

Resounding Participatory Ethnography

Ethnographic Dialogue in Dialogue

A book + CD review and dialogue among

PANAYOTIS PANOPOULOS

University of the Aegean

NICOLA SCALDAFERRI

University of Milan

STEVEN FELD

School for Advanced Research

ABSTRACT

This dialogue explores issues in contemporary sonic, sensory, and visual ethnography, including dialogic editing and collaborative projects between anthropology and art. It focuses on how the multimedia ethnography *When the Trees Resound: Collaborative Media Research on an Italian Festival* (2019) breaks the silence of earlier studies of an Italian community festival by emphasizing listening to multiple sounds and voices through field sound recordings and dialogic photographic imaging, writing, and editing. In doing so, a ritual of communal effort with roots in peasant labor, performative masculinity, and social opposition and protest becomes a site of experimental scholarship on participatory and performative ethnography.

KEYWORDS

multimedia ethnography, sensory ethnography, sound, photography, dialogic editing

Collaborative Multimedia Ethnography in a Multisensory Terrain

It is uncommon in modern ethnographic fieldwork to work in teams of specialized researchers. Likewise, multimedia, like photography, film, and sound recordings, typically has not been deployed beyond rudimentary documentation purposes. Critically, visual and sonic anthropology have reassessed such limitations by turning images and sounds into either self-reliant or mutually supporting ways of conducting ethnographic research and producing anthropological knowledge, each with their own caliber and methodologies. The dialogue these methods and media have inaugurated—between different ways of seeing, listening, and writing—has fostered a broader conversation among researchers who work collaboratively with different media and pursue alternative ways of doing and presenting ethnography. In the context of the recent reinvigoration of European rituals and the politicization of cultural heritage, revitalized interest in issues of media representation and collaboration creates new opportunities for presenting, and also performing, the past, traditions, and folklore alongside local histories and identities in transition.

Anthropology is a dialogic project. Ethnographic fieldwork is an immersion in the experiences and voices of interlocutors in the field, which today is widely perceived as a multisensory terrain. Reflexivity and critical perspectives in anthropology have opened up ethnographic methodologies toward the senses and alternative modalities of research and presentation (Cox et al. 2016). The use of multiple media in fieldwork expands the practice of ethnographic dialogue to include dialogic work between researchers and dialogic editing in representing cultural worlds in ethnographic texts, films, and sound recordings.

When the Trees Resound: Collaborative Media Research on an Italian Festival (2019) is the dialogic outcome of and recent translated and expanded publication and 2-CD set from collaborative fieldwork conducted by a group of researchers from the Laboratory of Ethnomusicology and Visual Anthropology (LEAV, Università degli Studi di Milano)¹ and affiliate scholars on the Maggio festival of Accettura, a small community in the region of Basilicata in southern Italy. The area has been famous in Italian ethnography as a remote, marginal, and impoverished place, as well as for being a main research site of Ernesto De Martino, one of the most well-known Italian ethnologists whose work on magic, ritual, and crisis has recently received renewed attention in English-speaking anthropological scholarship (de Martino 2015).

PANAYOTIS PANOPOULOS

Panayotis Panopoulos is assistant professor of anthropology of music and dance at the Department of Social Anthropology and History, University of the Aegean, Greece. His research interests concern music, sound and performance, deafness, sensory ethnography, and collaborations between anthropology and contemporary art.

NICOLA SCALDAFERRI

Nicola Scaldaferrì is associate professor of ethnomusicology and director of the LEAV (Ethnomusicology and Visual Anthropology Lab, www.leav.unimi.it) at the University of Milan, Italy. His interests include music and technology, musical practices from Southern Italy, epic songs from the Balkans, and musical instruments from Western Africa.

STEVEN FELD

Steven Feld is an anthropologist, filmmaker, musician, and sound artist, and senior scholar at the School for Advanced Research in Santa Fe, New Mexico. His academic research principally concerns the anthropology of sound, voice, aesthetics and poetics, and environmental and ecological acoustics.

The central event of the Maggio is the cutting of two trees in two nearby forests on the north and south ends of the village. The ritual includes the communal transportation of the trees into the village and the erection of a high pole formed by tying the two trees one on top of the other. This takes place at the village piazza on Saint Julian's Day, around the time of Pentecost. According to Antonio Trivigno, a photographer who is "the historical and photographic memory of the *Maggio* festival" (Scaldaferri and Feld 2019, 97), the tree ceremony has had shifting meanings through time, from a "festival of the uneducated" to a "collective festival." Nowadays, it creates a "pole" of multiple voices, practices, and meanings, which both relate to the community and also transcend local boundaries.

While this ritual has been described and analyzed in traditional ethnographies, writers have not attended to its sounds until recently. The ethnographic attention to listening to multiple sounds, voices, songs, and music-making through field sound recordings and dialogic photographic imaging, writing, and editing in *When the Trees Resound* creates a new understanding of this regional ritual. While the first edition of this book was published in Italian in 2012 (Scaldaferri and Feld 2019), its edited and expanded English translation includes additional context, media, and content. The full text and audio files are available on LEAV's website.²

Breaking Silence: Field Recordings, Soundscape Compositions, Photographs, and Text in Dialogue

The book is organized as a series of essays that read as chapters focused on various aspects of the Maggio ritual. As filmmaker and visual anthropologist Lorenzo Ferrarini points out in his introduction to the English edition, the Maggio ceremony as it is performed nowadays "involves catholic cults, identity politics, relations with returning expatriates, musical performances, media coverage, and the institutionalization of cultural heritage" (2019, 7). A ritual of communal effort, with roots in peasant labor, strong nuances of performative masculinity, social opposition and protest, proponents have advocated for its inclusion in the UNESCO World Heritage list since 2007 (after the Convention for the Safeguarding of Intangible Cultural Heritage). It becomes here the site of experimental scholarship on participatory and performative ethnography through sound and photography.

In the first essay of the book, ethnomusicologist Nicola Scaldaferri presents their collective project as a way of opposing the absence of sound in earlier research on the tradition of Italian tree festivals and ritual performances in

general. Historian and resident priest Don Giuseppe Filardi writes about the history, myth, and tradition of the Maggio. Following this, photographer Stefano Vaja and ethnologist Ferdinando Mirizzi contribute critical readings of the photographic and written representations of the Maggio throughout history. This all sets the contextual groundwork that prepares the reader for the conversation between the two editors, Scaldaferrì and anthropologist and ethnomusicologist Steven Feld, on sound documentation and representation, unraveling the starting points, theoretical and artistic influences, as well as the methodological choices involved in juxtaposing two CDs. One CD features a soundscape composition by Feld, and the other contains documented field recordings by ethnomusicologists Fabio Calzia, Cristina Ghirardini, Elisa Piria, and Guido Raschieri, and archival recordings by Filardi. These act as complementary sound portraits of the Maggio. The liner notes on the two CDs are valuable complements not only to the explication of methods, techniques, and equipment, but also to the philosophy of recording in each case.

Once the groundwork of the earlier chapters has been established and the context for the historical and cultural relevance of the ritual is clear, the conversation between the editors sets the pace for the strong dialogic element of the project overall. There is also a dialogue or correspondence between two series of photographs presented in the book, one by Vaja and the other by Ferrarini. The first series follows a narrative and descriptive path, while the other provides an idiosyncratic and haptic emphasis on bodily actions and graphic elements of ritual performance, singing, and music-making. Dialogues continue in the three interviews with people from Accettura: Biagio Labbate, Antonio Trivigno, and Don Giuseppe Filardi. These interviews make visible both how the research team and the Italian edition of the book were received into and perceived by the community. This provides a strong sense of dialogic editing to the project, an elaborate process of working together with communities on the presentation of their lives and experience.

The essay by Vaja on the history of the Maggio photography unravels the evolution of its photographic representations throughout the twentieth century and their relationship with the anthropological perspectives that have influenced local discourses on tradition and history (Notarangelo 1975; Viggiano 2009). In this essay, Vaja makes a strong comment on the general attitude of the research group and their open-ended ethnographic methodology:

Instead of adhering to a single interpretive line, we have tried to render the festival's complexity, refraining from interpretations that derive from our being children of our time, and that would therefore be questioned sooner or later. Rather, we have focused on emotional participation, valorizing the festival's lived experience in its moment. (2019, 35)

For example, the soundscape CD composed by Feld brings the listener into the middle of the ritual process, positioned at the opposite side of recording methodologies that create objective distance. By using a somatic recording technique, which thoroughly transcends recent artificially binaural technology toward a more dynamic stereo bodily involvement in the events, the soundscape CD mixes, with sensory and even sensual vigor, all the sonic aspects of the festival into a medley of music, singing, ritual, and ambient sounds. Far more than an evocative sound ethnography, this is equally a musical creation and a sonic film, based on the exceptionally rich background of its creator in ethnographic recording and filming as well as in techniques of electro-acoustic and soundscape composition.³ Field research, recording, editing, description, experience, memory, analysis, and synthesis come together to create an immersive sonic landscape of festivity. The evolution of the composition from simpler sound images to gradually more dense evocative soundscapes is indicative of the culmination of the events in the ritual itself and the absorption of the participants and researchers alike. One of the most interesting methodological innovations of this project, in general, which is sonically exemplified in the soundscape CD, is that the research methods followed and ways ethnography is presented form an equivalent to the ritual process. First, they step according to the pace. Then, they match the rhythm of the unraveling of the ceremony. Finally, they follow the multivocal, polyrhythmic character, the fuss and the fun, the chaotic but sound quality, the culminating extravagance of the ritual, where what is evoked and implied is at times more important than what is straightforwardly stated (Figure 1).

When the Trees Resound is characterized by a successful dialogic combination of fairly critical perspectives on earlier representations of the Maggio festival, accompanied by an equally deep appreciation for them and for the historicity of multiple forms of representation, on the one hand, with a strong emphasis on experimentation with new techniques, theories, and methods of audiovisual and sensory ethnography, on the other. This dialogue manages to overcome sterile oppositions between stereotypes of traditional and contemporary outlooks, following trends set by the new life of revitalized

FIG. 1 Nicola Scaldaferrì accompanying a singer with the zampogna, and Steven Feld recording with DSM microphones during the Maggio festival. Accettura, May 2005. Photo by Lorenzo Ferrarini. [This figure appears in color in the online issue.]

**FIG. 1**

or reinvigorated rituals of the European past in today's world of global connectivity and implosion of local boundaries and identities.

Indeed, dialogue is the thread connecting all contributions, perspectives, and media of the CDs and book, extending far beyond voices and sounds, to include photographs, texts, methods, readings, relations, senses, and sentiments. Starting with the conversation between the editors on sound documentation and representation, the dialogic aspect is diffused throughout the components and all participants of the project, whether the people of Accettura or the researchers themselves. What follows here is a new dialogue with the two editors created specifically to complement this review. Our conversation took place via email correspondence during the early stages of the COVID-19 pandemic, which imposed the cancelation of all the activities of the Maggio festival for 2020 and reinvigorated anthropological questions on the power of participation, communal sounding, and ritual resounding. To position our voices, it is important to acknowledge our connections too. Feld and Scaldaferri have worked together on several other projects in the past (e.g., Scaldaferri 2006). I have also collaborated with Feld, photographer Dick Blau, and anthropologist Agapi Amanatidis on a multimedia ethnography of Skyros carnival in Greece (Blau et al. 2010). In 2015, while Feld was visiting Greece to present his work, he and I recorded a conversation on ethnographic listening and comparative acoustemologies published online later that year.⁴ These preexisting connections and collaborative activities have aided the dialogue in

progress among the three of us as we come to this conversation with mutual understandings of sound, collaboration, and each other's personalities and positionalities that are found at the margins of our dialogue.

In Dialogue

PANOPOULOS: The book and CDs set *When the Trees Resound* is an English version/translation of an originally Italian multimedia publication, which intends to unravel the ritual aura and the sensorial overstimulation of the Maggio ceremony in Accettura. Ceremonies of its kind, involving complex religious and arboreal symbolism, have been studied for over a century by various scholars, folklorists, anthropologists, historians, and experts of religion, who have given through the years all types of descriptions, explanations, and theoretical analyses of the ritual processes, either evolutionary, functional, symbolic, or focusing on community solidarity. Your compilation of photographic, sonic, [and] textual material, where different sonic portraits, photograph essays, and texts juxtapose one another, can be read, heard, and seen as an alternative take on the event and its representation. What was the original conception of the project and how does it relate to earlier representations of the Maggio ceremony?

SCALDAFERRI: The Maggio attracted much attention from researchers and photographers, starting with anthropologist Giovanni Battista Bronzini more than fifty years ago. They produced works of remarkable interest and visual impact; however, they also proved the “deafness” of some ethnographic tradition—as Roberto Leydi used to say: Rituals are accurately described and discussed, but an absolute silence seems to reign over them. The main point of our research on the Maggio is the attention to the sound, since it plays a crucial role in every aspect of the festival. That very focus led to another feature of our work, namely, the polyphonic dialogue which intertwines different researchers, media, and representation methods. From the very beginning, Steve—who enthusiastically joined the project with his extraordinary experience—and I thought to combine a soundscape composition with the study of musical practices, considering them two complementary forms of research. They are mirrored in the two photograph sequences by [Lorenzo] Ferrarini and [Stefano] Vaja, each of which has its own expressive features. Contrary to more traditional monographs, the core of this publication is a sonic and photographic dialogue, while we added some short essays with ethnographic and historical data on the *Maggio* and its representation. The dialogue actively involved

also the people of Accettura, as emerges especially in this second English edition, which features local feedbacks and conversations.

PANOPOULOS: In opposition to your two main research projects in Papua New Guinea (Feld 2001, 2012a) and Ghana (Feld 2007, 2012b), which focus on long-term ethnographic research on sound and listening, the *Maggio* project, along with several others from your [project] *The Time of Bells* series (2004–12) (Feld 2004a, 2004b, 2005, 2006, 2007, 2012c), is based more on a deep immersion in the sonority and vitality of specific events and places for a limited time of focused visual and aural attention, usually working with wider groups of local and other scholars. Would you like to comment on the methodology of these projects of attentive listening, on what you have been describing as *acoustemologies*, or histories of listening? How do these concepts materialize in the case of unraveling the sonic folds of a rich ritual event, and in recording and editing an immersive soundscape out of it?

FELD: I was profoundly inspired by the discovery, in the 1970s in Bosavi, Papua New Guinea, that the best local composers were also the best ornithologists. This provided me a new way to think about listening to the world and composing with, to, and about it; a way to think about sound as a way of knowing—*acoustemology* (Feld 2015). Twenty-five years later, during a brief visit to Greek Macedonia, a place where I had virtually no knowledge of local history, culture, languages, repertoires, no fieldwork experience, I simply recorded as much as possible, using playback to local people, as well as conversations with Charlie and Angie Keil, and Dick Blau, as stimulus to editing and composing a CD companion for *Bright Balkan Morning* (Blau et al. 2002). I was amazed, as they were, about what this added to the photographic and textual work. So when Nicola invited me to come along to Accettura, I simply conjured another experiment in histories of listening, tracing listening as a novel in-the-moment activity, to listening as spontaneous registration with the body attached to sound recording technology, to listening as the specific form of research called composition, leading to new multiplicities of listening as an experiential archive. In all, listening to histories of listening to share and proliferate fragments of collective memory. Again, with no prior knowledge of local language, history, culture, I was able to fully participate in something that has become a metacultural force in Accettura and part of an experimental research project about multiple kinds of knowing, in image, sound, voice, text, dialogue, and feedback.

PANOPOULOS: Granting that both the dialogic and the sonic/vocal aspects are so central to this project, I find really intriguing the juxtaposition/dialogue of the two CDs, the soundscape composition and the documentation recordings (along with the juxtaposition/ dialogue of the two sets of photographs and the textual voices, as Nicola Scaldaferrì already mentioned above); I consider this choice to be a practical statement on the development of ethnomusicology, from a discipline devoted to the documentation of local musical traditions and folklore to a more anthropologically oriented study of the cultural dynamics of musical performances and the role of sound as a cultural system. At the same time, it is equally a statement of respect for more traditional research and a confirmation of the ongoing dialogue between different generations and perspectives of researchers. What was the reception of the original publication in Italy and how is such a project related to recent developments in sound ethnography, in ethnographic theory and practice?

FELD: Nicola will have more to say about the first wave reception in Italy, as he was the one to first take the images and sounds and then the publication back to Accettura...to engage local people there in dialogue. For my part, I first encountered local responses during our presentations at the University of Milan attended by a broad public as well as the mayor, priest, and other community members from Accettura. I also encountered more local responses when we made a presentation in Accettura at the local heritage museum, as well as in Matera, where the sound was installed during the city's 2019 celebration as a European culture capital. These events, as might be expected, were filled with expressions of pride, as the community simultaneously celebrated their important festival, and celebrated its ability to attract the attention of researchers.

Just as anthropologists sometimes pride themselves on having their picture taken, or their seat placed, next to that of the village chief for a ceremonial occasion, here the Accettura village chiefs, the mayor and the priest, could be seen enjoying the photograph opportunity afforded by insisting that researchers sit to either side of them at the bar, at presentation events, and for dinners. These are complex moments, but they certainly create layers of reflexivity as a community gets to see and hear themselves as others have come to see and hear them. Of course, all the tensions written about in contemporary ethnography, for example, the boundaries of heritage and heritagization, and of corporatizing or UNESCO-izing culture, can be teased out of the pleasures and potential fears of these encounters.

Concerning the soundscape composition, the liberties it takes with expanding and condensing space and time presented a special case of dialogue. Nicola particularly liked to play, at these events, the portion of my CD that is the most composed, mixing the mechanical sounds of the joined trees being raised to the sky, with the vocal and physical sounds of the work and workers operating the hoist, the sounds of *zampognari* [*zampogna* (Italian bagpipe) players] and the swells of their surrounding performance, and the shouts in the street, as well as firecrackers and gunshots as the event comes to a climax. I am sure that Nicola anticipated, and this was certainly confirmed by the crowd participation at our presentations, that these sounds, synthesizing many forms of participation, would be felt as a symbolic condensation and sensuous memory of the ritual's most anticipated and heightened moment of excitement.

SCALDAFERRI: The research and its final result received an enthusiastic welcome from the Accettura community. Don Giuseppe Filardi, scholar, parish priest, and important presence in the rite of *Maggio*, who collaborated with us from the first moment, repeatedly stated that the community, as a whole, for the first time has felt being not only an "object of study," as usually happened in the past, but an actor fully included in the project; this was also evident in the proud participation of the community in various events mentioned above by Steve. The soundscape composition was among the things they appreciated most, because it evokes different memories of sonic participation in a new narrative form; people from Accettura can recognize the origin of each sound, which for them has a precise meaning and evoked an emotional state.

The reviews of scholars in Italy highlighted the novelty of many perspectives offered by this project and the methodological stimuli it suggested beyond the specific case of *Maggio*. Certainly, many of the ideas are in line with the pursuit of new paradigms in current ethnographic research and representation: the dialogic approach, the sonic and sensory ethnography, the intersection between artistic and research practices, and surely the use of recordings and photographs as an autonomous form of narration and analysis rather than as illustrative material of a written text (Cox et al. 2016; Feld 1987; Schneider and Wright 2010).

It must be said that in Italy, starting from the interdisciplinary approach of scholars like E. De Martino and Diego Carpitella in the 1950s, a special attention has always been devoted to the use of audiovisual media. Meanwhile, in the field

of Italian ethnomusicology, a tradition of publications with a multimedia trait has been developed since longtime; this happened also thanks to the particular sensitivity of some publishers like Nota, which has certainly been a pioneer; it has been publishing since decades CD book series where the sound recordings are at the core of the publication, reversing the usual relationship with the written text; so it was not difficult to find a placing for such a project as ours.⁵

PANOPOULOS: Along with your focus on sound/photograph anthropology/ethnography, we also encounter here a wider artistic outlook, which places this research, publication, and whole project in the experimental field between anthropology and art, where ethnographers and artists share interests, methods, and sensibilities upon collaborating with rather than just studying a community or culture. How do you appreciate participation, duty, friendship, fulfillment, and enjoyment in your research?

FELD: I have long believed in, and been identified with, experimental approaches bridging anthropology and art practice (Schneider and Wright 2010). So, one of the early conversations with Nicola concerned not just this project but his desire to establish, at the University of Milano, the LEAV, a laboratory environment where work in sound and image-making, joining practices from ethnomusicology and visual anthropology, could be joined both to many sorts of research projects, and many sorts of outcomes, including recordings, radio, film, photographic exhibit. My history of playback and feedback methods—what I called *dialogic editing* and *dialogic auditing*—were also part of those conversations, and in particular how they could be a centerpiece of collaboration and participation (Feld 1987; Feld and Brenneis 2004). Lorenzo Ferrarini was also part of these conversations, both with regard to photographic practice, and blending anthropological and visual perspectives with work centered on soundmaking, listening, and what he and Nicola, in their forthcoming collaborative book, as well as their film project in Burkina Faso, called *Sonic Ethnography* (Ferrarini and Scaldaferrri 2020). These ideas fit very well with my ideas about acoustemology, sound as a way of knowing, and methods of recording and visualizing that engage listening to histories of listening.

For Nicola and me, a shared background in electro-acoustic music also added something very special, a way of thinking about research as composition, a shared language of sonic materiality that could translate from listening experiences to

FIG. 2 Women dancing with cente (candle offerings) during the procession of St. Julian. Accettura, May 2005. Photo by Stefano Vaja. [This figure appears in color in the online issue.]



FIG. 2

recording and editing practices. Composition, or recomposition, might thus be understood as our experimental common denominator, however differently we were positioned in relation to Accettura and research of festivals in Basilicata. As soon as we started talking about the relations of field listening experience and studio listening experience, I felt completely liberated to mix work and play.

As for some of your other keywords: Duty, friendship, and enjoyment were very important in the context of this project. Unlike all the other participants, I neither spoke the language nor knew the local customs. But I was always there in the public with other researchers or musicians or workers: walking, climbing, kneeling, bending, running, laughing, smiling, and so forth, all the while with equipment in my hands and on my head. Very quickly I was positioned as a costumed and eager participant experiencing the action in my own way. Other researchers and participants mirrored this back to me, with friendship and trust, inviting me close, gesturing, coaxing, teasing, acknowledging, and otherwise signing their desire to enjoy my presence, and for me to enjoy theirs. I always felt that the researchers were having a kind of parallel festival, soaking up all the collective pleasures and anticipations, while constantly calibrating ways to register the experience (Figure 2). I found myself, for example, doing certain things I had never tried before, like being on my knees and moving to record not just singers with *zampogna* (an Italian bagpipe), but the sounds of the hands and clothes moving, their positions shifting, feet moving on the ground. Some of these body memories that made the experience most real for me also made it the most

fun. And with that, a caring bond, knowing that all of these subtleties could communicate in a very sensuous way back to the people of Accettura.

SCALDAFERRI: Since my early years of study, I cultivated, in a parallel and complementary way, musical performance, composition, and field research. In my work, field sound recording and electro-acoustic composition have always found meeting points thanks to the use of the same technologies. The dialogue with Steve, which started with his first presence in Basilicata in 2004, has been a constant reference, extended also to collaborations about Ghana and Bosavi, New Guinea. It also pushed me to overcome the difficulty of carrying on those activities in an academic context often characterized by rigid disciplinary borders and scriptocentrist perspectives. The LEAV started early on to support experimental scholarly research, and it constituted a venue for relationships with artists, such as Yuval Avital and Enrico Bronzi, who from their side sometimes considered ethnographic activity as a necessary complement to their practice (Scaldaferri 2016).⁶

Doing research with a community of real people (unlike archival work or with virtual communities) certainly ends up creating strong human relationships; or, on the other hand, a privileged existing relationship with people and communities can provide a researcher the impulse for a study. My first experiences at the Maggio, in the early 2000s, were through participating as a *zampogna* player, enjoying in this way the immersive sonic atmosphere of the festival and creating friendship with many local people. This special relationship actually suggested the idea of the research behind the book and the attention to the prominence of sound and music. I opted to keep in this research my role as a musician (recognized by the community) and to alternate it with the role of the scholar, in a shifting positionality which evolved in a distinctive feature of my role in this research; this characterized also the rest of my research in Basilicata, which I conducted at length with Stefano Vaja, and more recently with Lorenzo Ferrarini for our forthcoming book *Sonic Ethnography* (Ferrarini and Scaldaferri 2020).

Working with a real community of people places researchers in a position of obligation, as anthropologists know well; especially when the community has a solid and strong identity, even in its diasporic components, such as that of Accettura. This year, 2020, due to the COVID pandemic, the *Maggio* festival was canceled for the first time since World

FIG. 3 Lifting the Maggio, made of a joined turkey oak and holly. Accettura, May 2005. Photo by Stefano Vaja. [This figure appears in color in the online issue.]



FIG. 3

War II; in Accettura this was a major trauma. All of us involved in this research have been invited to help [in] facing this difficult void, sharing with them materials and reflections. Moreover, on the main day of the festival, I was invited in Accettura, to play the *zampogna* during the religious service celebrated by Don Filardi and live-streamed according to the security provisions. The sense of this visit was to transmit, through digital media, a part of those sounds that this year it was not possible to experience live. And I believe that many Accetturesi, in the days of the canceled festival, when a surreal and deafening silence reigned in the empty streets, immersed themselves in the viewing [of] and listening to *When the Trees Resound*, to experience, even if in a mediated form, visual and sound sensations so important in creating their sense of community.

Resounding, Rerouting, and Recirculating

Apart from redirecting one's attention to the sense of hearing, resounding works as a trope to reconsider dialogues between sound/image and text, linearity and ambience, sensoriality and understanding, media and writing, multivocality and authority, explanation and interpretation, and researchers and communities. *When the Trees Resound* is a well-considered, persistent invitation to reverse the usual sequence of things in approaching an ethnography. Instead of reading through either the text or texts in linear succession, and possibly and occasionally taking a look at the photographs and other materials

accompanying and documenting a central narrative, this CD book/book CD encourages us to pay attention to ethnographic listening through sound and image. Equally close to an art installation as an ethnographic study, it hovers between anthropology and art, both in its intentions and the audience to which it appeals (Figure 3).

It is quite common in rituals like Maggio to have hundreds of people taking photographs, making videos, and recording sounds along with researchers and professionals, all there observing. The abundant images and sounds produced and exchanged during these events nowadays create and constantly re-create local standards, genres of representation, and modes of circulation. The significance of this for a group of scholars working with various popular media cannot be overstated. Visual and sonic ethnography is integral to the explosion of visual and sonic documentation and performance of rituals; it can hardly avoid participating in the immediate exchange of photographs, videos, sounds—the constant circulation of academic, professional, recreational, familial, community, and all other kinds of local representations.

Notes

1. <http://leavlab.com/>
2. <http://leavlab.com/portfolio/when-the-trees-resound-2019/>
3. <http://www.stevenfeld.net/audio-cd-1/2014/11/22/z7s3hal20iyddqpb1jah412u6o8zk>
4. https://www.academia.edu/12187153/Athens_Conversation_On_Ethnographic_Listening_and_Comparative_Acoustemologies_Steven_Feld_with_Panayotis_Panopoulos, <http://www.stevenfeld.net/interviews>.
5. <https://www.notamusic.com/en/>
6. See, for example, Yuval Avital's icosonic opera *Samaritans* (<http://leavlab.com/portfolio/samaritans/>) and geographic score performance #URLA. *Sonic Meta Parade*, documented by Giovanni Cestino in *Lines of Sounding Bodies* (<http://leavlab.com/lines-of-sounding-bodies/>).

References

- Blau, Dick, Agapi Amanatidis, Steven Feld, and Panayotis Panopoulos. 2010. *Skyros Carnival*. Santa Fe, NM: VoxLox.
- Blau, Dick, Charles Keil, Angeliki Vellou Keil, and Steven Feld. 2002. *Bright Balkan Morning: Romani Lives and the Power of Music in Greek Macedonia*. Middletown, CT: Wesleyan University Press.
- Cox, Rupert, Andrew Irving, and Christopher Wright eds. 2016. *Beyond Text? Critical Practices and Sensory Anthropology*. Manchester: Manchester University Press.
- de Martino, Ernesto. 2015. *Magic: A Theory from the South*. Translated and edited by Dorothy Zinn. Chicago: Hau Books.
- Feld, Steven. 1987. "Dialogic Editing: Interpreting How Kaluli Read Sound and Sentiment." *Cultural Anthropology* 2(2): 190–210.

- Feld, Steven, producer. 2001. *Bosavi: Rainforest Music from Papua New Guinea*. Washington, DC: Smithsonian Folkways Recordings. 3-CD Anthology.
- Feld, Steven, composer. 2004a. *The Time of Bells, 1: Soundscapes of Italy, Finland, Greece, and France*. Santa Fe, NM: Voxlox. CD.
- Feld, Steven, composer. 2004b. *The Time of Bells, 2: Soundscapes of Finland, Norway, Italy, and Greece*. Santa Fe, NM: Voxlox. CD.
- Feld, Steven, composer. 2005. *The Time of Bells, 3: Musical Bells of Accra, Ghana*. Santa Fe, NM: Voxlox. CD.
- Feld, Steven, composer. 2006. *The Time of Bells, 4: Soundscapes of Italy, Denmark, Finland, Japan, and USA/Iraq*. Santa Fe, NM: Voxlox. CD.
- Feld, Steven. 2007. *Por Por: Honk Horn Music of Ghana: The La Drivers Union Por Por Group*. Washington, DC: Smithsonian Folkways Recordings.
- Feld, Steven. 2012a. *Sound and Sentiment: Birds, Weeping, Poetics, and Song in Kaluli Expression*, 3rd ed. Durham, NC: Duke University Press.
- Feld, Steven. 2012b. *Jazz Cosmopolitanism in Accra: Five Musical Years in Ghana*. Durham, NC: Duke University Press.
- Feld, Steven, director. 2012c. *The Time of Bells*. Santa Fe, NM: Voxlox. DVD.
- Feld, Steven. 2015. "Acoustemology." In *Keywords in Sound*, edited by David Novak and Matt Sakakeeny, 12–21. Durham, NC: Duke University Press.
- Feld, Steven, and Don Brenneis. 2004. "Doing Anthropology in Sound." *American Ethnologist* 31(4): 461–74.
- Ferrarini, Lorenzo. 2019. "Editor's Introduction." In *When the Trees Resound: Collaborative Media Research on an Italian Festival*, edited by Nicola Scaldaferri and Steven Feld, English edition edited by Lorenzo Ferrarini, with photographs by Stefano Vaja and Lorenzo Ferrarini, 6–11. Udine: Nota.
- Ferrarini, Lorenzo, and Nicola Scaldaferri. 2020. *Sonic Ethnography: Identity, Heritage and Creative Research Practice in Basilicata, Southern Italy*. Manchester: Manchester University Press.
- Notarangelo, Domenico, ed. 1975. *Il Maggio di Accettura*. Palo del Colle: Liantonio.
- Scaldaferri, Nicola, ed. 2006. *Santi, animali e suoni: Feste dei campanacci a Tricarico e San Mauro Forte*. Udine: Nota.
- Scaldaferri, Nicola. 2016. "Audiovisual Ethnography: New Paths for Research and Representation in Ethnomusicology." In *Musical Listening in the Age of Technological Reproduction*, edited by Gianmario Borio, 373–92. Farnham: Ashgate.
- Scaldaferri, Nicola, and Steven Feld, eds. 2012. *I suoni dell'albero: Il Maggio di San Giuliano ad Accettura*. Udine: Nota.
- Scaldaferri, Nicola, and Steven Feld. 2019. *When the Trees Resound: Collaborative Media Research on an Italian Festival*. English edition edited by Lorenzo Ferrarini, with photographs by Stefano Vaja and Lorenzo Ferrarini. Udine: Nota, Book and 2 CDs. <http://leavlab.com/portfolio/when-the-trees-resound-2019/>
- Schneider, Arnd, and Christopher Wright, eds. 2010. *Between Art and Anthropology: Contemporary Ethnographic Practice*. London: Routledge.
- Vaja, Stefano. 2019. "The Faces of the Maggio: For a Photographic Portrait of the Tree." In *When the Trees Resound: Collaborative Media Research on an Italian Festival*, edited by Nicola Scaldaferri and Steven Feld, English edition edited by Lorenzo Ferrarini, with photographs by Stefano Vaja and Lorenzo Ferrarini, 32–37. Udine: Nota.
- Viggiano, Augusto. 2009. *L'albero della festa*. Modugno: La nuova tecnografica.