2010b. Entry Level Stewardship may enhance bird numbers in boundary habitats. *Bird Study* **57**: 415-420.
- Debussche, M., Lepart, J. & Dervieux, A.** 1999. Mediterranean landscape changes: Evidence from old postcards. *Glob. Ecol. Biogeogr.* **8**: 3-15.
- Donald, P.F., Green, R.E. & Heath, M.F.** 2001. Agricultural intensification and the collapse of Europe's farmland bird populations. *Proceedings of the Royal Society B: Biological Sciences* **268**: 25-29.
- Donald, P.F., Pisano, G., Rayment, M.D. & Pain, D.J.** 2002. The common agricultural policy, EU enlargement and the conservation of Europe's farmland birds. *Agriculture, Ecosystems and Environment* **89**: 167-182.
- Gilroy, J.J., Anderson, G.Q.A., Grice, P.V., Vickery, J.A. & Sutherland, W.J.** 2010. Mid-season shifts in the habitat associations of Yellow Wagtails *Motacilla flava* breeding in arable farmland. *Ibis* **152**: 90-104.
- Green, R.E., Rocamora, G. & Schäffer, N.** 1997a. Populations, ecology and threats to the Corncrake *Crex crex* in Europe. *Vogelwelt* **118**: 117-134.
- Green, R.E., Tyler, G.A., Stowe, T.J. & Newton, A.V.** 1997b. A simulation model of the effect of mowing of agricultural grassland on the breeding success of the corncrake (*Crex crex*). *Journal of Zoology* **243**: 81-115.

- Keišs, O.** 2003. Recent increases in numbers and the future of Corncrake *Crex crex* in Latvia. *Ornis Hungarica* **12-13**: 151-156.
- Keišs, O.** 2004. Results of a survey of Corncrake *Crex crex* in Latvia, 1989-1995. *Bird Census News* **13**: 73-76.
- Kleijn, D., Baquero, R.A., Clough, Y., Díaz, M., De Esteban, J., Fernández, F., Gabriel, D., Herzog, F., Holzschuh, A., Jöhl, R., Knop, E., Kruess, A., Marshall, E.J.P., Steffan-Dewenter, I., Tschardt, T., Verhulst, J., West, T.M. & Yela, J.L.** 2006. Mixed biodiversity benefits of agri-environment schemes in five European countries. *Ecol. Lett.* **9**: 243-254.
- Kleijn, D., Berendse, F., Smit, R., Gilissen, N., Smit, J., Brak, B. & Groeneveld, R.** 2004. Ecological effectiveness of agri-environment schemes in different agricultural landscapes in The Netherlands. *Conserv. Biol.* **18**: 775-786.
- Kleijn, D. & Sutherland, W.J.** 2003. How effective are European agri-environment schemes in conserving and promoting biodiversity? *J. Appl. Ecol.* **40**: 947-969.
- Longoni, V., Rubolini, D., Ambrosini, R. & Bogliani, G.** 2011. Habitat preferences of Eurasian Bitterns *Botaurus stellaris* booming in ricefields: implications for management. *Ibis* **153**: 695-706.
- Ludwig, T., Storch, I. & Wübbenhorst, J.** 2008. How the Black Grouse was lost: Historic reconstruction of its status and distribution in Lower Saxony (Germany). *Journal of Ornithology* **149**: 587-596.
- MacMahon, B.J., Carnus, T. & Whelan J.** 2012. A comparison of winter bird communities in agricultural grassland and cereal habitats in Ireland: implications for Common Agricultural Policy reform. *Bird Study* DOI:10.1080/00063657.2012.758227.
- Nikolov, S.C.** 2010. Effects of land abandonment and changing habitat structure on avian assemblages in upland pastures of Bulgaria. *Bird Conserv. Int.* **20**: 200-213.

- O'Brien, M., Green, R.E. & Wilson, J.** 2006. Partial recovery of the population of Corncrakes *Crex crex* in Britain, 1993-2004. *Bird Study* **53**: 213-224.
- O'Brien, M. & Wilson, J.D.** 2011. Population changes of breeding waders on farmland in relation to agri-environment management. *Bird Study* **58**: 399-408.
- Ostermann, O.P.** 1998. The need for management of nature conservation sites designated under Natura 2000. *J. Appl. Ecol.* **35**: 968-973.
- Pannekoek, J. & Van Strien, A.J.** 2001. *TRIM (Trends and Indices for Monitoring Data)*, Statistics Netherlands, Voorburg.
- Pedrini, P., Rizzolli, F., Rossi, F. & Brambilla, M.** 2012. Population trend and breeding density of corncrake *Crex crex* (Aves: Rallidae) in the Alps: monitoring and conservation implications of a 15-years survey in Trentino, Italy. *Italian Journal of Zoology* **79**: 377-384.
- Poulin, B., Lefebvre, G. & Mathevet, R.** 2005. Habitat selection by booming bitterns *Botaurus stellaris* in French Mediterranean reed-beds. *Oryx* **39**: 265-274.
- Princé, K., Moussus, J.-P. & Jiguet, F.** 2012. Mixed effectiveness of French agri-environment schemes for nationwide farmland bird conservation. *Agriculture, Ecosystems & Environment* **149**: 74-79.
- Romero-Calcerrada, R. & Perry, G.L.W.** 2004. The role of land abandonment in landscape dynamics in the SPA 'Encinares del río Alberche y Cofio, Central Spain, 1984-1999. *Landsc. Urban Plann.* **66**: 217-232.
- Schäffer, N.** 1995. Rufverhalten und Funktion des Rufens beim Wachtelkönig *Crex crex*. *Vogelwelt* **116**: 141-151.
- Schipper, A.M., Koffijberg, K., van Weperen, M., Atsma, G., Ragas, A.M.J., Hendriks, A.J. & Leuven, R.S.E.W.** 2011. The distribution of a threatened migratory bird species in a patchy landscape: A multi-scale analysis. *Landsc. Ecol.* **26**: 397-410.
- Siriwardena, G.M.** 2010. The importance of spatial and temporal scale for agri-environment scheme delivery. *Ibis* **152**: 515-529.

- Soldaat, L., Visser, H., Roomen, M. & Strien, A.** 2007. Smoothing and trend detection in waterbird monitoring data using structural time-series analysis and the Kalman filter. *Journal of Ornithology* **148**: S351-S357.
- Tattoni, C., Rizzoli, F. & Pedrini, P.** 2012. Can LiDAR data improve bird habitat suitability models? *Ecol. Model.* **245**: 103-110.
- Tyler, G.A. & Green, R.E.** 1996. The incidence of nocturnal song by male Corncrakes *Crex crex* is reduced during pairing. *Bird Study* **43**: 214-219.
- Tyler, G.A., Green, R.E. & Casey, C.** 1998. Survival and behaviour of Corncrake *Crex crex* chicks during the mowing of agricultural grassland. *Bird Study* **45**: 35-50.
- Vickery, J.A., Tallowin, J.R., Feber, R.E., Asteraki, E.J., Atkinson, P.W., Fuller, R.J. & Brown, V.K.** 2001. The management of lowland neutral grasslands in Britain: Effects of agricultural practices on birds and their food resources. *J. Appl. Ecol.* **38**: 647-664.

**Figure 1.** Corncrake trend according to early count data (A; May – early June) and according to late count data (B; late June – July; no data available for 1999), respectively. The date of the introduction of subsidies for grassland conservation (year 2000) is also shown by the arrow.

