

1 **Microbial community composition and antimicrobial resistance in agricultural**  
2 **soils fertilized with livestock manure from conventional farming in Northern**  
3 **Italy**

4  
5 Andrea Laconi<sup>a</sup>, Lapo Mughini-Gras<sup>b,c</sup>, Roberta Tolosi<sup>a</sup>, Guido Grilli<sup>d</sup>, Angela  
6 Trocino<sup>a</sup>, Lisa Carraro<sup>a</sup>, Federica Di Cesare<sup>e</sup>, Petra Cagnardi<sup>d^</sup>, Alessandra  
7 Piccirillo<sup>a,^,\*</sup>

8  
9 <sup>a</sup>Department of Comparative Biomedicine and Food Science, University of Padua,  
10 Viale dell'Università 16, 35020 Legnaro (Padua), Italy.

11 <sup>b</sup>Center for Infectious Disease Control, National Institute for Public Health and the  
12 Environment (RIVM), Antonie van Leeuwenhoeklaan 9, 3721 BA Bilthoven, the  
13 Netherlands.

14 <sup>c</sup>Faculty of Veterinary Medicine, Utrecht University, Yalelaan 2, De Uithof, 3584 CL  
15 Utrecht, the Netherlands.

16 <sup>d</sup>Department of Veterinary Medicine, University of Milan, Via Celoria 10, 20133  
17 Milano, Italy.

18 <sup>e</sup>Department of Health, Animal Science and Food Safety, University of Milan, Via  
19 Celoria 10, 20133 Milano, Italy.

20

21 <sup>^</sup>These authors contributed equally.

22

23 \*Corresponding author: Alessandra Piccirillo, Department of Comparative  
24 Biomedicine and Food Science, University of Padua, Viale dell'Università 16, 35020  
25 Legnaro (Padua), Italy. Email address: [alessandra.piccirillo@unipd.it](mailto:alessandra.piccirillo@unipd.it)

26 **Highlights**

- 27 • Manure application does not strongly influence soil microbiome
- 28 • Fertilization enriches the abundance of some ARGs (i.e. *ermA*, *ermB*, *bla<sub>oxa-1</sub>*
- 29 and *oqxA*) harboured in agricultural soil
- 30 • Manure-derived ARGs in soil display different dissipation patterns
- 31 • Flumequine residues correlate with *oqxA* and *qnrS* abundances
- 32 • Higher ARG abundances are present in swine vs. dairy and poultry manure

### 33 **Abstract**

34 Antimicrobials are commonly used in conventional livestock production and manure  
35 is widely applied to agricultural lands as fertilizer. This practice raises questions  
36 regarding the effects of fertilization on (i) soil microbiota composition and (ii) spread  
37 of antimicrobials and antimicrobial resistance (AMR) in the environment. This study  
38 was conducted in a high-density farming area of Northern Italy and aimed at  
39 assessing the impact of (dairy cattle, chickens and swine) manure application on soil  
40 microbiome, antimicrobial concentrations and antimicrobial resistance gene (ARG)  
41 abundance. We found the microbial community composition in manure to be  
42 different and less diverse than in soil, with manure application altering only  
43 marginally the soil microbiome. Exceptions were the phyla Firmicutes, Tenericutes  
44 and Cloacimonetes, which significantly enriched in fertilized soil. Of the  
45 antimicrobials investigated, only flumequine concentrations increased after manure  
46 application, albeit non-significantly. ARGs were more abundant in manure, with  
47 *ermA*, *ermB*, *bla<sub>OXA-1</sub>* and *oqxA* being significantly enriched in fertilized soil. Positive  
48 correlations between *oqxA* and *qnrS* abundances and flumequine concentrations were  
49 observed, together with the co-occurrence of some ARGs and microbial taxa (e.g.  
50 *oqxA* correlated with Acidobacteria and Gemmatimonadetes). This study showed that  
51 manure application has little effect on soil microbiome but may contribute to the  
52 dissemination of specific ARGs into the environment. Moreover, flumequine residues  
53 seem to enhance the emergence of *oqxA* and *qnrS* in soil.

## 54 **1. Introduction**

55 Manure derived from conventional livestock production systems is commonly used in  
56 agriculture to improve soil quality and, as organic fertilizer, to provide nitrogen  
57 enrichment and increase organic matter (Das et al., 2017). However, microbial  
58 communities in manure may influence soil microbiome, either directly through  
59 competition or indirectly by spreading antimicrobial resistance (AMR). The extent to  
60 which the manure microbiome influences the soil microbial community remains  
61 unclear. Although some studies have found that organic manure application  
62 significantly alters the soil microbiome (Stocker et al., 2015; Zhang et al., 2020),  
63 other studies have reported changes limited to a few taxa, whereas the main microbial  
64 composition of the soil remains unmodified (Lopatto et al., 2019). Antimicrobial  
65 drugs have been widely used for several decades in conventional livestock  
66 production. While some of these antimicrobials are scarcely metabolized in the  
67 animal body and eliminated as such, others are metabolized and excreted as active or  
68 inactive metabolites in urine and faeces (Wei et al., 2011; Xia et al., 2019a). After  
69 soil fertilization, antimicrobial residues may spread into the surrounding  
70 environment, potentially inducing the emergence of resistant bacteria and  
71 antimicrobial resistance genes (ARGs) (Hou et al., 2015; Munk et al., 2018; Qiao et  
72 al., 2018; Rovira et al., 2019; Xia et al., 2019a). The dissemination of ARGs in the  
73 environment represents a great concern for public health, since they can be integrated  
74 into mobilizable genetic elements, such as plasmids or transposons, and propagated  
75 via horizontal gene transfer (HGT) among bacteria, including pathogenic and non-

76 pathogenic ones (Qiang et al., 2006). Indeed, ARGs disseminated into the  
77 environment have the potential to be transferred to humans, via dispersion into  
78 waterways, through runoff and drainage from the soil, or by entering the food chain  
79 (Berendonk et al., 2015; Hruby et al., 2016; Marti et al., 2013; Pruden et al., 2012).  
80 In the present study, we investigated for the first time the impact of the application of  
81 manure from three different livestock sectors, namely dairy cattle, chickens and  
82 swine, located in a high-density farming area of Northern Italy on the microbial  
83 community composition, antimicrobial concentrations and ARG abundances in  
84 agricultural soil. The main purpose of the study was then to improve our  
85 understanding of the impact of fertilization with manure from conventional livestock  
86 farms on soil microbiome and AMR spread into the environment, as well as the  
87 correlation between antimicrobial concentrations and ARG abundance. Furthermore,  
88 we aimed to assess whether the different livestock sectors differed in their microbial  
89 communities, in the concentration of antimicrobial residues and in ARG abundance.

90

## 91 **2. Materials and Methods**

### 92 **2.1 Sampling procedure**

93 Samples were collected from 31 conventional farms (10 chicken farms, 10 swine  
94 farms, and 11 dairy cattle farms) located in two regions in Northern Italy from  
95 October 2017 to March 2019. Farms were chosen because of their location in a high-  
96 density farming area and because of the application of an integrated agricultural  
97 system, meaning that the manure produced by each farm was used to fertilize the

98 surrounding farmland. In each farm, three samples were collected from: 1) manure or  
99 slurry (one sample), 2) soil (one sample before fertilization with manure/slurry and  
100 one sample one month after fertilization with manure/slurry), accounting for a total of  
101 93 samples (i.e. 3 samples x 31 farms). Details of the sampled farms are summarized  
102 in supplementary material 1.

103 Manure/slurry samples were collected according to Kumari et al. (2015). Briefly,  
104 manure samples were collected by taking 1 kg of 10 manure cores (1.5 cm in  
105 diameter and 12 cm deep) at randomly selected locations and then pooled; slurry  
106 samples were collected by taking 1 L of slurry from five different points at 1 m depth  
107 from the surface of the storage tank. Soil samples were collected according to Dong  
108 et al. (2014) by sampling in the low layer (0-20 cm) and using an auger with a 5 cm  
109 internal diameter at five randomly selected locations and then pooled.

110

## 111 **2.2 Quantification of antimicrobials**

112 The analytical method was set up to detect and quantify 14 different antimicrobials:  
113 amoxicillin, ampicillin, cefquinome, ceftiofur, ciprofloxacin, danofloxacin,  
114 enrofloxacin, flumequine, marbofloxacin, erythromycin, spiramycin, tilmicosin,  
115 tylosin and colistin. The 14 antimicrobials were chosen as representing some of the  
116 most commonly used antimicrobials in animal farming and/or because listed as  
117 critically important antimicrobials by the World Health Organization (2019). Soil and  
118 manure (dairy cattle and chickens) or slurry (swine) sample purification was  
119 performed as previously described (Chiesa et al., 2018), with some modifications. An

120 aliquot (1 g weight) of mixed soil or manure/slurry from dairy cattle, chickens or  
121 swine, spiked with IS (enrofloxacin d5) at a final 50 ng/g, 100 µl of 20% TCA for  
122 protein precipitation and 10 ml McIlvaine buffer (pH 4.0), were combined. Samples  
123 were vortexed and sonicated for 10 minutes (min). After centrifugation at 2,500g,  
124 4°C for 5 min, the supernatant was transferred to a clean falcon tube and defatted  
125 with 10 ml n-hexane, then vortexed and centrifuged (at the previously reported  
126 conditions) to discard the n-hexane layer. Solid phase extraction Oasis HLB  
127 cartridges was used to purify the obtained extracts; then the eluate was dried and  
128 reconstituted as reported by Chiesa et al. (2018). Chromatographic separation was  
129 obtained with the same gradient elution for all compounds except for colistin, as in  
130 Chiesa et al. (2018). For colistin, the elution started with 90% A (aqueous formic acid  
131 0.1%; B methanol), maintained for 5 min, followed by a decrease to 10% A at 6 min,  
132 and maintained till 11 min. Subsequently, the mobile phase was gradually increased  
133 back to 90% A at 12 min and then held constantly until 17 min.

134 Mass spectrometric (MS) analysis was performed on a triple-quadrupole TSQ  
135 Quantum MS (Thermo Fisher Scientific, Massachusetts, U.S.A.) equipped with an  
136 electrospray interface (ESI) set in the positive (ESI+) electrospray ionization mode  
137 for all analytes (Chiesa et al, 2018). The selected diagnostic ions, one of which was  
138 chosen for the quantitation, and the collision energies are reported in supplementary  
139 material 2. Acquisition data were recorded and elaborated using Xcalibur software  
140 from Thermo Fisher Scientific.



141 After the identification of samples in which the absence of antimicrobials was  
142 detected, through a preliminary screening of soil or manure and slurry samples, the  
143 method was validated according to the Commission Decision 2002/657/EC criteria  
144 (European commission, 2002). For the validation procedure on manure, samples of  
145 manure/slurry from dairy cattle, swine and chickens were mixed to obtain pooled  
146 manure samples.

147 For each analyte, the method performance was evaluated by the determination of  
148 retention time (RT), transition ion ratios, recovery, accuracy (trueness), precision  
149 (expressed as the intra- and inter-day repeatability), linearity, as well as the decision  
150 limit ( $CC\alpha$ ) and detection capability ( $CC\beta$ ), which were calculated as described in  
151 SANCO/2004/2726 revision 4 (European Union, 2008). The detailed procedure is  
152 reported in Chiesa et al. (2018). All the results of the method validation for all the  
153 compounds are reported in supplementary material 3.

154

### 155 **2.3 DNA extraction**

156 Twenty-five grams (manure or soil) or 25 ml (slurry) of sample were placed in a  
157 sterile Filtra-bag (280  $\mu\text{m}$  pore size), added with 25 ml of Phosphate Buffered Saline  
158 (PBS) and mixed by hands for 1 min. The filtered liquid was centrifuged at 4,000  
159 rpm for 10 min at 4°C; DNA was extracted from 250 mg of the resulting pellet using  
160 DNeasy PowerSoil kit (Qiagen, Hilden, Germany) following manufacturer's  
161 instructions. DNA quality and quantity were assessed using a UV-Vis

162 spectrophotometer NanoDrop ND-1000 (Nanodrop Technologies, Wilmington, DE,  
163 United States).

164

#### 165 **2.4 16S rRNA gene amplification, sequencing, and data analysis**

166 To evaluate differences in bacterial communities among manure/slurry, fertilized and  
167 unfertilized soils, the V3-V4 regions of the 16SrRNA gene were amplified with  
168 primers 341F/R806 (Takahashi et al., 2014) modified with overhangs to add index  
169 adapters using Phusion high-fidelity DNA polymerase (Thermo Fisher Scientific).  
170 PCRs were carried out in a 2720 thermal cycler (Applied Biosystems, Waltham, MA)  
171 with 25 cycles at 95°C for 30 seconds, 55°C for 30 seconds and 72°C for 45 seconds,  
172 followed by a final extension for 7 minutes at 72°C. PCR products were purified  
173 using the SPRIselect purification kit (Beckman Coulter, Brea, CA), and barcodes  
174 introduced via a second PCR using platform-specific barcode-bearing primers (Milan  
175 et al., 2018). Following a second purification, libraries were quantified using the  
176 Qubit 2.0 Fluorometer (Invitrogen, Life Technologies, Monza, Italy) and pooled.  
177 Pooled DNA concentration and integrity were assessed using Agilent 2100  
178 Bioanalyzer (Agilent Technologies, Palo Alto, CA, United States), and then  
179 sequenced using the Illumina MiSeq sequencing platform (San Diego, California,  
180 USA) with a 2×300 bp paired-end approach.

181 DADA2 package within the Quantitative Insights into Microbial Ecology 2 (QIIME2  
182 version 2019.4) software was used for 16S rRNA data analysis (Bolyen et al., 2019;  
183 Callahan et al., 2016). To assign taxonomy categories, a Naive Bayes classifier and

184 the q2-feature-classifier plugin were used. Taxa assignment was carried out using  
185 SILVA- Naive Bayes sklearn trained database (Yilmaz et al., 2014). The raw  
186 sequence reads have been deposited in the NCBI Short Read Archive under the  
187 accession number PRJNA600160. The on-line based software Calypso  
188 (<http://cgenome.net/wiki/index.php/Calypso>) was used for microbial community  
189 characterization and  $\alpha$ - and  $\beta$ -diversity statistics (Zakrzewski et al., 2017). Default  
190 parameters were employed for data filtering. Total sum normalization (TSS) and  
191 SquareRoot data transformation were used. The microbial community composition  
192 was visualized using heatmap and network analyses. To quantify the microbiome  
193 diversity within each sample group, Shannon index and Chao1 methods were  
194 employed. To assess the overall differences in microbial community composition  
195 among type of sample and livestock sectors, principal coordinate analysis (PCoA)  
196 plots and non-metric multidimensional scaling (NMDS) were used for visualization,  
197 and permutational multivariable analysis of variance (PERMANOVA) based on the  
198 Bray-Curtis dissimilar measure for significance testing using the Adonis function.

199

## 200 **2.5 Quantitative PCR (qPCR) analysis of antimicrobial resistance genes (ARGs)**

201 The detection of ARGs to antimicrobials commonly used in conventional farming  
202 was carried out by quantitative polymerase chain reaction (qPCR). Gene-specific  
203 qPCRs paired with melting curve analysis were employed for detecting the following  
204 ARGs: *ermA*, *ermB*, *oqxA*, *oqxB*, *qnrS*, *qnrA*, *qnrB*, *mcr-1*, *mcr-2*, *mcr-3*, *mcr-4*, *mcr-*  
205 *5*, *bla<sub>TEM-1</sub>*, *bla<sub>SHV</sub>*, *bla<sub>CTX-M-1like</sub>*, *bla<sub>CMY-2</sub>*, *bla<sub>OXA-1</sub>*, *bla<sub>OXA-48</sub>*, *bla<sub>VIM-2</sub>* and *bla<sub>NDM</sub>*. All

206 qPCRs were performed in a final volume of 10  $\mu$ L using PowerUp™ SYBR® Green  
207 Master Mix (Thermo Fisher Scientific) with optimal concentration of each primer  
208 (600/600nM) in a LightCycler®480 Roche (Roche, Basel, Switzerland) real-time  
209 platform. ARG-specific primers and reference strains used as positive control are  
210 summarized in supplementary material 4. Cycling conditions were as follows: initial  
211 incubation at 50 °C for 2 min, followed by 2 min at 95 °C, and 45 cycles at 95 °C for  
212 10 sec and 50-60 °C for 40 sec. Melting curves between 40 and 95 °C were  
213 determined by adding a dissociation step after the last amplification cycle at a  
214 temperature transition rate of 4.4 °C/sec. The absolute abundance of ARGs in  
215 samples was calculated based on standard curves obtained using serial dilutions of  
216 previous end-point PCR amplicons of target DNA isolated from the reference strains.  
217 However, the absolute abundance of ARGs in a given sample is not a significant  
218 value, as it is proportional to the total DNA present in the sample; hence, ARG  
219 relative abundance was calculated, by normalizing the ARG copy number to 16S  
220 rRNA gene copy, and used in the statistical analysis.

221

## 222 **2.6 Statistical analysis**

223 Differences in ARG occurrence (presence/absence) over types of samples  
224 (manure/slurry, soil before fertilization, or soil 1 month after fertilization) and  
225 livestock farms (i.e. dairy cattle, swine or chickens) were tested using generalized  
226 linear models (GLMs) with a logit link function, binomial error distribution and a  
227 cluster-robust sandwich variance estimator to account for clustering of samples

228 collected from the same farms, while differences in ARG abundance were compared  
229 using Kruskal-Wallis test with Dunn's test for multiple comparisons. Differences in  
230 antimicrobial residues over livestock farms and types of samples were tested using  
231 Tobit regression on log-transformed residue concentrations with the left-censoring  
232 limit set at the minimum detection threshold. To assess the association between  
233 antimicrobial residues concentration and ARG relative abundance over sample type,  
234 Spearman rank correlation analysis was performed. To assess the association between  
235 the relative abundance of microbial taxa at phylum and family levels with the ARGs,  
236 multivariate regression analysis with several dependent variables (i.e. log-  
237 transformed relative abundances of the microbial taxa) was used to jointly regress on  
238 the same independent variables (i.e. presence/absence of the different ARGs), while  
239 adjusting for livestock farm and type of sample, and accounting for clustering of  
240 observations at the farm level (cluster variable) using bias-corrected and accelerated  
241 cluster-bootstrapped standard errors (1000 replications). Since manure/slurry were  
242 considered as a unique statistical unit, hereafter we will use the term manure to refer  
243 to manure/slurry samples. Statistical analysis and data visualization were carried out  
244 in R (version 3.6.3) (<https://www.r-project.org/>).

245

## 246 **3. Results**

### 247 **3.1 Prevalence and quantification of antimicrobials**

248 Out of 93 samples, only 39 were found positive to at least one antimicrobial.

249 Flumequine was found in 38 samples, although in eight it was detected as traces

250 (<CC $\alpha$ ). Of the 14 antimicrobials investigated, six were detected in at least one  
251 sample; flumequine was the most detected (38/93; 40.86% of the total samples),  
252 followed by enrofloxacin (7/93; 7.53%), tylosin (3/93; 3.22%), and marbofloxacin,  
253 ampicillin and ciprofloxacin (2/93; 2.15%) at a much lower prevalence. Flumequine  
254 and enrofloxacin were the only compounds identified also in soil, while the  
255 remainders were detected only in manure. The prevalence of antimicrobials in swine  
256 and chicken farms was similar (22 vs. 16 samples, respectively). However,  
257 flumequine was more prevalent in swine samples (73.33%) than in chicken samples  
258 (53.33%), although the difference was not significant ( $p > 0.05$ ). Marbofloxacin was  
259 detected only in swine, ciprofloxacin only in chickens and swine, and ampicillin in  
260 one sample of chicken and dairy cattle farms, respectively. Antimicrobial  
261 concentrations ranged from below the decision limit (CC $\alpha$ ) to 437.38 ng/g  
262 (flumequine). The average concentration of flumequine in manure was 24.79 ng/g,  
263 while in soil before and after fertilization was 77.77 ng/g and 109.36 ng/g,  
264 respectively (Fig. 1A). However, the difference between soil and manure samples and  
265 between fertilized and unfertilized soil was not significant ( $p > 0.05$ ). Considering the  
266 livestock sector, flumequine concentrations were not different in swine and chicken  
267 samples, but these were significantly higher ( $p < 0.001$ ) in comparison to samples  
268 from dairy cattle, in which it was never detected (Fig. 1B).

269

### 270 **3.2 General description of DNA sequences**

271 After the quality-filter step, removal of chimeric fragments and reads merging, a total  
272 of 2,851,500 reads were obtained with 35,921 different features, with an average of  
273 30,661 sequences per individual sample. Filtering by quality, three samples were  
274 excluded and 90 were considered in the downstream analyses. The rarefaction curves  
275 for samples plateaued, indicating that the obtained sequencing depth was good  
276 (supplementary material 5).

277

### 278 **3.3 Composition of bacterial communities**

279 Using 16S rRNA gene sequencing, the microbial community structure of samples  
280 was characterized. At phylum level, members of the Firmicutes and Bacteroidetes  
281 dominated the community composition of manure samples. While Bacteroidetes were  
282 dominant also in soil samples, Firmicutes were significantly ( $p < 0.05$ ) less abundant.  
283 On the contrary, Acidobacteria and Proteobacteria were significantly more abundant  
284 ( $p < 0.05$ ) in soil than in manure and, as a result, the heatmap at phylum level shows  
285 two main clusters, one grouping manure samples and one grouping soil samples (Fig.  
286 2). Network analysis at operational taxonomy unit (OTU) level based on the 3,000  
287 more abundant OTUs corroborated this finding, showing a marked separation  
288 between manure and soil samples (Fig. 3). Despite this clear separation when  
289 considering the whole bacterial community, significant ( $p < 0.05$ ) changes in specific  
290 phyla (i.e. Cloacimonetes, Firmicutes and Tenericutes) after fertilization were  
291 observed. Within manure samples, while Firmicutes were highly abundant in all farm  
292 types, Proteobacteria and Actinobacteria phyla were more abundant in chicken

293 manure samples, while a higher percentage of Bacteroidetes was identified in dairy  
294 cattle and swine. As a result, two distinct clusters within manure samples were  
295 observed, one containing chicken manure samples and one containing dairy cattle and  
296 swine samples (Fig. 2).

297

### 298 **3.4 Bacterial community $\alpha$ -diversity**

299 The  $\alpha$ -diversity, i.e. the diversity within each sample type, was evaluated at OTU  
300 level using two methods, the Shannon index and Chao1 (Fig. 4). Both measurements  
301 showed a significantly ( $p < 0.05$ ) lower  $\alpha$ -diversity in manure samples in comparison  
302 to soil samples, both pre- and post-fertilization. On the contrary, the  $\alpha$ -diversity was  
303 comparable between soil samples before and after manure application. When  
304 considering the diversity within samples belonging to the same livestock sector, dairy  
305 cattle farms were characterized by the lowest  $\alpha$ -diversity, while swine showed the  
306 highest  $\alpha$ -diversity. The difference in  $\alpha$ -diversity between farm type samples was  
307 highly significant ( $p < 0.001$ ).

308

### 309 **3.5 Comparison among bacterial communities ( $\beta$ -diversity)**

310 To compare the bacterial communities between sample types ( $\beta$ -diversity) at OTU  
311 level, PCoA and NMDS ordination together with PERMANOVA were used. This  
312 analysis showed that the microbial community in manure was significantly different  
313 ( $p < 0.001$ ) from that of soil before and after fertilization, whereas there was no  
314 significant difference between fertilized and unfertilized soil. This finding was



315 supported by PCoA and NMDS graphs (Fig. 5A, B), showing a marked difference in  
316 bacterial communities composition between manure and soil and the clustering of  
317 soil samples before and after fertilization. Pairwise PERMANOVA also showed that  
318 differences in microbial community composition between farm types were highly  
319 significant ( $p < 0.001$ ), and PCoA and NMDS graphs confirmed these observations  
320 (Fig. 5C, D).

321

### 322 **3.6 Prevalence and relative abundance of ARGs**

323 Besides microbial community characterization, the prevalence and abundance of  
324 ARGs in manure and soil samples was investigated to assess whether manure  
325 application enriched ARG abundance and diversity in the soil. Of the 20 ARGs  
326 investigated, all but *qnrA* and *bla<sub>NDM</sub>* genes, were detected in at least one sample.  
327 *Bla<sub>TEM-1</sub>* (89.25%) and *ermB* (81.72%) were the most prevalent ARGs, followed by  
328 *ermA* (65.59%), *bla<sub>CMY-2</sub>* (58.06%) and *bla<sub>OXA-1</sub>* (45.16%), while the prevalence of the  
329 other genes ranged from 30.11% (*bla<sub>CTX-M-1LIKE</sub>*) to 3.23% (*mcr-2*) (supplementary  
330 material 6). *Mcr-2* was detected only in manure samples, while *bla<sub>VIM-2</sub>* was present  
331 only in soil. No target genes emerged in soil after manure application (supplementary  
332 material 6). A significant increase in the number of ARG positive soil samples after  
333 fertilization was observed for *ermA*, *ermB*, *qnrS*, *bla<sub>CMY-2</sub>* and *bla<sub>OXA-1</sub>* (Fig. 6A).  
334 When considering the different livestock sectors, only swine samples were positive  
335 for *mcr-2*, whereas no *bla<sub>OXA-48</sub>* and *bla<sub>SHV</sub>* were detected in samples from this sector.

336 The total abundance of ARGs normalized to 16S rRNA for each sample ranged from  
337  $1.24 \times 10^{-14}$  to 0.06 ARG copy per million copy of 16S rRNA. Soil samples before  
338 manure application showed lower total ARG abundance in comparison to soil after  
339 fertilization, possibly reflecting the legacy of manure application, as manure samples  
340 had the highest total abundance of the target genes (Fig. 6B). Target genes did not  
341 show the same abundance patterns, and the relative abundance of some genes varied  
342 between sample categories; *ermA*, *ermB*, *bla<sub>OXA-1</sub>*, and *oqxA* had similar dynamics,  
343 being significantly enriched ( $p < 0.05$ ) in soil after manure application (Fig. 6C, D, E  
344 and F), while *bla<sub>CTX-M-LIKE</sub>*, *bla<sub>SHV</sub>*, and *bla<sub>TEM-1</sub>* were significantly more abundant in  
345 manure than soil ( $p < 0.05$ ), but their relative abundance decreased after fertilization  
346 (Fig. 6G, H, and J). *QnrS* was significantly more abundant in manure than in  
347 untreated soil ( $p < 0.001$ ), with trends towards enrichment after fertilization ( $p =$   
348 0.048) (Fig. 6I). The remaining target genes showed a low relative abundance and no  
349 differences between sample categories were observed. Comparisons between  
350 livestock sectors showed higher numbers of target gene copies in swine samples,  
351 whereas dairy cattle samples had the lowest abundance (Fig. 6B). Specifically,  
352 *bla<sub>OXA-1</sub>*, *ermB*, *mcr-1* and *qnrS* were significantly ( $p < 0.05$ ) more abundant in swine  
353 samples than the other two sectors (Fig. 7).

354

### 355 **3.7 Co-occurrence between ARGs and bacterial taxa**

356 Co-occurrence patterns between the ARGs and the main microbial taxa were

357 explored at the phylum level by using multivariate regression analysis. A positive

358 correlation was observed between *ermA* and two phyla, Bacteroidetes ( $\beta$ -coefficient =  
359 0.173,  $p < 0.01$ ) and Hydrogenedentes ( $\beta$ -coefficient = 0.059,  $p = 0.04$ ), suggesting  
360 that these phyla may harbour *ermA*. Acidobacteria ( $\beta$ -coefficient = 0.144,  $p = 0.046$ )  
361 and Gemmatimonadetes ( $\beta$ -coefficient = 0.138,  $p = 0.044$ ) co-occurred with *oqxA*,  
362 while Spirochaetes may be potential hosts for *bla<sub>OXA-1</sub>* ( $\beta$ -coefficient = 0.169,  $p =$   
363 0.05) and *mcr-1* ( $\beta$ -coefficient = 0.347,  $p < 0.001$ ) genes.

364

### 365 **3.8 Correlation analysis between antimicrobials and ARGs**

366 The correlation analysis between antimicrobial concentration and the relative  
367 abundance of the 18 ARGs detected using Spearman's bivariate correlation analysis  
368 was performed considering only flumequine, since the low number of observations  
369 for the remaining antimicrobials made the analysis not possible. The analysis showed  
370 positive correlations between flumequine concentration and the abundance of *oqxA*  
371 (Spearman  $r = 0.2836$ ,  $p = 0.006$ ) and *qnrS* (Spearman  $r = 0.2715$ ,  $p = 0.008$ ), while  
372 no significant correlation was observed for the other genes conferring resistance to  
373 (fluoro)quinolones, nor any other ARGs.

374

## 375 **4. Discussion**

### 376 **4.1 Antimicrobials prevalence in soil and manure**

377 A low percentage of positive samples (42%) was found in the study, and only six out  
378 of the 14 antimicrobials screened were detected. Although flumequine is an old-  
379 generation (fluoro)quinolone relatively used in chickens and swine due to its low

380 costs and good tolerability mainly, it was the most detected compound (97.4%) in  
381 these livestock and the only antimicrobial detected in soil. This is in agreement with  
382 its known high persistence in manure, where it can remain after one year, thus its  
383 environmental presence was quite expected (Berendsen et al., 2018).

384

#### 385 **4.1 Impact of manure application on soil microbiome**

386 The microbial composition for both manure and soil samples is in agreement with  
387 previous studies; the most abundant phyla identified are those typical of manure and  
388 soil microbiomes and the manure microbiome is confirmed to be less diverse than  
389 that of soil (Chen et al., 2015; Fierer, 2017; Hamm et al., 2016; Looft et al., 2012). In  
390 accordance with previous observations (Riber et al., 2014; Xie et al., 2018), manure  
391 application showed limited influence on soil microbial community and did not  
392 increase soil diversity, but rather caused significant changes only in a few phyla.  
393 Firmicutes, representing the most abundant phylum in manure, was enriched in soil  
394 after fertilization as previously reported (Rieke et al., 2018). However, several studies  
395 have shown an increase of soil microbial diversity after manure application and  
396 significant changes in the whole microbial community composition (Chen et al.,  
397 2015, 2019; Zhen et al., 2014), indicating that in some cases fertilization may have a  
398 strong impact on soil. These contrasting results might be due to the inability of most  
399 manure-associated bacteria to survive for long periods in soil, making the time of  
400 sampling a key factor and suggesting that manure microbiome might influence only  
401 temporarily the soil microbial community (Leclercq et al., 2016; Rieke et al., 2018).

402 Furthermore, factors other than manure application (i.e. temperature, moisture, pH,  
403 seasonality) are known to influence soil microbial composition over time, and might  
404 be accountable for such contrasting results (Classen et al., 2015; Fierer, 2017;  
405 Lopatto et al., 2019). Here, the sampling was carried out over 18 months (but mostly  
406 during winter); however, pH, humidity and temperature were comparable among  
407 most of the farms (supplementary material 1). Overall, data gathered in this study  
408 indicate that manure application has only a limited effect on soil microbiome at day  
409 30 post-fertilization.

410

#### 411 **4.2 Abundance of ARGs and their fate in soil after fertilization**

412 Aiming to understand whether ARGs disseminate from manure to soil, the prevalence  
413 and relative abundance of selected genes were assessed in manure and soil before and  
414 after fertilization. The highest number of total ARG copies was detected in manure  
415 and a clear increase in ARG abundance was observed in soil after fertilization.  
416 According to previous studies, this finding indicates that manure increased ARG  
417 abundance in soil (Marti et al., 2014; Xia et al., 2019a; Xiong et al., 2015; Zhao et al.,  
418 2017). None of the selected ARGs emerged in soil after manure application,  
419 suggesting that such practice might effectively enrich but not introduce any of the  
420 screened genes. The ARGs investigated in our study did not show the same  
421 abundance pattern, and only four genes (i.e. *ermA*, *ermB*, *bla<sub>oxa-1</sub>* and *oqxA*) were  
422 significantly enriched in manure-amended soil. Both *ermA* and *ermB* have been  
423 demonstrated to be able to spread and persist in soil after fertilization with swine

424 manure (Lopatto et al., 2019; Marti et al., 2013; Zhang et al., 2017), while an increase  
425 in *bla<sub>oxa-1</sub>* abundance in farmland soil has been previously associated with irrigation  
426 with wastewater from swine farms showing high abundance of this gene (Yang et al.,  
427 2019). Xiong et al. (2015) reported higher *oqxA* abundance in fertilized soil in  
428 comparison with the untreated control at one month after manure application;  
429 however, at day 60, the relative abundance of the gene was lower than in the control  
430 group, potentially indicating dissipation of *oqxA* in the soil. A similar dynamic was  
431 also observed for other plasmid-mediated quinolone resistance (PMQR) genes, which  
432 disappeared within two months after manure application (Xiong et al., 2015). Lopatto  
433 et al. (2019) traced *ermB* and *ermC* abundance in treated soil over a period of six  
434 months, while the former was more abundant in the fertilized soil up to the last time  
435 point, the latter decreased after three months, suggesting that each ARG possessed a  
436 different dissipation dynamic. *Bla<sub>TEM-1</sub>* and the extended-spectrum  $\beta$ -lactamase  
437 (ESBL)-encoding genes, *bla<sub>CTX-M-LIKE</sub>* and *bla<sub>SHV</sub>*, known to be widespread in the  
438 environment (Graham et al., 2016), were significantly more abundant in manure than  
439 in soil and showed a decrease after manure application, pointing at a dilution effect in  
440 the soil after fertilization (Yang et al., 2019). Here, ARG abundance was investigated  
441 only at day 30 post-fertilization, hampering to assess the impact of manure-derived  
442 ARGs on the soil at multiple time points and to establish the dissipation dynamic of  
443 the genes in agricultural soil, and future studies should aim at this. Together with the  
444 dissemination of ARGs from manure to the environment, we investigated the  
445 differences in ARG abundance in dairy cattle, chicken and swine farms. Not

446 surprisingly, swine farms showed the highest total ARG abundance, and *bla*<sub>oxa-1</sub>,  
447 *ermB*, *mcr-1* and *qnrS* were significantly more abundant in this sector in comparison  
448 to the others (Chen et al., 2019; Marti et al., 2014; Xia et al., 2019a). Differences in  
449 ARG levels between livestock sectors might rely on differences in physiologies of  
450 animals, but also on differences in manure treatment and storage (Chen et al., 2007;  
451 Sandberg and LaPara, 2016). Most of the sampled farms employed the same manure  
452 storage strategy (i.e. open-air pit), while the duration of the storage before manure  
453 application ranged from no longer than 120 days for dairy cattle farms, to 360 days  
454 for swine farms, pointing out that a longer storage might contribute to a high ARG  
455 abundance in manure. Despite the low prevalence and not being enriched by  
456 fertilization, the detection of the carbapenemase-gene *bla*<sub>oxa-48</sub> both in manure and  
457 soil raises public health concerns due to the clinical importance of these drugs as last  
458 resort treatment in human medicine (Nordmann et al., 2011). Interestingly, the  
459 carbapenemase-gene *bla*<sub>VIM-2</sub> was detected merely in soil, suggesting that this gene of  
460 human/animal origin can be maintained in the environment (Scotta et al., 2011).  
461 Manure application has been historically recognized as the main source of  
462 dissemination in the environment of *mcr* genes, conferring resistance to colistin,  
463 another critically important antimicrobial and last resort drug against human  
464 infections caused by multidrug resistant Gram-negative bacteria (Kempf et al., 2016;  
465 Liu et al., 2016; Xia et al., 2019b). *Mcr-1* to *mcr-5* genes were detected with a  
466 prevalence as high as 25% in manure; however, since none of the genes was enriched  
467 in soil after fertilization, and *mcr-2* and *mcr-4* were not detected in fertilized soil,

468 manure application may not be a driver of the spread of these genes in the  
469 environment. As a whole, the ARGs investigated did not display uniform dynamics in  
470 soil after manure application.

471

### 472 **4.3 Correlation analysis between flumequine concentration, taxa and ARGs** 473 **abundances**

474 As previously mentioned, due to the low positivity for most of the antimicrobials  
475 investigated in this study, the possible correlation between antimicrobial  
476 concentration and ARG abundance was explored only for flumequine. The increase  
477 in flumequine concentration in soil after manure application was correlated to an  
478 increase in relative abundance of two genes conferring resistance to  
479 (fluoro)quinolones (i.e. *oqxA* and *qnrS*), suggesting that flumequine might enhance  
480 the accumulation of these PMQR genes in manure-amended soil or slow down their  
481 dissipation, as previously reported for other (fluoro)quinolones (Xiong et al., 2015).  
482 *OqxA* and *qnrS* accumulation in soil under the selective pressure of flumequine might  
483 be the result of different processes; indeed, the increase of ARGs in soil after  
484 fertilization might be due to the direct addition of bacteria originating from the  
485 manure, from proliferation of bacteria present in the soil or indirectly via gene  
486 spreading mediated by HGT (Ahmed et al., 2018; Heuer et al., 2011; Marti et al.,  
487 2014; Rieke et al., 2018). *OqxA* co-occurrence with Acidobacteria and  
488 Gemmatimonadetes, which were more abundant in soil than in manure, suggests that  
489 the application of manure carrying flumequine may promote the proliferation of



490 bacteria harbouring *oqxA* already present in the environment. On the contrary, *qnrS*  
491 did not correlate to any specific phyla and consequently its spread in soil might be  
492 due to HGT. Independently from the process by which the accumulation of these two  
493 genes occurred, this finding represents a concern for public health and should lead to  
494 reconsider the use of flumequine in the veterinary field. Indeed, both *oqxA* and *qnrS*  
495 confer resistance not only to flumequine, which is a first generation (fluoro)quinolone  
496 with a limited spectrum of activity (Daly and Silverstein, 2009), but also to other  
497 (fluoro)quinolones (e.g. ciprofloxacin, levofloxacin, norfloxacin, and nalidixic acid)  
498 widely used to treat human bacterial infections (Jacoby et al., 2014; Kim et al., 2009).  
499 *ErmA* co-occurred with two phyla (i.e. Bacteroidetes and Hydrogenedentes) showing  
500 similar abundance in manure and soil; hence the increase in *ermA* abundance in soil  
501 after fertilization might be due to HGT (Murphy, 1985). Spirochaetes, a phylum more  
502 abundant in manure, showed a positive correlation with *bla<sub>oxa-1</sub>* and *mcr-1*, two genes  
503 characterized by a different dynamic in amended soil; while *bla<sub>oxa-1</sub>* abundance  
504 significantly increased after manure application, *mcr-1* seems to follow the fate of  
505 Spirochaetes, not being enriched in the soil (Gao et al., 2019). *Bla<sub>oxa-1</sub>* enrichment in  
506 soil might be due to HGT to other bacteria present before manure application, since  
507 this gene is commonly found in plasmids and integrons in several Gram-negative  
508 bacteria (Poirel et al., 2010).

509

## 510 **5. Conclusion**

511 In the present study we analysed manure and soil samples from integrated farms  
512 located in Northern Italy; by combining LC-MS/MS, qPCR and 16S rRNA gene  
513 sequencing, we demonstrated that fertilization may affect the abundance of specific  
514 ARGs in soil. The main conclusions of our study are:

- 515 - Manure-derived bacteria does not survive in soil, and manure application do  
516 not drastically affect the soil microbiome, since at 30 days after fertilization  
517 only three phyla were significantly enriched.
- 518 - ARGs showed different dynamic patterns in soil; while *ermA*, *ermB*, *bla<sub>OXA-1</sub>*,  
519 *oqxA* and *qnrS* enriched, *bla<sub>CTX-M-1LIKE</sub>*, *bla<sub>SHV</sub>*, and *bla<sub>TEM-1</sub>* disappeared after  
520 manure application, suggesting that different manure-derived genes experience  
521 different fates in soil.
- 522 - Flumequine may exert a selective pressure for the accumulation of *oqxA* and  
523 *qnrS* in fertilized soil; hence, the use of flumequine in the veterinary field  
524 should be reconsidered.
- 525 - The different dairy cattle, chicken and swine farms displayed different  
526 microbial communities, and the latter was characterized by the highest  
527 abundance of ARGs, of which *bla<sub>OXA-1</sub>*, *ermB*, *mcr-1* and *qnrS* were  
528 significantly more abundant than in the other two livestock sectors.

529

530 **Acknowledgment**

531 The authors wish to thank Ilias Apostolakos, Kevin Nogarotto, Osvaldo Parolin,  
532 Francesco Tonon, Martina Penati, Arianna Scalabrin, for their contribution to the  
533 realization of the work.

534

### 535 **Funding**

536 This work was supported by the Italian Ministry of Research and University (PRIN  
537 Project 2015, prot. 2015KA3XFH).

538

### 539 **Declaration of competing interest**

540 The authors declare no conflict of interest.

541

### 542 **Author contributions**

543 **Andrea Laconi:** Formal analysis; Conceptualization; Data Curation; Visualization;  
544 Writing - Original Draft; Writing - Review & Editing. **Lapo Mughini-Gras:** Formal  
545 analysis; Writing - Original Draft; Writing - Review & Editing. **Roberta Tolosi:**  
546 Investigation; Data Curation; Validation. **Guido Grilli:** Conceptualization;  
547 Investigation; Writing - Review & Editing. **Angela Trocino:** Conceptualization;  
548 Investigation; Writing - Review & Editing. **Lisa Carraro:** Investigation; Data  
549 Curation. **Federica Di Cesare:** Investigation; Formal analysis; Validation. **Petra**  
550 **Cagnardi:** Conceptualization; Supervision; Project administration; Funding  
551 acquisition; Investigation; Validation; Writing - Original Draft; Writing - Review &  
552 Editing. **Alessandra Piccirillo:** Conceptualization; Supervision; Project

553 administration; Funding acquisition; Writing - Original Draft; Writing - Review &  
554 Editing.

555 **References**

- 556 Ahmed, W., Zhang, Q., Lobos, A., Senkbeil, J., Sadowsky, M.J., Harwood, V.J.,  
557 Saeidi, N., Marinoni, O., Ishii, S., 2018. Precipitation influences pathogenic  
558 bacteria and antibiotic resistance gene abundance in storm drain outfalls in  
559 coastal sub-tropical waters. *Environ. Int.* 116, 308–318.  
560 <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.envint.2018.04.005>
- 561 Berendonk, T.U., Manaia, C.M., Merlin, C., Fatta-Kassinos, D., Cytryn, E., Walsh,  
562 F., Bürgmann, H., Sørum, H., Norström, M., Pons, M.N., Kreuzinger, N.,  
563 Huovinen, P., Stefani, S., Schwartz, T., Kisand, V., Baquero, F., Martinez, J.L.,  
564 2015. Tackling antibiotic resistance: The environmental framework. *Nat. Rev.*  
565 *Microbiol.* 13, 310–317. <https://doi.org/10.1038/nrmicro3439>
- 566 Berendsen, B.J.A., Lahr, J., Nibbeling, C., Jansen, L.J.M., Bongers, I.E.A., Wipfler,  
567 E.L., van de Schans, M.G.M., 2018. The persistence of a broad range of  
568 antibiotics during calve, pig and broiler manure storage. *Chemosphere* 204, 267–  
569 276. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.chemosphere.2018.04.042>
- 570 Bolyen, E., Rideout, J.R., Dillon, M.R., Bokulich, N.A., Abnet, C.C., Al-Ghalith,  
571 G.A., Alexander, H., Alm, E.J., Arumugam, M., Asnicar, F., Bai, Y., Bisanz,  
572 J.E., Bittinger, K., Brejnrod, A., Brislawn, C.J., Brown, C.T., Callahan, B.J.,  
573 Caraballo-Rodríguez, A.M., Chase, J., Cope, E.K., Da Silva, R., Diener, C.,  
574 Dorrestein, P.C., Douglas, G.M., Durall, D.M., Duvallet, C., Edwardson, C.F.,  
575 Ernst, M., Estaki, M., Fouquier, J., Gauglitz, J.M., Gibbons, S.M., Gibson, D.L.,  
576 Gonzalez, A., Gorlick, K., Guo, J., Hillmann, B., Holmes, S., Holste, H.,

577 Huttenhower, C., Huttley, G.A., Janssen, S., Jarmusch, A.K., Jiang, L., Kaehler,  
578 B.D., Kang, K. Bin, Keefe, C.R., Keim, P., Kelley, S.T., Knights, D., Koester, I.,  
579 Kosciulek, T., Kreps, J., Langille, M.G.I., Lee, J., Ley, R., Liu, Y.X., Loftfield,  
580 E., Lozupone, C., Maher, M., Marotz, C., Martin, B.D., McDonald, D., McIver,  
581 L.J., Melnik, A. V., Metcalf, J.L., Morgan, S.C., Morton, J.T., Naimey, A.T.,  
582 Navas-Molina, J.A., Nothias, L.F., Orchanian, S.B., Pearson, T., Peoples, S.L.,  
583 Petras, D., Preuss, M.L., Pruesse, E., Rasmussen, L.B., Rivers, A., Robeson,  
584 M.S., Rosenthal, P., Segata, N., Shaffer, M., Shiffer, A., Sinha, R., Song, S.J.,  
585 Spear, J.R., Swafford, A.D., Thompson, L.R., Torres, P.J., Trinh, P., Tripathi, A.,  
586 Turnbaugh, P.J., Ul-Hasan, S., van der Hooft, J.J.J., Vargas, F., Vázquez-Baeza,  
587 Y., Vogtmann, E., von Hippel, M., Walters, W., Wan, Y., Wang, M., Warren, J.,  
588 Weber, K.C., Williamson, C.H.D., Willis, A.D., Xu, Z.Z., Zaneveld, J.R., Zhang,  
589 Y., Zhu, Q., Knight, R., Caporaso, J.G., 2019. Reproducible, interactive, scalable  
590 and extensible microbiome data science using QIIME 2. *Nat. Biotechnol.* 37,  
591 852–857. <https://doi.org/10.1038/s41587-019-0209-9>

592 Callahan, B.J., McMurdie, P.J., Rosen, M.J., Han, A.W., Johnson, A.J.A., Holmes,  
593 S.P., 2016. DADA2: High-resolution sample inference from Illumina amplicon  
594 data. *Nat. Methods* 13, 581–583. <https://doi.org/10.1038/nmeth.3869>

595 Chen, J., Yu, Z., Michel, F.C., Wittum, T., Morrison, M., 2007. Development and  
596 application of real-time PCR assays for quantification of *erm* genes conferring  
597 resistance to macrolides-lincosamides-streptogramin B in livestock manure and  
598 manure management systems. *Appl. Environ. Microbiol.* 73, 4407–4416.

599 <https://doi.org/10.1128/AEM.02799-06>

600 Chen, X., Li, Z., Liu, M., Jiang, C., Che, Y., 2015. Microbial community and  
601 functional diversity associated with different aggregate fractions of a paddy soil  
602 fertilized with organic manure and/or NPK fertilizer for 20 years. *J. Soils  
603 Sediments* 15, 292–301. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s11368-014-0981-6>

604 Chen, Z., Zhang, W., Yang, L., Stedtfeld, R.D., Peng, A., Gu, C., Boyd, S.A., Li, H.,  
605 2019. Antibiotic resistance genes and bacterial communities in cornfield and  
606 pasture soils receiving swine and dairy manures. *Environ. Pollut.* 248, 947–957.  
607 <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.envpol.2019.02.093>

608 Chiesa, L.M., Nobile, M., Malandra, R., Panseri, S., Arioli, F., 2018. Occurrence of  
609 antibiotics in mussels and clams from various FAO areas. *Food Chem.* 240, 16–  
610 23. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.foodchem.2017.07.072>

611 Classen, A.T., Sundqvist, M.K., Henning, J.A., Newman, G.S., Moore, J.A.M.,  
612 Cregger, M.A., Moorhead, L.C., Patterson, C.M., 2015. Direct and indirect  
613 effects of climate change on soil microbial and soil microbial-plant interactions:  
614 What lies ahead? *Ecosphere* 6. <https://doi.org/10.1890/ES15-00217.1>

615 Das, Suwendu, Jeong, S.T., Das, Subhasis, Kim, P.J., 2017. Composted cattle manure  
616 increases microbial activity and soil fertility more than composted swine manure  
617 in a submerged rice paddy. *Front. Microbiol.* 8, 1–10.  
618 <https://doi.org/10.3389/fmicb.2017.01702>

619 Dong, W.Y., Zhang, X.Y., Dai, X.Q., Fu, X.L., Yang, F.T., Liu, X.Y., Sun, X.M.,  
620 Wen, X.F., Schaeffer, S., 2014. Changes in soil microbial community

621 composition in response to fertilization of paddy soils in subtropical China. *Appl.*  
622 *Soil Ecol.* 84, 140–147. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.apsoil.2014.06.007>

623 European commission, 2002. Commission Decision 2002/657/EC of 12 August 2002  
624 implementing Council Directive 96/23/EC concerning the performance of  
625 analytical methods and the interpretation of results. *Off. J. Eur. Union.*

626 European Union, 2008. European Commission, Health and Consumer Protection,  
627 Directorate General, Directorate E, Safety of the Food Chain, Document  
628 SANCO/2004/2726-revision 4, December 2008, Guidelines for the  
629 Implementation of Decision 2002/657/EC.

630 Fierer, N., 2017. Embracing the unknown: Disentangling the complexities of the soil  
631 microbiome. *Nat. Rev. Microbiol.* 15, 579–590.  
632 <https://doi.org/10.1038/nrmicro.2017.87>

633 Gao, Y., Lu, C., Shen, D., Liu, J., Ma, Z., Yang, B., Ling, W., Waigi, M.G., 2019.  
634 Elimination of the risks of colistin resistance gene (*mcr-1*) in livestock manure  
635 during composting. *Environ. Int.* 126, 61–68.  
636 <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.envint.2019.02.015>

637 Graham, D.W., Knapp, C.W., Christensen, B.T., McCluskey, S., Dolfing, J., 2016.  
638 Appearance of  $\beta$ -lactam Resistance Genes in Agricultural Soils and Clinical  
639 Isolates over the 20 th Century. *Sci. Rep.* 6, 1–8.  
640 <https://doi.org/10.1038/srep21550>

641 Hamm, A.C., Tenuta, M., Krause, D.O., Ominski, K.H., Tkachuk, V.L., Flaten, D.N.,  
642 2016. Bacterial communities of an agricultural soil amended with solid pig and



643 dairy manures, and urea fertilizer. *Appl. Soil Ecol.* 103, 61–71.  
644 <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.apsoil.2016.02.015>

645 Heuer, H., Schmitt, H., Smalla, K., 2011. Antibiotic resistance gene spread due to  
646 manure application on agricultural fields. *Curr. Opin. Microbiol.* 14, 236–243.  
647 <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.mib.2011.04.009>

648 Hou, J., Wan, W., Mao, D., Wang, C., Mu, Q., Qin, S., Luo, Y., 2015. Occurrence  
649 and distribution of sulfonamides, tetracyclines, quinolones, macrolides, and  
650 nitrofurans in livestock manure and amended soils of Northern China. *Environ.*  
651 *Sci. Pollut. Res.* 22, 4545–4554. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s11356-014-3632-y>

652 Hruby, C.E., Soupir, M.L., Moorman, T.B., Shelley, M., Kanwar, R.S., 2016. Effects  
653 of tillage and poultry manure application rates on *Salmonella* and fecal indicator  
654 bacteria concentrations in tiles draining Des Moines Lobe soils. *J. Environ.*  
655 *Manage.* 171, 60–69. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jenvman.2016.01.040>

656 Jacoby, G.A., Strahilevitz, J., Hooper, D.C., 2014. Plasmid-mediated quinolone  
657 resistance. *Microbiol. Spectr.* 2, 10.1128/microbiolspec.PLAS-0006–2013.  
658 <https://doi.org/10.1128/microbiolspec.PLAS-0006-2013>

659 Kempf, I., Jouy, E., Chauvin, C., 2016. Colistin use and colistin resistance in bacteria  
660 from animals. *Int. J. Antimicrob. Agents* 48, 598–606.  
661 <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ijantimicag.2016.09.016>

662 Kim, B.H., Wang, M., Chi, H.P., Kim, E.C., Jacoby, G.A., Hooper, D.C., 2009.  
663 oqxAB encoding a multidrug efflux pump in human clinical isolates of  
664 Enterobacteriaceae. *Antimicrob. Agents Chemother.* 53, 3582–3584.

665 <https://doi.org/10.1128/AAC.01574-08>

666 Kumari, P., Choi, H.L., Sudiarto, S.I.A., 2015. Assessment of bacterial community  
667 assembly patterns and processes in pig manure slurry. *PLoS One* 10, 1–12.  
668 <https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pone.0139437>

669 Leclercq, S.O., Wang, C., Sui, Z., Wu, H., Zhu, B., Deng, Y., Feng, J., 2016. A  
670 multiplayer game: species of *Clostridium*, *Acinetobacter*, and *Pseudomonas* are  
671 responsible for the persistence of antibiotic resistance genes in manure-treated  
672 soils. *Environ. Microbiol.* 18, 3494–3508. [https://doi.org/10.1111/1462-](https://doi.org/10.1111/1462-2920.13337)  
673 [2920.13337](https://doi.org/10.1111/1462-2920.13337)

674 Liu, Y.Y., Wang, Y., Walsh, T.R., Yi, L.X., Zhang, R., Spencer, J., Doi, Y., Tian, G.,  
675 Dong, B., Huang, X., Yu, L.F., Gu, D., Ren, H., Chen, X., Lv, L., He, D., Zhou,  
676 H., Liang, Z., Liu, J.H., Shen, J., 2016. Emergence of plasmid-mediated colistin  
677 resistance mechanism MCR-1 in animals and human beings in China: A  
678 microbiological and molecular biological study. *Lancet Infect. Dis.* 16, 161–168.  
679 [https://doi.org/10.1016/S1473-3099\(15\)00424-7](https://doi.org/10.1016/S1473-3099(15)00424-7)

680 Looft, T., Johnson, T.A., Allen, H.K., Bayles, D.O., Alt, D.P., Stedtfeld, R.D., Sul,  
681 W.J., Stedtfeld, T.M., Chai, B., Cole, J.R., Hashsham, S.A., Tiedje, J.M.,  
682 Stanton, T.B., 2012. In-feed antibiotic effects on the swine intestinal  
683 microbiome. *Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. U. S. A.* 109, 1691–1696.  
684 <https://doi.org/10.1073/pnas.1120238109>

685 Lopatto, E., Choi, J., Colina, A., Ma, L., Howe, A., Hinsa-Leasure, S., 2019.  
686 Characterizing the soil microbiome and quantifying antibiotic resistance gene

687 dynamics in agricultural soil following swine CAFO manure application. *PLoS*  
688 *One* 14, e0220770. <https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pone.0220770>

689 Marti, R., Scott, A., Tien, Y.C., Murray, R., Sabourin, L., Zhang, Y., Topp, E., 2013.  
690 Impact of manure fertilization on the abundance of antibiotic-resistant bacteria  
691 and frequency of detection of antibiotic resistance genes in soil and on vegetables  
692 at harvest. *Appl. Environ. Microbiol.* 79, 5701–5709.  
693 <https://doi.org/10.1128/AEM.01682-13>

694 Marti, R., Tien, Y.C., Murray, R., Scott, A., Sabourin, L., Topp, E., 2014. Safely  
695 coupling livestock and crop production systems: How rapidly do antibiotic  
696 resistance genes dissipate in soil following a commercial application of swine or  
697 dairy manure? *Appl. Environ. Microbiol.* 80, 3258–3265.  
698 <https://doi.org/10.1128/AEM.00231-14>

699 Milan, M., Carraro, L., Fariselli, P., Martino, M.E., Cavalieri, D., Vitali, F., Boffo,  
700 L., Patarnello, T., Bargelloni, L., Cardazzo, B., 2018. Microbiota and  
701 environmental stress: how pollution affects microbial communities in Manila  
702 clams. *Aquat. Toxicol.* 194, 195–207.  
703 <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.aquatox.2017.11.019>

704 Munk, P., Knudsen, B.E., Lukjacenko, O., Duarte, A.S.R., Van Gompel, L., Luiken,  
705 R.E.C., Smit, L.A.M., Schmitt, H., Garcia, A.D., Hansen, R.B., Petersen, T.N.,  
706 Bossers, A., Ruppé, E., Graveland, H., van Essen, A., Gonzalez-Zorn, B.,  
707 Moyano, G., Sanders, P., Chauvin, C., David, J., Battisti, A., Caprioli, A.,  
708 Dewulf, J., Blaha, T., Wadepohl, K., Brandt, M., Wasyl, D., Skarzyńska, M.,

709 Zajac, M., Daskalov, H., Saatkamp, H.W., Stärk, K.D.C., Lund, O., Hald, T.,  
710 Pamp, S.J., Vigre, H., Heederik, D., Wagenaar, J.A., Mevius, D., Aarestrup,  
711 F.M., 2018. Abundance and diversity of the faecal resistome in slaughter pigs  
712 and broilers in nine European countries. *Nat. Microbiol.* 3, 898–908.  
713 <https://doi.org/10.1038/s41564-018-0192-9>

714 Murphy, E., 1985. Nucleotide sequence of *ermA*, a macrolide-lincosamide-  
715 streptogramin B determinant in *Staphylococcus aureus*. *J. Bacteriol.* 162, 633–  
716 640. <https://doi.org/10.1128/jb.162.2.633-640.1985>

717 Nordmann, P., Naas, T., Poirel, L., 2011. Global spread of carbapenemase producing  
718 Enterobacteriaceae. *Emerg. Infect. Dis.* 17, 1791–1798.  
719 <https://doi.org/10.3201/eid1710.110655>

720 Poirel, L., Naas, T., Nordmann, P., 2010. Diversity, epidemiology, and genetics of  
721 class D  $\beta$ -lactamases. *Antimicrob. Agents Chemother.* 54, 24–38.  
722 <https://doi.org/10.1128/AAC.01512-08>

723 Pruden, A., Arabi, M., Storteboom, H.N., 2012. Correlation Between Upstream  
724 Human Activities and Riverine Antibiotic Resistance Genes. *Environ. Sci.*  
725 *Technol.* 46, 11541–11549. <https://doi.org/10.1021/es302657r>

726 Qiang, Z., Macauley, J.J., Mormile, M.R., Surampalli, R., Adams, C.D., 2006.  
727 Treatment of Antibiotics and Antibiotic Resistant Bacteria in Swine Wastewater  
728 with Free Chlorine. *J. Agric. Food Chem.* 54, 8144–8154.  
729 <https://doi.org/10.1021/jf060779h>

730 Qiao, M., Ying, G.G., Singer, A.C., Zhu, Y.G., 2018. Review of antibiotic resistance

731 in China and its environment. *Environ. Int.* 110, 160–172.  
732 <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.envint.2017.10.016>

733 Riber, L., Poulsen, P.H.B., Al-Soud, W.A., Skov Hansen, L.B., Bergmark, L.,  
734 Brejnrod, A., Norman, A., Hansen, L.H., Magid, J., Sørensen, S.J., 2014.  
735 Exploring the immediate and long-term impact on bacterial communities in soil  
736 amended with animal and urban organic waste fertilizers using pyrosequencing  
737 and screening for horizontal transfer of antibiotic resistance. *FEMS Microbiol.*  
738 *Ecol.* 90, 206–224. <https://doi.org/10.1111/1574-6941.12403>

739 Rieke, E.L., Soupir, M.L., Moorman, T.B., Yang, F., Howe, A.C., 2018. Temporal  
740 Dynamics of Bacterial Communities in Soil and Leachate Water After Swine  
741 Manure Application. *Front. Microbiol.* 9, 1–11.  
742 <https://doi.org/10.3389/fmicb.2018.03197>

743 Rovira, P., McAllister, T., Lakin, S.M., Cook, S.R., Doster, E., Noyes, N.R.,  
744 Weinroth, M.D., Yang, X., Parker, J.K., Boucher, C., Booker, C.W., Woerner,  
745 D.R., Belk, K.E., Morley, P.S., 2019. Characterization of the Microbial  
746 Resistome in Conventional and “Raised Without Antibiotics” Beef and Dairy  
747 Production Systems. *Front. Microbiol.* 10, 1–12.  
748 <https://doi.org/10.3389/fmicb.2019.01980>

749 Sandberg, K.D., LaPara, T.M., 2016. The fate of antibiotic resistance genes and class  
750 1 integrons following the application of swine and dairy manure to soils. *FEMS*  
751 *Microbiol. Ecol.* 92, 1–7. <https://doi.org/10.1093/femsec/fiw001>

752 Scotta, C., Juan, C., Cabot, G., Oliver, A., Lalucat, J., Bennasar, A., Albert, S., 2011.

753 Environmental microbiota represents a natural reservoir for dissemination of  
754 clinically relevant metallo- $\beta$ -lactamases. *Antimicrob. Agents Chemother.* 55,  
755 5376–5379. <https://doi.org/10.1128/AAC.00716-11>

756 Stocker, M.D., Pachepsky, Y.A., Hill, R.L., Shelton, D.R., 2015. Depth-dependent  
757 survival of *Escherichia coli* and enterococci in soil after manure application and  
758 simulated rainfall. *Appl. Environ. Microbiol.* 81, 4801–4808.  
759 <https://doi.org/10.1128/AEM.00705-15>

760 Takahashi, S., Tomita, J., Nishioka, K., Hisada, T., Nishijima, M., 2014.  
761 Development of a prokaryotic universal primer for simultaneous analysis of  
762 Bacteria and Archaea using next-generation sequencing. *PLoS One* 9.  
763 <https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pone.0105592>

764 Wei, R., Ge, F., Huang, S., Chen, M., Wang, R., 2011. Occurrence of veterinary  
765 antibiotics in animal wastewater and surface water around farms in Jiangsu  
766 Province, China. *Chemosphere* 82, 1408–1414.  
767 <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.chemosphere.2010.11.067>

768 World Health Organization, 2019. WHO | WHO list of Critically Important  
769 Antimicrobials (CIA).

770 Xia, X., Wang, Z., Fu, Y., Du, X. dang, Gao, B., Zhou, Y., He, J., Wang, Y., Shen, J.,  
771 Jiang, H., Wu, Y., 2019a. Association of colistin residues and manure treatment  
772 with the abundance of *mcr-1* gene in swine feedlots. *Environ. Int.* 127, 361–370.  
773 <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.envint.2019.03.061>

774 Xia, X., Wang, Z., Fu, Y., Du, X. dang, Gao, B., Zhou, Y., He, J., Wang, Y., Shen, J.,

775 Jiang, H., Wu, Y., 2019b. Association of colistin residues and manure treatment  
776 with the abundance of *mcr-1* gene in swine feedlots. *Environ. Int.* 361–370.  
777 <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.envint.2019.03.061>

778 Xie, W.Y., Yuan, S.T., Xu, M.G., Yang, X.P., Shen, Q.R., Zhang, W.W., Su, J.Q.,  
779 Zhao, F.J., 2018. Long-term effects of manure and chemical fertilizers on soil  
780 antibiotic resistome. *Soil Biol. Biochem.* 122, 111–119.  
781 <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.soilbio.2018.04.009>

782 Xiong, W., Sun, Y., Ding, X., Zhang, Y., Zhong, X., Liang, W., Zeng, Z., 2015.  
783 Responses of plasmid-mediated quinolone resistance genes and bacterial taxa to  
784 (fluoro)quinolones-containing manure in arable soil. *Chemosphere* 119, 473–  
785 478. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.chemosphere.2014.07.040>

786 Yang, F., Zhang, K., Zhi, S., Li, J., Tian, X., Gu, Y., Zhou, J., 2019. High prevalence  
787 and dissemination of  $\beta$ -lactamase genes in swine farms in northern China. *Sci.*  
788 *Total Environ.* 651, 2507–2513. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.scitotenv.2018.10.144>

789 Yilmaz, P., Parfrey, L.W., Yarza, P., Gerken, J., Pruesse, E., Quast, C., Schweer, T.,  
790 Peplies, J., Ludwig, W., Glöckner, F.O., 2014. The SILVA and “all-species  
791 Living Tree Project (LTP)” taxonomic frameworks. *Nucleic Acids Res.* 42, 643–  
792 648. <https://doi.org/10.1093/nar/gkt1209>

793 Zakrzewski, M., Proietti, C., Ellis, J.J., Hasan, S., Brion, M.J., Berger, B., Krause, L.,  
794 2017. Calypso: A user-friendly web-server for mining and visualizing  
795 microbiome-environment interactions. *Bioinformatics* 33, 782–783.  
796 <https://doi.org/10.1093/bioinformatics/btw725>

797 Zhang, S., Sun, L., Wang, Y., Fan, K., Xu, Q., Li, Y., Ma, Q., Wang, J., 2020. Cow  
798 manure application effectively regulates the soil bacterial community in tea  
799 plantation 1–11.

800 Zhang, Y.J., Hu, H.W., Gou, M., Wang, J.T., Chen, D., He, J.Z., 2017. Temporal  
801 succession of soil antibiotic resistance genes following application of swine,  
802 cattle and poultry manures spiked with or without antibiotics. *Environ. Pollut.*  
803 231, 1621–1632. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.envpol.2017.09.074>

804 Zhao, X., Wang, Jinhua, Zhu, L., Ge, W., Wang, Jun, 2017. Environmental analysis  
805 of typical antibiotic-resistant bacteria and ARGs in farmland soil chronically  
806 fertilized with chicken manure. *Sci. Total Environ.* 593–594, 10–17.  
807 <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.scitotenv.2017.03.062>

808 Zhen, Z., Liu, H., Wang, N., Guo, L., Meng, J., Ding, N., Wu, G., Jiang, G., 2014.  
809 Effects of manure compost application on soil microbial community diversity  
810 and soil microenvironments in a temperate cropland in China. *PLoS One* 9.  
811 <https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pone.0108555>

812

813



814 **Figures**

815 **Fig. 1.** Concentration of flumequine in A) manure and soil samples and in B) dairy  
816 cattle, chicken and swine samples.  $p < 0.001$  as \*\*\* and  $p < 0.0001$  as \*\*\*\*. Non-  
817 significant differences are indicated by ns.

818 **Fig. 2.** Heatmap representing the microbial community composition of manure and  
819 soil samples at phylum level.

820 **Fig. 3.** Network analysis representing the microbial composition of manure and soil  
821 samples at OTU level. The 3,000 most abundant OTUs were considered to generate  
822 the network.

823 **Fig. 4.**  $\alpha$ -diversity within manure and soil samples (A and B) and within dairy cattle,  
824 chicken and swine sectors (C and D). Boxplots represent 25th to 75th percentiles and  
825 whiskers showing a maximum of 1.5x the interquartile range (IQR), and different  
826 letters indicate significant differences within the  $\alpha$ -diversity indexes ( $P < 0.05$ ).

827 **Fig. 5.**  $\beta$ -diversity between manure and soil samples (A and B) and between dairy  
828 cattle, chicken and swine samples (C and D). In both NDMS and PCoA analysis,  
829 samples are clustered according to Bray-Curtis distances.

830 **Fig. 6.** Prevalence and relative abundance of target genes to 16S rRNA copy number  
831 in manure and soil samples.  $p < 0.05$  shown as \*,  $p < 0.01$  as \*\*,  $p < 0.001$  as \*\*\*  
832 and  $p < 0.0001$  as \*\*\*\*. Non-significant differences are indicated by ns. For easiness  
833 of representation, only ARGs showing significant differences among sample types  
834 are reported.

835 **Fig. 7.** Relative abundance of target genes to 16S rRNA copy number in dairy cattle,  
836 chicken and swine samples. For easiness of representation, only ARGs showing  
837 significant differences among farm types are reported.  $p < 0.05$  shown as \*,  $p < 0.01$   
838 as \*\* and  $p < 0.001$  as \*\*\*. Non-significant differences are indicated by ns.