

UR. JERNEJ WEISS

GLASBENE MIGRACIJE:
STIČIŠČE EVROPSKE
GLASBENE
RAZNOLIKOSTI

MUSICAL MIGRATIONS:
CROSSROADS
OF EUROPEAN
MUSICAL
DIVERSITY

glasbene migracije:
stičišče evropske glasbene
raznolikosti

*musical migrations:
crossroads of european
musical diversity*

ur. Jernej Weiss



2017

Znanstvena monografija z mednarodno udeležbo
Glasbene migracije: stičišče evropske glasbene raznolikosti
– *Musical Migrations: Crossroads of European Musical Diversity*
Uredil Jernej Weiss

Studia musicologica Labacensia, 1 (ISSN 2536-2445)
Glavni urednik • Jernej Weiss (Ljubljana / Maribor)
Odgovorni urednik • Jonatan Vinkler (Koper)
Tehnična urednica • Tjaša Ribizel (Ljubljana)
Uredniški odbor • Matjaž Barbo (Ljubljana), Primož Kuret (Ljubljana), Helmut Loos (Leipzig),
John Tyrrell (Cardiff), Michael Walter (Graz), Jernej Weiss (Ljubljana/Maribor)

Recenzenta • Primož Kuret in Igor Grdina

Oblikovanje in prelom • Jonatan Vinkler

Prevod • Amidas d. o. o.
Jezikovni pregled (slovensko besedilo) • Jernej Weiss

Izdali in založili
Založba Univerze na Primorskem (zanjo: prof. dr. Dragan Marušič, rektor)
Titov trg 4, SI-6000 Koper
Glavni urednik • Jonatan Vinkler
Vodja založbe • Alen Ježovnik
Festival Ljubljana (zanj: Darko Brlek, direktor)
Trg francoske revolucije 1, SI-1000 Ljubljana

Koper, Ljubljana 2017

ISBN 978-961-6984-94-2 (spletna izdaja: pdf)
<http://www.hippocampus.si/ISBN/978-961-6984-94-2.pdf>
ISBN 978-961-6984-95-9 (spletna izdaja: html)
<http://www.hippocampus.si/ISBN/978-961-6984-95-9/index.html>
ISBN 978-961-6984-96-6 (tiskana izdaja)
Naklada tiskane izdaje: 250 izvodov (tiskovina ni namenjena prodaji)

© 2017 Festival Ljubljana



CIP - Kataložni zapis o publikaciji
Narodna in univerzitetna knjižnica, Ljubljana

78(4):7.046(082)(0.034.2)

GLASBENE migracije [Elektronski vir] : stičišče evropske glasbene raznolikosti = Musical migrations : crossroads of European musical diversity / ur. Jernej Weiss ; [prevod Amidas]. - El. knjiga. - Portorož : Založba Univerze na Primorskem ; Ljubljana : Festival, 2017. - (Studia musicologica Labacensia, ISSN 2536-2445 ; 1)

Način dostopa (URL): <http://www.hippocampus.si/ISBN/978-961-6984-94-2.pdf>
Način dostopa (URL): <http://www.hippocampus.si/ISBN/978-961-6984-95-9/index.html>

ISBN 978-961-6984-94-2 (Založba Univerze na Primorskem, pdf)
ISBN 978-961-6984-95-9 (Založba Univerze na Primorskem, html)
1. Vzp. stv. nasl. 2. Weiss, Jernej
288854528

Vsebina

- Jernej Weiss*
9 Predgovor: Glasbene migracije: stičišče evropske glasbene raznolikosti
- Jernej Weiss*
13 Foreword: Musical Migrations: Crossroads of European Musical Diversity
- Jim Samson*
17 There and back: Circassians in Anatolia
- Hartmut Krones*
33 Die stilistische Vielfalt von Orlando di Lassos weltlichem Schaffen im Spiegel seiner Lebensstationen
- Berthold Over*
53 „Voyage de Paris“. Christian IV. von Zweibrücken zwischen Akkulturation und Kulturtransfer
- Vjera Katalinić*
85 Music Mobility in the 17th and 18th Centuries: Croatian Lands between Central Europe and the Mediterranean
- Katarina Trček Marušič*
99 Glasbene migracije na Slovenskem v 17. in 18. stoletju
- Nataša Cigoj Krstulović*
115 Gledališka družba Emanuela Schikanedra v Ljubljani v sezonah 1779/80 in 1781/82 – premislek o zgodovinskem pomenu njenih uprizoritev

- Vladimir Gurevich*
 133 Antonio Lolli – auf der Route Bergamo–Stuttgart – Sankt-Petersburg
 –Neapel
- Helmut Loos*
 151 Leipzig und seine Musikverleger als Attraktion
- Luba Kijanovska*
 167 Leopoldis – Lwów – Leopoli – Lemberg – ЛЬВІВ – ЛЬВОВ in Galizien
 – ein Treffpunkt verschiedener Nationalkulturen
 (bis „Völkerfrühling“ 1848)
- Ingeborg Zechner*
 185 Die Londoner Oper des 19. Jahrhunderts als Manifestation
 musikalischer Migration
- Cristina Scuderi*
 197 From theatre to church: some remarks about censorship
 on operatic style at the time of the Cecilian regimentation
- Viktor Velek*
 213 Tamburitza music in the musical culture of Viennese Slavs
 in the 19th and early 20th centuries
- Katarina Tomašević*
 223 Davorin Jenko between Slovenian and Serbian Music: Case study
 on the Slavonic Music Ideas Migration at the turn of the 20th century
- Lana Pačuka*
 243 From “Baggage Culture” to Universally Accepted Cultural
 Commitment: the case of the musical life of Austro-Hungarian
 Sarajevo
- Fatima Hadžić*
 257 The Musical Migration: Czech Musicians in Sarajevo
- Lubomír Spurný*
 277 Music and Migration: Contribution to the history of Czech modern
 music (1870–1945)
- Jernej Weiss*
 285 “Bankers, medical doctors, teachers, priests, musicians, all Czechs,
 kind gentlefolk who show us brotherly love”
- Irena Gantar Godina*
 297 Jan Václav Lego – a Herald of Slovene-Czech Reciprocity
- Andrej Misson*
 305 Področje migracije glasbenih idej

- Luisa Antoni*
337 Prvi koraki k boljšemu poznavanju jadranskega prostora
- Darja Koter*
343 Migracija v ljubljanski Operi v obdobju ravnatelja Friderika Rukavine (1918–1925)
- Peter Andraschke*
359 Egon Wellesz in Wien und Oxford Stationen eines Lebens
- Niall O’Loughlin*
381 Escape from Catalonia: The Composing Experience of Roberto Gerhard
- Melita Milin*
401 A Serbian Composer in France: National Identity and Cosmopolitanism in the Works of Alexandre Damnianovitch
- 417 Povzetki
435 Summaries
455 Avtorji
463 Contributors
473 Imensko kazalo/Index

From theatre to church: some remarks about censorship on operatic style at the time of the Cecilian regimentation

Cristina Scuderi
Univerza v Gradcu
University of Graz

The *migration* discussed in this article does not regard any movement of people but refers to the transfer of a musical genre, namely opera, from the theatre to the ecclesiastical context and the consequences that such process bore at the times of the Cecilian movement.

For centuries, music shifting from theatre to church was regarded as absolutely normal.¹ Among all examples, a case in point is represented by the collection of contrafacta *Arie selectissimae* printed in Augsburg by Lotter in 1798.² The arias featured range from Mozart's *Per pietà non ricercate*, conceived for the repeat of Anfossi's opera *Il curioso indiscreto* for the Viennese Burgtheater in 1783 (adapted to the words of *Omni die dic Mariae*), to the duet *Decisa è la mia sorte* by Gaetano Andreozzi, written five years before Lotter's publication, in 1793 (adapted to the words of *Jesu dulcis memoria*). Being so popular, it is likely that the arias originally meant for the theatre were adapted to the liturgical context.

In general, the number of instruments required tends to be reduced: clarinets, flutes, bassoons and especially timpani are almost al-

- 1 Intermittently renewed rules during the time prohibited the performance of secular repertoire in the liturgy; nevertheless, the practice lasted for a long time. See Tomasz Jez, "Contrafacta of operatic arias among the dominicans of baroque Silesia," *De musica disserenda*, XI/1–2 (2015), 148.
- 2 Cristina Scuderi, ed., *Ariae selectissimae. Dieci contrafacta spirituali di arie operistiche di Mozart, Cimarosa, Paisiello et al.* (Augsburg 1798) (Zurich: Kunzelmann, 2012).

ways omitted, the instrumental ensemble consisting of a string quartet and basso continuo in most cases, with the addition of oboes in a few cases (possibly substituted by flutes or clarinets) and horns.

In most cases, the contrafactum maintains the key and tempo of the original aria. At times, there is an evident rhythmic difference in the vocal lines, as a result of the different text syllabification. The original text was replaced by a sacred one written in Latin. The newly composed Latin texts of the contrafacta may follow the incipit of well-known liturgical texts and then develop into an autonomous form. But more often than not, they are centonizations of devotional wordings.³ This practice was largely accepted, lasting for several decades.

According to the same principle, and with reference to the Italian context only, fifty years later collections for organ such as *Repertorio eclettico dell'organista* were published⁴, including pieces taken from operas like *I due Foscari* and *Il Trovatore* by Verdi, or extracts from *I martiri* or *Anna Bolena* by Donizetti, or from Mercadante's *La Vestale*. Here, the text intended to be sung according to the original piece was simply omitted, since the transfer was applied to a single instrument and no voices were featured.

And it is again in Turin that twelve issues of sacred music were printed by Magrini, which included the *Suonate sopra motivi di Mercadante*. It's indeed on these issues that Giovanni Battista Candotti⁵, one of the first in Italy to evoke a reform, wrote to Alberto Mazzucato⁶: “[...] Let alone the fact that there are entire pieces from operas with the title of *Suonate sopra motivi di Mercadante*, I notice that the organ is almost always treated like a piano, with the exception of few small indications of pedal here and there,

3 On the phenomenon of contrafacta see Nicole Schwindt-Gross, “Parodie um 1800. Zu den Quellen im deutschsprachigen Raum und ihrer Problematik im Zeitalter des künstlerischen Autonomie-Gedankens,” *Die Musikforschung*, 41 (1988), 16–45; Gabriella Hanke Knaus, ““Theaterstyl” und “Kirchenstyl”. Zur Kontrafakturpraxis in den kirchenmusikalischen Zentren der Innerschweiz,” in *Musik aus Klöstern des Alpenraums, Bericht über den Internationalen Kongress an der Universität Freiburg (Schweiz)*, 23 bis 24. November 2007, Giuliano Castellani, ed., (Bern: Lang, 2010), 71–84; Giuliano Castellani and Christoph Riedo, ed., *Ferdinando Galimberti, Dies irae, for soli, choir und orchester (1744)* (Adliswil/Zürich: Edition Kunzelmann, 2010), XXXIV.

4 *Repertorio eclettico dell'organista*, reductions by Cerruti and Paoletti (Torino: Racca, 1853).

5 Giovanni Battista Candotti (1809–1876), Italian composer and priest, was a precursor of the Cecilian movement, along with his pupil Jacopo Tomadini. His entire musical corpus is kept at the Archivio Musicale Capitolare of Cividale del Friuli.

6 Alberto Mazzucato (1813–1877): Italian composer, music teacher and writer. He held

very often quite unnecessary”.⁷ Much of this music could indeed be performed both at the organ and piano, the pedal part being not substantial (where present).

With the advent of the Cecilian era, these collections began to be reported by reformers, who no longer regarded such music as borrowed from the theatre, but as an actual intrusion of the operatic genre into the church, an abuse, a profanation, and – to quote one of the reformers – the “last degree of discouragement”.

Entire masses were built upon opera transcriptions such as the *Messa solenne per organo* by Carlo Fumagalli⁸, adapted on Verdian masterpieces. It wasn't unusual at that time to go to church and hear the *Versetti per il Gloria* from *Traviata*, or melodies from *I Vespri Siciliani* during the celebrant's communion; or a version of the *Aida march* right after the end of the mass, something resembling a kind of *greatest hits*, or *the best of* collection.⁹

If not entire masses, individual pieces in the symphony from opera style were alternatively performed: symphonies from *Nabucodonosor*, or from *La battaglia di Legnano*, or *La forza del destino* by Verdi could be

the position of *maestro direttore e concertatore* at La Scala Theatre and was appointed director of the Conservatory of Milan in 1872.

- 7 “Lasciamo stare che vi sono dei pezzi intieri di opere teatrali col titolo di Suonate sopra motivi di Mercadante, io osservo che l'organo vi è trattato quasi sempre alla maniera del pianoforte, se si eccettui una qualche piccola indicazione di pedale sparsa qua e là, molto spesso senza alcun bisogno.” Letter by Giovanni Battista Candotti to Alberto Mazzucato, Cividale, 5. 3. 1846. Cividale, Archivio Musicale Capitolare, Fondo Candotti.
- 8 Carlo Fumagalli (1822–1907) also adapted pieces from operas by other authors. He wrote two solemn masses: one from Lauro Rossi's opera *I falsi monetari* and the other from Filippo Marchetti's opera *Ruy Blas*. Moreover, a *Sinfonia d'organo per dopo la Messa dall'opera “Marco Visconti”* by Nicola Vaccaj and three compositions for organ from Rossini's *La donna del lago* and *Stabat Mater*. All these pieces are collected in *Musica d'opera all'organo di illustri marchigiani*, original adaptations by Carlo Fumagalli, edited by Maurizio Machella (Padova: Armelin, 2006).
- 9 This practice is also witnessed by Tomasi di Lampedusa in his renowned romance *Il Gattopardo*: “[...] quando il corteuccio entrò in chiesa, don Ciccio Turneo, giunto col fiato grosso ma in tempo, attaccò con impeto: Amami, Alfredo”; (“When the small procession reached the church, father Ciccio Turneo, showing up short of breath but right in time, started energetically playing: Amami, Alfredo”). Verdi's *Traviata* was once again been performed during a religious function. Cfr. Giuseppe Tomasi di Lampedusa, *Il Gattopardo*, in Marco Vincenzi, “La musica per organo nell'archivio parrocchiale di Pescantina,” in *Contributi per la storia dell'arte organaria e organistica in Italia*, edited by Paola Dessì (Venezia: Edizioni Fondazione Levi, 2012), 215.

heard;¹⁰ *I Masnadieri* circulated in a version for piano edited by Emanuele Muzio.¹¹ Works inspired by other authors ranged from *Gli orazi e I curiazi* or *Il matrimonio segreto* by Cimarosa, to the *Sinfonia dall'opera* "Preziosa" by Ruggero Manna, reduced at the end of the century by Arnaldo Galliera. Rossini's *Gran sinfonia nel Tancredi* and the *Sinfonia dalla Matilde di Shabran* would be performed, as well. Felix Mendelssohn too, documented this custom and wrote to Goethe that in Roman churches "they are absolutely crazy: I myself happened to hear the ouverture from the *Barbiere di Siviglia* and on another occasion an aria from *Cenerentola* played at the organ during the elevation, not to mention opera arias performed by nuns: the nonsense is really too bad."¹² Motifs from Rossini operas also flowed into the *Messa da requiem* written by Melchiorre Balbi¹³ for the death of the composer. Giovanni Morandi, one of the most significant Italian organists of the time, assisted Rossini in composing the instrumental parts in the *Cambiale di matrimonio* and then devoted himself to composing his organ music, pervaded by forms and melodic structures typical of Rossini's symphonies.¹⁴ Also the march as a genre was practised, as evident in the 5

10 *Sinfonia dall'opera* "La forza del destino", organ transcription by Francesco Almasio, 1871.

11 Giuseppe Verdi, *I Masnadieri*, reduction for piano solo by Emanuele Muzio (Milano: Ricordi, s.d.)

12 Felix Mendelssohn Bartholdy to Johann Wolfgang von Goethe, 5. 3. 1831. Felix Mendelssohn, *Lettere dall'Italia*, in Felice Rainoldi, *Sentieri della musica sacra*, (Pistoia: CLV, 1996), 454. "Ich habe wirklich selbst bei der Erhebung der Hostie die Overture aus dem Barbier von Sevilla und ein andermal eine Arie aus Aschenbrödel auf der Orgel spielen hören, von den Opernarien, die die Nonnen produzieren, gar nicht erst zu sprechen; der Unsinn ist zu arg." Ernst Wolff, *Felix Mendelssohn Bartholdy* (Severus, 2014), 87. On the use of symphonies during masses, this time with whole orchestras, Giovanni Battista Candotti gives direct testimony: "Alla sacra funzione è uso in molti luoghi di far precedere una grande sinfonia a piena orchestra, e non è raro il caso che questa sia tolta intieramente da un'opera teatrale. Per tal modo vi dispongono ad assistere al tremendo sacrificio cogli stessi mezzi che si adoperano per prepararvi ad ascoltare le sventure di *Norma* o le lepidzze di *Figaro*" ("It is a common practice in many places to let a great symphony for full-size orchestra precede the sacred function, and it is not that rare that the piece comes entirely from a theatre play. This way, they prepare you to assist to the terrible sacrifice with the same means employed to prepare you to listen to the misfortunes of *Norma* or to the merriess of *Figaro*"), Giovanni Battista Candotti, "Sul canto ecclesiastico e sulla musica da chiesa," in *Giovanni Battista Candotti. Scritti musicali*, edited by Lorenzo Nasimbeni (Udine: Pizzicato, 2008), 43.

13 Melchiorre Balbi (1796–1879), organist of the basilica of Saint Anthony of Padova from 1854 until his death.

14 Giovanni Morandi (1777–1856), Italian organist and composer. Cfr. Giovanni Mo-

Marcie [sic] *estratte da opere serie teatrali e ridotte per organo* written by Giuseppe Cerruti (the operas in question were by Rossini, Bellini and Donizetti).¹⁵ Marches were most typically performed at the end of the service.

But not only Italian opera composers were represented: foreign composers also found their space (for instance, Polibio Fumagalli transcribed Carl Maria von Weber's *Ouverture Euryante*)¹⁶. Reductions could either be carried out by opera composers themselves, or recognized work by third party transcribers or even circulate anonymously. By now, they wrote "if people flock to church it is mainly because they like to enjoy the sweet memory of music heard elsewhere."¹⁷

Organs attempted to reproduce orchestral nuances both timbrally and phonetically; the percussion section included bells, triangles, cymbal and bass drum, sonorities that were typical of bands. In the Catholic press, such instruments would now come across as being «childish».¹⁸

Many composers had become accustomed to this style and even if they did not produce transcriptions or reductions from famous operas, they would, however, write liturgical music which perfectly echoed the operatic world and its canons. Vincenzo Petrali¹⁹ was one of the authors that better expressed the operatic style in vogue at the time, making the most of the

randi, *Sonate per organo a quattro mani*, performed by Chiara Cassin and Federica Iannella, booklet by Giovanni Moroni, CD Tactus.

15 *Cinque marcie estratte da opere serie teatrali e ridotte per organo da Giuseppe Cerruti* (Torino: Magrini, s.d.); today they are edited by Maurizio Machella. (Padova: Armelin, 2006). Among the marches, the *Gran marcia dall'opera "Norma"* of Bellini was often performed and by the same author also the canon from the opera *Adelson e Salvini* and the duet *Suoni la tromba* from the work *Puritani* could be heard.

16 The *ouverture* was transcribed by Polibio Fumagalli (1830–1900), Italian composer, organist and pianist, active as organ teacher at the Conservatory of Milan.

17 "se il popolo assiste numeroso ad una messa solenne, vi assiste, più che altro, per goderli il dolce ricordo d'una musica udita in un altro luogo," "Secondo Congresso di musica sacra," *Il Cittadino Italiano*, IV/237 (20.–21. 10. 1881), 2.

18 "The countless organ stops more or less pleasantly imitating orchestra and band instruments – the so-called human voice (resembling the choir of the elderly in *Faust*), the bells, the triangles, the cymbals, the drums, the timpani and the bass drum, which are of course considered to be the key qualities of this organ are, in my view, completely inappropriate. An organ suitable for religious worship cannot be based almost entirely on all these elements, definable as childish". Giulio Roberti, "Nostre corrispondenze" (Turin, August 10, 1882), *Archivio Musicale (Musical Archive)*, I/15 (1882): 468.

19 Vincenzo Antonio Petrali (1830–1889): Italian organist, author of four operas, he went down in history as an excellent improviser, adopting a severe style during his maturity.

organo-banda, as in his *Messa per organo in re maggiore*. Joyful and lively masses, often including a vigorous bass drum and cymbal are also well represented by the *Messa solenne in Fa maggiore*. But among composers considered most *noisy* and choreographic was surely Padre Davide da Bergamo²⁰, an Italian monk whose liturgical works were full of brilliant themes born from an unstoppable creativity. Padre Davide made great use of the bells register. In his *Sinfonia in re maggiore* the organ is used in all its orchestral potential, following the structure of a Rossinian crescendo, with a clear and pervasive rhythmic pattern leading to a rowdy finale. The final section seems almost incomplete without a thunderous applause to follow, much like at the end of an opera's opening symphony in a theatre. His music was loved by the believers - he was in fact treated like a *divo* - but poorly tolerated by many priests who were convinced that these works corrupted the musical taste and religious feeling of the Christian people.

Whether performed only by the organist or by the full orchestra, the musical performances seemed to enjoy great attention from the public, as testified with resignation by one of the reformers, Ivan Trinko, who described "a crowd of openmouthed people who were listing in wonder to the free show, [...] ready to hear the final part of the Agnus Dei and then rush out of the sacred enclosure as if they had nothing else to do in there once the show was over!".²¹ They were referring to the virtuosity of singers, contortions and grimaces of soloists, cheeky interludes, cheerful symphonies and noisy orchestral marches. The vaulted ceilings of cathedrals echoed in a "lavish and deafening" way with music by a "cheerful crowd" of leading opera composers of the time.

The operatic genre had become a synonym of "corruption", "faulty", a genre "in need of care" (implying the concept of illness). "Ridiculous", "vulgar", "trivial", were among the adjectives most used to describe the so-called "operatic style" in Catholic press. A ferocious controversy sparked off in Catholic journals, raging over musicians, singers and priests who did not intend to accept the church's new directives. As we know from history, reformers demanded a return to Gregorian chant and polyphony.

20 Padre Davide da Bergamo, born Felice Moretti (1791–1863): Italian organist and composer, fellow disciple of Donizetti.

21 "una folla stipata che si godeva a bocca aperta, a occhi sbarrati, coi nasi all'aria lo spettacolo gratuito, [...] pronta alle ultime battute dell'Agnus Dei a precipitarsi fuori del sacro recinto, come gente, che, godutosi il divertimento, null'altro avesse da fare là dentro!". Ivan Trinko, *Commemorazione di Jacopo B. Tomadini nel primo centenario della sua nascita* (Udine: S. Paolino, 1923), 118.

It was explicitly prohibited to praise the performance of music, in Catholic press, not compliant with regulations issued by the Sacra Congregazione dei Riti.²² Polemics were violent, at times resembling more a denunciation than just a mere complaint. Some articles would make it easy to identify those guilty of having performed an inappropriate repertoire. Here follows a typical comment on a musical performance during the service:

*Frisky-rhythmed ariettas, little duets and trios with Baroque subjects were the ingredients of the whole composition. And as if that weren't enough, the organist played his part too, by using the organ as if it were a piano, performing danceable and secular opera music, such as the song from Lucrezia Borgia «Ama tua madre, e tenero etc. etc.» and many other of an all too similar kind, if not even worse. Choir singers and organist are from Chiarano.*²³

In certain cases, names of musicians concerned were not overtly stated but their home town was mentioned, as in the aforementioned case.

Polemic articles often appeared anonymously even in journals such as the *Gazzetta Musicale di Milano*, not specifically devoted to sacred music but with higher impact and relevance at national level. This was not simply a matter of rejection: it actually turned out to be a true attack against musical genre that became a direct attack against people, pursued through the press.

Taking the case of North-East Italy, where such attacks were particularly strong, above all in the Friulian region, tones could be as harsh as: “[...] due to the fertility of the ground, many qualities of onions thrive, among them some exotic ones, as well. Indigenous onions are Marzona and Pecile, whereas Mercadante, Manna, Asioli, Nava and many others are the exotic ones”.²⁴ One might even view this as just an outburst of a provincial

22 The Congregatio pro sacri ritibus et caeremoniis was founded in 1588 by Pope Sisto V with the intent of regulating liturgical worship.

23 “Ariette dal ritmo saltellante, duettini, terzettini, con soggetti barocchi, erano il contingente della intera composizione. E come ciò non fosse bastato, vi aggiunse la sua parte l’organista, toccando l’organo come un pianoforte, eseguendo ballabili e pezzi di opera profani, troppo profani come la melodia della Lucrezia Borgia “Ama tua madre, e tenero ecc. ecc.” e tante altre pur troppo di simil genere se non peggiori. Cantori ed organista sono di Chiarano.” “La musica nelle chiese,” *Il Cittadino Italiano*, V/66 (20.–21. 3. 1882).

24 “[...] mercè la feracità del suolo, allignano molte qualità di cipolle, tra le quali riesce benino anche qualcuna esotica. Le cipolle indigene sarebbero il Marzona e il Pecile, esotiche il Mercadante, il Manna, l’Asioli, il Nava e tanti altri”, Walther, “Udine.

journalist, but it was actually Angelo De Santi himself, among the most important reformers on a national level, who would use such denigratory terminology.²⁵ Referring to Jacopo Tomadini,²⁶ a pupil of Candotti, he stated that people should have been proud to have such a model to follow but “Woe betide them if, disregarding the manna from the heaven, they should nevertheless chase the fetid onions from Egypt. In that case, they would no longer have the right to any excuse whatsoever”²⁷. This was written on a top journal read by a vast audience.

It was not only the repertory as such to be contested, but how it was performed, as well. During a trip to Rome, Jacopo Tomadini visited the Sistine Chapel and this is how he described a musical performance by the famous castrato singer Domenico Mustafà²⁸ in a letter to his teacher: “[...] Especially solos sung by Mr Mustafà, both for the style of the music and even more for how it was sung, are something really disgusting to be listen to in church. In the end he sounds like a prima donna at the theatre, with his cloying manner, his mawkishness, his forced mannerisms and his affectation, all which the gravity and holiness of the place thrusts back a million miles...[...]”²⁹ This clearly shows a critical attitude towards a certain singing style, but at least it surfaces in a private letter.

We could at this point ask ourselves who was in fact supposed to give directions regarding sacred repertoire to be performed in churches, and what solutions were proposed as for scores in general. At times it was the municipality itself who paid for services and therefore had a certain influ-

Degli autori di musica sacra che vanno per la maggiore in questa Provincia,” *Musica Sacra*, XV, 5, (1891): 78–79.

- 25 Angelo De Santi (1847–1922), a Jesuit, contributed to the formulation of the Motu proprio *Inter sollicitudines*.
- 26 Jacopo Tomadini (1820–1883), Italian composer and priest, played a significant part in the reform movement and was vicepresident of the Italian Association of Saint Cecilia. The Conservatory of Udine is named after him.
- 27 “Guai ciò non ostante se dispregiando la manna piovutagli dal cielo, corre dietro alle fetide cipolle d’Egitto. Non ha più diritto a scusa veruna,” Angelo De Santi, *Civiltà Cattolica*, 2. 8. 1890.
- 28 Domenico Mustafà (1829–1912), Italian castrato singer and composer, was appointed choir director by Pope Leo XIII in 1860. On his life and the Sistine Chapel at that time, see Alberto De Angelis, *Domenico Mustafà. La Cappella Sistina e la Società Musicale Romana* (Bologna: Zanichelli, 1926).
- 29 Letter by Jacopo Tomadini to Giovanni Battista Candotti, s.d. Cividale, Archivio Musicale Capitolare, Fondo Candotti, *Corrispondenza*.

ence on the repertoire.³⁰ But following the first *Regolamento per la musica sacra* (*Regulation on Sacred Music*) dated 1884, a few commissions for sacred music started to appear on the territory. This *Regolamento* was issued by Pope Leo XIII, forbidding all music based on theatrical and profane reminiscences (therefore excluding any cabaletta, cavatina or recitative), the only language admitted being Latin. Words of Latin texts were to be quoted entirely, without any omissions, repetitions or divisions. This is the reason why at a certain point even the fugue as a compositional form started to be questioned (a paradox, since the fugue had been typical of church style for many years). It was said that the fugue, being made up of subject, countersubject, episodes and stretto, is an artifice bringing confusion and repetition of words.

In 1885 the Commission for Sacred Music in Venice was established, the following year the same in Padua and in 1889 a Commission for Sacred Music was instituted in Udine, as well. It was only in 1901 that a Commission was established in Rome: therefore, compared to the capital city the North-East had moved ahead more speedily in the reform process.³¹

Ten years after the *Regolamento*, further regulations were introduced through the *Normae pro musica sacra* (*Rules for sacred music*), published once again by the Sacra Congregazione dei Riti (the Sacred Congregation of Rites).³² For the first time they considered the possibility of inflicting punishments on trespassers, albeit without specifying what type of punishments were meant.

In 1905 a local Regulation was introduced, signed by the Friulian Archbishop. Musicians identified by name and surname were now openly banned: authors of operas and more in general of theatre music, such as

30 See Alba Zanini, "Il carteggio di Giovanni Battista Candotti" in *Candotti, Tomadini, De Santi e la riforma della musica sacra*, by Franco Colussi and Lucia Boscolo Folegana (Udine: Forum, 2011), 60.

31 A significant role in the establishment and development of the Cecilian movement in Italy was played by the Roman Catholic organisation named Opera dei Congressi e dei Comitati Cattolici. For several years, the Opera dei Congressi dealt with issues concerning liturgical music; the Sacred Music division had already approved the founding of the Generale Associazione Italiana di Santa Cecilia (General Italian Association of Saint Cecilia) at the first congress held; however, it was actually instituted in 1880 by Guerrino Amelli. Cfr. Pier Luigi Gaiatto, *Il movimento ceciliano di area veneta e il recupero dell'antico (1874-1897)*, doctoral thesis in History and Critique of Music, University of Padua, AY 2007/2008, p. 3.

32 The *Normae pro musica sacra* were published on 7. 7. 1894.

Mercadante, Rossi, Pecile, Marzona, Asioli, etc.³³ The main implication underlying the presence of frequently repeated regulations issued on the territory is the fact that the operatic repertoire was difficult to uproot. Most regulations echoed more or less exactly those issued in previous years.

Most commissions consisted of a president, one or two censors, one secretary and priests as a majority of members. All members were appointed directly by the bishop. Each city or village was to be headed by a member of the commission, who was in charge of eradicating the operatic repertoire and supervise the production of sacred music in designated areas, in order to ensure capillary action across the territory. However, not all commission members had been trained to carry out a serious reform plan. Some members couldn't even distinguish between sacred and secular music – after all, priests were not allowed to attend the theatre or other worldly places. Many of them would simply accept what looked uncomplicated and understandable at first glance.

If we take a closer look at what one of the presidents of the commission of Udine sent to the archbishop in 1911, it is clear that not all members were equipped with strong musical knowledge - to the point that the writer himself was unable to evaluate the music subjected to the commission's evaluation: "I don't understand the art of sounds at all, I am not capable of reading and judging a score, I just know a little about Gregorian chant, so I cannot talk about music without talking nonsense and make people laugh

33 "Pel canto figurato, in attesa di un elenco ufficiale, sono permesse intanto tutte le pubblicazioni sacre editate per cura degli editori pontifici *Capra* di Torino, *Pustet* di Ratisbona, della «*Musica Sacra*» *Bertarelli* di Milano e di *Schwann* di Düsseldorf. Ogni altro spartito, stampato o manoscritto, prima di essere usato, deve ottenere il nulla osta della Commissione diocesana. Le singole cantorie eliminino senz'altro dal proprio repertorio tutti gli spartiti, che non rispondano alle prescrizioni (*Mercadante*, *Rossi*, *Pecile*, *Marzona*, *Budini* [Bodini?], *Gioffredi*, *Asioli*, ecc.). Del Candotti sono permesse le composizioni scritte negli ultimi suoi anni; da eliminarsi quelle più antiche, da lui stesso riprovate." ("As for figurative singing, until the official list will be available, only publications of sacred music edited by pontifical publishers *Capra* in Turin, *Pustet* in Regensburg, «*Musica Sacra*» *Bertarelli* in Milan and *Schwann* in Düsseldorf are admitted. Any other score, whether printed or in manuscript, must be approved by the diocesan Commission before being used. Choirs should definitely eliminate any scores from their repertoire that do not abide with the prescriptions (*Mercadante*, *Rossi*, *Pecile*, *Marzona*, *Budini* [Bodini?], *Gioffredi*, *Asioli*, etc.). Regarding Candotti, only compositions produced in the later phase are admitted, whereas those belonging to his early years, which he himself condemned, are not to be considered"), *Regolamento per la Musica Sacra da osservarsi nella Diocesi di Udine*, Udine, 6. 5. 1905.

[...].³⁴ Unfortunately this was the same person putting his signature under the expression “si approva per l’esecuzione” (“approved for performance”) on scores. As a matter of fact, in this case the analysis was carried out by the censor director Vittorio Franz. We should at least appreciate the honesty of these words. Yet, the problem surfaces in all its gravity.

Several cases of censorship were applied on the territory. One case in point: composer Carlo Rieppi submitted his orchestral masses to the local commission of Udine.³⁵ It was music written for strings, flutes, bassoon, oboe, trumpet, etc. The outcome was that after 1905 he was forced to rewrite several scores, leaving out wind instruments, for instance. We can read inscriptions of this kind on the cover of his scores: *Mass in B, composed in 1898 – reedited in 1906* (after the local regulation signed by the archbishop, 1905). The *before* and the *after* are very clear - also graphically.

The progressive removal of instruments led to scores up to three voices without organ, in a kind of process of score *purification*.³⁶ Embellishments, arpeggios, triplets were removed from the many scores presented by several composers. The “approved for performance” note would be concise-

34 “Non m’intendo nulla affatto di suono, non son capace di leggere e giudicare uno spartito, conosco solo praticamente un poco il canto gregoriano, onde non posso mettermi a parlare di musica senza spropositare e far ridere”. Letter by Egiziano Pugnetti to the Archbishop, s.d. Udine, Archivio Corrente of the Curia, section Liturgy and Sacred Music, Sacred Music file.

35 Carlo Rieppi (1861–1947), Italian composer. His works have been catalogued by Lucia Ludovica De Nardo, *Carlo Rieppi. Catalogo delle opere* (Udine: Pizzicato, 2011). On the composer see also Cristina Scuderi, *Il movimento ceciliano di area friulana nel primo Novecento* (Padova: CLEUP, 2011).

36 Rieppi was among the composers who did not take a stance against this practice: on the contrary, he gladly accepted it. He made himself the bearer of reform instances denouncing to Pugnetti (the president of the Udinese commission) that despite the well-known rules, the local choir of San Daniele “performed music that had all been prohibited by the Pope, by the Archbishop, by the Commission with a Decree”; “Ricci’s Mass, which you saw and said was absolutely forbidden [...]; the Gloria by Candotti, which goes against the liturgy in the words accompanied by the organ’s triumphal march; a syncopated Hail Mary, surely lacking approval. At the Vesper the choir performed the Dixit from Candotti’s Salmi brevi, never mind! But four Psalms by Marzona!” (“esegui tutta musica proibita dal Papa, dall’Arcivescovo, dalla Commissione con Decreto. La Messa è del Ricci, che Lei, vedutala, disse recisamente che è assolutamente proibita [...]; il Gloria di Candotti che nelle parole a marcia trionfale dell’organo è contro la liturgia; un’Ave Maria sincopata, certo senz’approvazione. Al Vespero la Cantoria eseguì il Dixit dei Salmi brevi di Candotti, pazienza! Ma quattro Salmi del Marzona!”), Letter by Carlo Rieppi to Egiziano Pugnetti, 9. 9. 1907, Udine, Archivio Corrente della Curia, Atti della Commissione Diocesana per la Musica Sacra dal 1905, c. 4.

ly written directly on the score or on a separate sheet, signed or stamped by the president of the commission of the city where the score was submitted. Such practice lasted for years thereafter. The term *approved* became the norm during the years to follow.

Some of this music, after transferal from theatre to church was simply abandoned whereas other pieces underwent transformations. But apart from the type of instruments allowed (or not allowed) what exactly were the rules for these transformations?

With the Motu Proprio *Inter sollicitudines* in 1903, Pope Pius X underlined the three essential requirements for sacred music: holiness, goodness of its forms and universality. But what does this actually mean? How can a music be holy or universal? Such concepts are concepts and not rules as such. They appear to be rather vague even when partly clarified in the fourth paragraph, *Forma esterna delle composizioni sacre* (*The music form of sacred compositions*). Previous regulations didn't offer more detailed elements. It was more about what to avoid than what to do or how to write music properly. We find statements like: "It is to avoid solos in the manner of theatrical singing (not to say screams), in a raised voice that distracts the devotion of the faithful" (art. 14, *Regolamento* 1884) or "It is prohibited to use too mawkish inflections of voice, making excessive noise in beating the time or giving orders to the performers, turning their back to the altar [...]. It would be best if performers were not visible" (art. 10, *Regolamento* 1884).³⁷

We know that the model should have been that of Palestrina. According to the *Programma generale del Comitato permanente per la musica sacra in Italia* (1890): "Italian classical polyphony, particularly belonging to the sixteenth century and to the Roman school, headed by Pierluigi da Palestrina, not only possesses an intrinsic musical value that is superior in its kind to anything that art history has been able to record in the last three centuries, but it is most convenient for liturgical celebrations [...]"³⁸ This

37 "Si evitino, per quanto si può gli assoli foggianti a maniera di canto teatrale con alzata di voce (per non chiamarli gridi) che distraggano la devozione dei fedeli." (art. 14). "È proibito l'uso di certe inflessioni di voci troppo affettate, il fare soverchio rumore nel battere il tempo o nel dare gli ordini agli esecutori, il volgere le spalle all'altare [...]. Sarebbe desiderabile che gli esecutori fossero possibilmente invisibili" (art. 10).

38 "La polifonia classica italiana, specialmente del secolo XVI e della scuola romana, capo e duce Pierluigi da Palestrina, non solo possiede un intrinseco valore musicale, superiore nel suo genere a tutto ciò che la storia dell'arte ha potuto registrare negli ultimi tre secoli, ma è di tanta convenienza nella funzioni liturgiche [...]", *Programma generale del Comitato permanente per la musica sacra in Italia* (Milano: Musica Sacra, 1890). The use of the Palestrina model for new compositions, however,

indeed definitely states the *superiority* of one style over the others; it means creating a myth that does not leave much space for other musical expressions. But how many composers actually followed these prescriptions with good results or how many composers really did intend to abide by such indications?

A part of the clergy believed it was not convenient to impose the new directives, due to the problems that had arisen with musicians. It must be borne in mind that for years musicians had been used to performing the same repertoire, and all at once they found themselves having to discard that music due to the newly introduced reform, while undertaking to learn new music at the same time. Another part of the clergy still simply had a passive attitude regarding operatic repertoire. Commissions for sacred music were partly inefficient, due to the high number of members not in agreement with each other. Also for these reasons the process of eradicating operatic repertoire turned out to be a long and difficult one, in Italy more than in other countries.

Owing to the Cecilian movement, the transfer of so called “ridiculous” and “vulgar” operatic features suffered a setback, and this *migration* - if we may indeed call it this way - definitely came to an end. The point is to understand if what came later was stylistically and aesthetically adequate enough to replace such a model.

Bibliography

- Angelis, Alberto De. *Domenico Mustafà. La Cappella Sistina e la Società Musicale Romana*. Bologna: Zanichelli, 1926.
- Battista Candotti, Giovanni. “Sul canto ecclesiastico e sulla musica da chiesa.” In *Giovanni Battista Candotti. Scritti musicali*. Edited by Lorenzo Nassimbeni. Udine: Pizzicato, 2008.
- Castellani, Giuliano, Riedo, Christoph, ed.. *Ferdinando Galimberti. Dies irae, for soli, choir und orchester (1744)*. Adliswil/Zürich: Edition Kunzelmann, 2010.
- Cinque marcie estratte da opere serie teatrali e ridotte per organo da Giuseppe Cerruti*. Torino: Magrini, s. d..
- Repertorio eclettico dell'organista*. Reductions by Cerruti and Paoletti. Torino: Racca, 1853.

resulted in few truly creative works, most of them representing just a sterile imitation of XVI century polyphony.

- Nardo, Lucia Ludovica De. *Carlo Rieppi. Catalogo delle opere*. Udine: Pizzicato, 2011.
- Gaiatto, Pier Luigi. *Il movimento ceciliano di area veneta e il recupero dell'antico (1874–1897)*. Doctoral thesis in History and Critique of Music. University of Padua, AY 2007/2008.
- Hanke Knaus, Gabriella. ““Theaterstyl” und “Kirchenstyl”. Zur Kontrafakturpraxis in den kirchenmusikalischen Zentren der Innerschweiz.” In *Musik aus Klöstern des Alpenraums, Bericht über den Internationalen Kongress an der Universität Freiburg (Schweiz)*. 23 bis 24. November 2007. Giuliano Castellani, ed.. Bern: Lang, 2010, 71–84.
- “Il Cittadino Italiano.” *La musica nelle chiese*, V/66 (20.–21. 3. 1882).
- Jez, Tomasz. “Contrafacta of operatic arias among the dominicans of baroque Silesia.” *De musica disserenda*, XI/1–2 (2015).
- Musica d’opera all’organo di illustri marchigiani*. Original adaptations by Carlo Fumagalli. Edited by Maurizio Machella. Padova: Armelin, 2006.
- Programma generale del Comitato permanente per la musica sacra in Italia*. Milano: Musica Sacra, 1890.
- Rainoldi, Felice. *Sentieri della musica sacra*. Pistoia: CLV, 1996.
- Regolamento per la Musica Sacra da osservarsi nella Diocesi di Udine*. Udine, 1905.
- Roberti, Giulio. “Nostre corrispondenze” (Turin, August 10, 1882). *Archivio Musicale (Musical Archive)*, I/15 (1882).
- Schwindt-Gross, Nicole. “Parodie um 1800. Zu den Quellen im deutschsprachigen Raum und ihrer Problematik im Zeitalter des künstlerischen Autonomie-Gedankens.” *Die Musikforschung*, 41 (1988): 16–45.
- Scuderi, Cristina, ed.. *Ariae selectissimae. Dieci contrafacta spirituali di arie operistiche di Mozart, Cimarosa, Paisiello et al.* (Augsburg 1798). Zurich: Kunzelmann, 2012.
- Scuderi, Cristina. *Il movimento ceciliano di area friulana nel primo Novecento*. Padova: CLEUP, 2011.
- Trinko, Ivan. *Commemorazione di Jacopo B. Tomadini nel primo centenario della sua nascita*. Udine: S. Paolino, 1923.
- Verdi, Giuseppe. *I Masnadieri*, reduction for piano solo by Emanuele Muzio. Milano: Ricordi, s.d..
- Vincenzi, Marco. “La musica per organo nell’archivio parrocchiale di Pescantina.” In *Contributi per la storia dell’arte organaria e organistica in Italia*. Edited by Paola Dessi. Venezia: Edizioni Fondazione Levi, 2012.

Walther, “Udine. Degli autori di musica sacra che vanno per la maggiore in questa Provincia.” *Musica Sacra*, XV/5 (1891).

Wolff, Ernst. *Felix Mendelssohn Bartholdy*. Severus, 2014.

Zanini, Alba “Il carteggio di Giovanni Battista Candotti.” In *Candotti, Tomadini, De Santi e la riforma della musica sacra*. By Franco Colussi and Lucia Boscolo Folegana. Udine: Forum, 2011.