consensual

T. (1980) affective

ultidimen-

1013. 71101

of mood

J. Person.

JAD 00882

Provoking agents, vulnerability factors and depression in an Italian setting: a replication of Brown and Harris's model

Antonio Lora and Emilio Fava

Department of Clinical Psychiatry, University of Milan, Milan, Italy
(Received 19 June 1991)
(Revision received 4 December 1991)
(Accepted 9 December 1991)

Summary

The aetiological model of depression proposed by Brown and Harris in 1978 was examined in a sample of 120 women in Milan, using the same method for the assessment of life stresses. The role of provoking agents (severe events and major difficulties) was found to be similar to that of the earlier study. There was some evidence that lack of an intimate relationship with a husband or a boyfriend acted as a vulnerability factor, increasing the risk of depression in the face of provoking agents. The overall results support the Brown-Harris aetiological model in a quite different cultural setting.

Key words: Provoking agent; Life stress; Brown-Harris model; Italy

Introduction

One of the most interesting areas in psychiatric epidemiology in recent years has been the role of psychosocial factors in the onset and course of psychiatric disorders. In the last two decades the part played by life events in the onset of depressive disorders has received particular attention. In the first case—control study in 1969 Paykel found that depressed patients had significantly more 'exits' and undesirable events occurring in the 6 months prior to the onset of depres-

sion than did a control series; other studies, using the same method, confirmed these results (Paykel et al., 1975; Paykel and Tanner, 1976; Barrett, 1979). In 1978, as the result of two community surveys carried out in Camberwell between 1969 and 1975 on women aged between 18 and 65 and a series of comparable psychiatric patients, Brown and Harris published their influential book, Social Origins of Depression. The research was innovative in the measurement of life events, particularly in the way meaning was dealt with by contextual ratings of threat. Using the Life Events and Difficulty Schedule (LEDS) it was shown that only relatively rare events rated severe ('marked' or 'moderate' on the long-term contextual threat scale and focused on the subject)

Address for correspondence: A. Lora, via Savona 104, I-20144 Milan, Italy.

The role of early maternal loss as a vulnerability factor has also proved difficult to interpret in replication studies where on occasions due to small numbers a trend has failed to reach statistical isymificance (e.g., Costello, 1982; Campbell, 1983). There is, however, evidence from two studies confirming its role as a risk factor in terms of prevalence of depression (Harris et al., 1986; Bifulco et al., 1987) and from a third study when re-analysed (see Tennant et al., 1981; Harris and Brown, 1985). It is therefore of interest to pursue the topic further.

Unfortunately, patient enquiries cannot strictly consider the critical issue of vulnerability to such provoking agents: for this it is necessary to have a population-based enquiry that provides data on those not developing depression. However, an indirect test is possible by comparing the proportion having a vulnerability factor among patients and those with depression in the general population. If there is an effect in the general population. If there is an effect in the general population and the proportion of patients having the cases, a prima facie case for the actiological importance of the factor for patients can be made. The aim of this study is to investigate Brown The aim of this study is to investigate Brown and Harris's model in a different cultural setting, and Harris's model in a different cultural setting,

and Harris's model in a different cultural setting, but using the same measures.

Method

carried out if the women appeared suitable. Third, records were checked and a research interview disorder with an onset in the previous year. Case names of patients presenting with a depressive Community Mental Health Centre to provide contacting a number of psychiatrists at the Local series of out-patients were obtained by regularly research psychiatrist (A.L. or E.F.). Second, a possibly suitable women were interviewed by a had occurred within the prior 12 months. All subjects whose most recent onset of depression sions were regularly screened to identify possible Policinico General Hospital, Records of admistive admissions to the Psychiatric Division of the group of in-patients was selected from consecu-Gallaratese, OT.8) have been studied. First, a 18 and 65 all living in a suburban district of Milan Three distinct groups of women aged between

> 1989, table 2.2) the general population (see Brown and Harris, are important, but are somewhat less so than in well patient enquiry — that is, provoking agents and large produced similar results to the Camberless restricted to research in the UK and has by tients using broadly the same approach has been 1989, table 2.1). Life-event research among pa-English-speaking Canada (see Brown and Harris, been studies carried out in the UK, except one in peated on at least nine occasions, but all have excluded. The basic findings have now been rewomen once women with chronic depression were cent onset, but in only 30% of the remaining patients, in 89% of community cases with a reassociated with depression in 75% of psychiatric agent (a severe event or major difficulty) was one of lesser importance. At least one provoking health problems) played a causal role, although scale, lasting 2 years or more and excluding purely that major difficulties (rated 1-3 on a 6-point played an actiological role. It was also suggested

> The research also emphasised the importance of vulnerability factors. For Brown and Harris these increased the risk of depression, but only in the presence of a provoking agent (Brown and Harris, 1978, 1986a, b, 1989).

The particular importance of the quality of a woman's tie with her partner has been largely woman's tie with her partner has been largely confirmed in eight studies (Brown and Prudo, 1981; Costello, 1982; Campbell et al., 1983; Brown et al., 1989; Parry and Shapiro, 1986; Martin et al., 1989; Parry and Shapiro, 1986; Martin atudy was an effect not found (Bebbington et al., 1984). Employment outside the home as a vulnerability factor in depression has been much more difficult to replicate, although a recent longitudinal study has suggested that part-time employant may be protective for women with children ment may be protective for women with children

There are some reports confirming the presence at home of three or more children under the age of 15 as a vulnerability factor (Brown and Prudo, 1981; Campbell et al., 1983). However, there are other studies where too few women fall into the category to make an analysis worthwhile (Bebbington et al., 1984), or those that failed to repeat the Camberwell results (Brown and Birepeat the Camberwell Results (Brown

at home (Brown and Bifulco, 1990).

stroke cnsseq uot ea

ı uodn

erately

scale o

, wstke

ешъјой

Тре за

və əlil

rıs, 19° Difficu

origina

than or

nucetta

ldissoq

week; tembt

v sA

disorde

inter-ra

pa the

broach

Criteria

u sisou

Fugicol

Affectiv

semi-stı

at inter

researc

(150/13

viewed

women

agreed

general

tients a

грел ря

beweiv

viewed

tacted l

part. In

nature

sejected

tpe pons

composi

a rando

IIIA

AS SEA

a random sample of women of a similar age composition to the patient series was drawn from the household records of the local authority. Each selected woman received a letter explaining the nature of the project and inviting her to take part. In most instances women were first contacted by telephone and, if they agreed, interviewed soon afterwards. Sixty patients were interviewed and 38 were found to be suitable in that they had an onset in the prior year (eight in-patients and 30 out-patients) and 120 women in the general population. All psychiatric patients agreed to be interviewed. Thirty-one of the women in the general population were uninterviewed giving a completion rate of 79.5% (120/151).

bil-

t in

to

isti-

ell,

ud-

s of

986;

hen

and

sue

ictly

uch

ve a

on

an

or-

ents

ula-

ula-

the

aset

im-

ade.

own

ing,

een

ilan

t, a

cu-

the

nis-

ible

sion

All

уа

l, a

arly

ocal

vide

sive

ase

iew

ird,

All 180 women were interviewed by one of two research psychiatrists to assess their mental state at interview and during the prior 12 months. The semi-structured diagnostic interview Schedule for Affective Disorders and Schizophrenia (SADS, Endicott and Spitzer, 1978) was used and a diagnosis made according to Research Diagnostic Criteria (RDC, Spitzer et al., 1978). The approach was used in a previous study carried out by the same research team and a high degree of inter-rater reliability for the diagnosis of affective disorders was obtained.

As with the original Camberwell study an attempt was made to date onset to a particular week; in the few instances where this was not possible an estimate was made with a range of uncertainty in its dating, which was never wider than one month.

The rest of the interview followed closely the original Brown-Harris enquiry (Brown and Harris, 1978). The semi-structured Life Events and Difficulties Schedule (LEDS) was used to obtain life events and difficulties in the study period. The same method of rating contextual threat was employed, with a severe event defined as any 'marked' event (the highest rating on a 4-point scale of threat or unpleasantness) or those 'moderately' threatening events which were focussed upon the respondent either alone or jointly. Minor events, and those 'moderate' events not focussed upon the subject (for example a mother's stroke with good prognosis) were thus not counted as severe. We distinguished 'independent' events

and difficulties (which could not be seen as the result of depressive disorder, because their source was outside the subject's agency), 'possibly independent' (which are not out of the subject's control, but about which there was no evidence to suggest they had been related to the psychiatric status of the subject) and 'dependent' events and difficulties (which could have been brought up by the onset of the disorder itself). The analysis of provoking agents was limited to those that were independent and possibly independent. Severely threatening events and major difficulties used to define the presence of a provoking agent. The events and difficulties were rated for threat without knowledge of the individual's psychiatric status. Following the London procedure the interviewer presented the material concerning events and difficulties to a consensus rating meeting of four raters (excluding the interviewer). These were blind to whether or not the person had been depressed and his or her response to the event or difficulty. (All trained in the use of the LEDS in London and one worker who carried out about one-third of the interviews was always present.) The occurrence of life events and difficulties was established for the year prior to the onset of depression or for the year prior to the interview in the case of women without psychiatric symp-

Similar background demographic-type material was collected to that of the London study. Questions were also asked about persons to whom the woman could talk about things that were troubling her in the period prior to any onset. The original 'intimacy' scale from the Camberwell enquiry was dichotomised at the same cut-off threshold as in that study: women on the highest point, 'a', were considered to have a close, intimate, and confiding relationship with a husband or boyfriend: all other women were classed as 'non-a'.

All 38 patients satisfied Research Diagnostic Criteria for unipolar depression, including major and minor. (A further 22 with a condition lasting more than 1 year were excluded.) In the community sample eight of the 120 women were identified as having suffered onset of depression in the year; 74 community women, who were not cases of either depression or any other psychiatric dis-

NON-DELE VARIOUS **TABLE 3**

2 to 1 (5) (S) Marked ib 10jsM (1) ітоорт (А)

ib rojsM (1) (B) Kate per

7.10 [(5) (S) Marked

d) (d) 13% of t Fifty-four depressed related) v

the Camb ing accou регмеей і Номечет, at least 2 (those rat

add to th (see Tabl ation wit

The pr usd one v the depr

depressiv differ wi

РКОРОВТ LYBFE 4

OR MAJO **LKESSED**

No severe e Only major Зечете ечет Only severe

Lotal

DEPRESSION OR AT INTERVIEW FOR THE NON-DE-**FILE EVENTS IN THE 12 MONTHS BEFORE ONSET OF** LABLET

Non-depressed Depressed

LKESSED

 1 (\$\frac{\psi}{\psi}\) \%61 \quad (9\psi/0\psi) \%L8 (A) Proportion of women with at least one severe event.

Non-severe 117.4 (54/46) 206.7 (153/74) P < 0.001(47/31) 3.15 (34/73) 3.241 Severe (B) Rate per 100 of severe and non-severe events 100.0 > 4, 1

(pest used)

depressed had experienced a severe event involvdepressed compared with 8% (6/74) of the nonsevere events as a whole: 74% (34/46) of the much the same result emerged as obtained with If only severe events involving loss were utilised women had loss as a central feature (see Table 2). ters of the severe events occurring to depressed involving some element of loss. About threequarof this; and (6) a miscellaneous group of crises (5) an enforced change of residence or the threat close; (4) a major material loss or threat of loss; tionship; (3) a life-threatening illness to someone force a major reassessment of a person or relaabout someone close, which were sufficient to tion, including deaths; (2) unpleasant revelations types of loss: (1) separations or threats of separa-Severe events were classified in terms of six

difficulties lasting at least 2 years and not health minor difficulties, major difficulties (those severe While there were no differences in the rate of ing loss (P < 0.0001) (see Table 2).

SEVERE EVENTS AND THE EXPERIENCE OF LOSS

(91/9) 88 (L9/64) EL (A) % severe events involving loss Non-depressed Depressed

 $\chi^2 = 7.52$ (\$1/9) £\$ (01/15) 58 ехрепепсия а severe event (B) % with a severe loss event among those women

10.0 > 4, 1 th 1

50.0 > 4 'AP I

 $\chi^2 = 5.82$

pressed women had a lower educational stanand marital status, but not in education (desimilar in terms of age, social class, employment RDC. Depressed and non-depressed were quite or definite minor depressive disorder in terms of major depressive disorder and 37% of probable 63% satisfied the criteria of probable or definite and 38 patients). Of the 46 depressed women, depression in the year (eight community cases There were therefore 46 women with onset of disorders, and seven were diagnosed diversely. conditions, 15 suffered from chronic depressive other kind of psychiatric disorder: 16 had anxiety series. The remaining 38 women showed some orders, formed the 'non-depressed' comparison

test, with a t-test for frequency data. square with Yates' correction and Fisher's exact Cross-tabulated data were analysed using chi-

terview for those without onset of depression. been taken and a comparable period before instudy a period of 12 months before onset has more than 18 months. For the purpose of this tice it was never necessary to cover a period of within a few months of interview so that in pracdifficulties. Most of the women had an onset information about experience of life events and the 12 months before onset were covered for general community with an onset of depression For all patients (38) and those women in the

รานอ8ช ชนเทอกอนส

weeks, and most (75%) within 6 months of onset. many (40%) with a severe event had one within 9 were usually quite closely juxtaposed with onset: (2/74) among the non-depressed. Severe events vere events: 46% (21/46) compared with 3% greater proportion experiencing two or more seamong the depressed (Table 1B). They also had a was also a much higher rate of severe events in the year before interview (see Table 1A). There compared with 19% among non-depressed women at least one severe event in the year before onset example, 87% of those with an onset experienced events were closely associated with onset: for For the Milan women with depression severe

TABLE 3
VARIOUS TYPES OF DIFFICULTY IN THE 12 MONTHS BEFORE ONSET OF DEPRESSION OR INTERVIEW FOR NON-DEPRESSED

	Depressed	Non-depressed					
(A) Proportion of women with at least one difficulty							
(1) Major difficulty	54 (25/46)	15 (11/74)	$\chi^2 = 19.22, 1 df, P < 0.001$				
(2) Marked health difficulty	41 (19/46)	7 (5/74)	$\chi^2 = 19.06, 1 df, P < 0.001$				
(3) 1 or 2	85 (39/46)	13 (10/74)	$\chi^2 = 56.72, 1 df, P < 0.001$				
(B) Rate per 100 of various types	of difficulty						
(1) Major difficulty	63.0 (29/46)	14.8 (11/74)	P < 0.001				
(2) Marked health difficulty	47.8 (22/46)	10.8 (8/74)	P < 0.001				
(3) 1 or 2	110.8 (51/46)	25.6 (19/74)	P < 0.001				
	,	•	(t-test used)				

related) were four times more common among depressed women than normal women (Table 3). Fifty-four per cent of the depressed women and 15% of the normals had at least one major difficulty (P < 0.001). Marked health difficulties (those rated on the top three scale points) lasting at least 2 years are also more frequent (Table 3). However, because of the considerable correlation between major difficulties and severe events, taking account of both (i.e., the provoking agents of the Camberwell study) does not add to the association with onset based on severe events alone (see Table 4). Nor did marked health difficulties add to the severe event association: only two of the depressed and three of the non-depressed had one without also experiencing a severe event.

SET OF

DN-DE-

0.001

of six

epara-

lations

ent to

r rela-

meone

f loss;

threat

crises

equar-

ressed

ble 2).

tilised

d with

of the

e non-

nvolv-

ate of

severe

health

.OSS

The proportion with a provoking agent did not differ with type of depression: 88% of minor depressives and 89% of major depressives had

TABLE 4
PROPORTION OF DEPRESSED AND NON-DE-PRESSED WOMEN EXPERIENCING A SEVERE EVENT OR MAJOR DIFFICULTY (I.E., A PROVOKING AGENT)

	Depressed % (n)	Non-depressed % (n)
Only severe events	35 (16)	5 (4)
Severe events and major difficulty	52 (24)	14 (10)
Only major difficulty	2 (1)	1 (1)
No severe event/major difficulty	11 (5)	80 (59)
Total	100 (46)	100 (74)

experienced at least one provoking agent in the year.

Vulnerability factors

Vulnerability in the original Camberwell enquiry was defined as any factor that increased risk of onset only in the presence of a provoking agent and not separately on its own. It is necessary to establish the proportions developing depression for the following four groups: (1) provoking agent and vulnerability factor, (2) provoking agent alone, (3) vulnerability factor alone, and (4) neither. The relevant hypothesis is that there will be a higher rate of onset in group 1 than would be expected from combining the rates in groups 2 and 3, i.e., that there will be additive interaction.

All four Camberwell vulnerability factors were examined: lack of an intimate confiding relationship with husband or boyfriend, early maternal loss (either through death or through separation for a year or more) before the age of 11 (later amended to 17), and lack of paid employment. Whilst six patients and five non-depressed women had three or more children under 14 at home, none in the depressed community sample did so; therefore, the findings fall to replicate the role of this as a vulnerability factor.

Table 5A gives the results for intimacy in the general population and shows the vulnerability model is upheld. Only 6% (2/31) developed depression where neither provoking agent nor lack of intimacy was present and only 5% (2/44) when either a provoking agent or a vulnerability factor

bility effect. general population study might reveal a vulnera-(9/74). This suggests the possibility that a larger

or more children under age 15 at home. out employment outside the home or with three an increased risk of depression for women withrepeat the original Camberwell results in terms of (0/25) respectively. Therefore, we were unable to comparable figures were 18% (2/11) and 0% 5% (2/37) without; for those in employment voking agent developed depression compared with those employed 44% (4/9) of those with a proonset in the presence of a provoking agent: of were more (and not less) likely to have had an trom London in the sense that employed women Results concerning employment were different

Discussion

and in Edinburgh (Dean et al., 1983). ples in New Haven (Weismann and Myers, 1980) in-patients and later applied to community samdiagnosis. It was originally developed on hospital tion. Secondly, we used a SADS-RDC system for prevalence of depression in the general populaprevents any conclusions being drawn about the effectively. The small size of this sample also of vulnerability factors could be carried out more ple was five times greater than ours, the analysis since the size of the Camberwell community samand Harris's study and that reported here. Firstly, There are some differences between Brown

cal role of severe events. event it is only possible to argue for the aetiologiwomen with a major difficulty also had a severe However, since all but one of the depressed depressed women experienced a provoking agent. (Brown and Harris, 1989). In Milan 89% of the onset of depression ranged from 62% to 94% that experienced provoking agents prior to the the LEDS showed that the proportion of women Ten studies in the general population utilising

depressed women who were all under 65, Hownumber of marked health difficulties among the sample. In Milan there was a remarkably high tance of health difficulties in an elderly depressed depression, Murphy (1982) underlined the importionship between marked health difficulties and While Brown and Harris (1978) found no rela-

> AGENT AND LACK OF INTIMACY ('non-a') IN LEKWS OF THE PRESENCE OF A PROVOKING PROPORTION DEVELOPING ONSET OF DEPRESSION LYBLE 5

	Intimacy		Provoking
	Yes	oN	agent
	(19sno	%) əlqmsz yii	nmmoD (A)
P = 0.08 (Fisher's exact	12 (2/13)	(L/t) LS	Χes
(1251	(15/2) 9	(15/0)0	oN
V	mber)	un) sinətisi (nu	(B) Psychiatr Yes
0 *		31 3	oN

V = 0.08reach statistical significance (Fisher's exact test, numbers the difference in the top row does not (Brown and Harris, 1986b), because of small are comparable to many that have been obtained when both are present. Although these results marked additive interactive effect (57%, 4/7) occurred alone (2/13 + 0/31). But there is a

table, of details of the non-depressed lacking in the supportive of the vulnerability model irrespective 82%: Table 5B), the results are clearly highly both provoking agent and lack of intimacy (31/38), given that the great majority of patients have eral population sample. If this is accepted and of the same order as these obtained in the geninvolving those not depressed would be broadly unreasonable to assume that the denominators light of the sampling procedure, it does not seem group not developing depression. However, in the cal test of vulnerability as there is strictly no The data for patients cannot give an unequivo-

numbers, is consistent: 25% (2/8) versus 12% the general population, although based on small 5.00, 1 df, P < 0.03. Furthermore, the result in Population: 32% (12/38) vs. 12% (9/74), $\chi^2 = \frac{1}{2}$ than the non-depressed women in the general higher rate of loss of mother before the age of 17 ever, it is relevant that the patient series had a reasonable task of a vulnerability effect. Howbefore age 17 was too small (11) to allow a The number of women with loss of mother

with a events

mate ti

voking

oitautie

situatio

Since 1

seeu ss

agent si

tients l

suq tpe

елег, тр

the res

s nonel

those of

results i

a tagay, w

whose a

мріср р

gneg th

served (

describe

мијси о

While t

may, usi

9861)

(8791)

огрег ві

analysis

ability t ınteracti

ns isom

ence or

out uois

8891) Js

Harris (Our mat

88 pue ot an ae

te ionim

made tor

bresence

ever, giv

Тиете

There Katschn

Of th

Тћег

SmA

larger lnera-

ferent vomen ad an ent: of a prod with yment d 0% able to rms of with-

three

Brown Firstly, y samnalysis more also ut the opulacem for ospital y sam-

women to the 94% of the agent. ressed severe iologi-

1980)

o relaes and mporressed y high ng the However, given their considerable overlap with the presence of a severe event again a case cannot be made for an aetiological role.

There was no difference between major and minor affective disorders in terms of the presence of an aetiological agent: 90% (26/29) for major and 88% (15/17) for minor affective disorders. Our material confirmed the results of Brown and Harris (1978), Paykel (1974) and Bebbington et al. (1988) that it is not possible to divide depression into diagnostic types in terms of the presence or absence of provoking agents (see also Katschnig, 1986; Paykel, 1974).

There has been some controversy about the most suitable statistical model for testing the interaction between provoking agents and vulnerability factors. While the original Camberwell analysis utilised an additive model of interaction, other authors such as Tennant and Bebbington (1978), Costello (1982), and Parry and Shapiro (1986) evaluated interaction in a multiplicative way, using loglinear models or logistic regression. While there is no consensus of opinion as to which of the two formulations more accurately describes the causal processes at work in observed data, Brown and Harris (1986b) have argued that additive interaction is a sensible way in which to view such phenomena and in our study, whose aim was the replication of the Camberwell study, we chose the same statistical approach.

Of the four vulnerability factors examined, the results for confiding and intimacy followed closely those obtained in the original Camberwell population survey. Because of the small sample size the result was not statistically significant; however, the patterning of results was as predicted, and the fact that the majority of depressed patients had both low intimacy and a provoking agent suggests that the results as a whole can be seen as a replication.

There is a possibility of confounding here. Since the rating of intimacy is based on the situation before onset it is possible a low-intimacy situation could have been produced by the provoking crisis itself, such as the death of an intimate tie.

Among the depressed women nine severe events concerned important interaction changes with a close tie and 10 the death of a close tie. But only six deaths and two interaction changes involved a confidant and provoked the loss of the intimate relationship. For 21% (8/38) of women developing depression the low intimacy was possibly related to the confidant's death/separation; but in most cases the low intimacy involved in the vulnerability was due to the pre-existing lack of intimacy.

Another explanation lies in the association found in the Islington survey between low intimacy and provoking agents (Brown et al., 1986); negative interaction in marriage and poor parental care in childhood were both associated with a higher rate of provoking agent. However, in both instances there was also an increased risk of depression after a provoking agent — that is, negative interaction in marriage and early poor parental care were vulnerability factors as well.

These results, therefore, partially support data collected in studies that focussed on the lack of a close and supportive relationship as a crucial vulnerability factor in depression. As focussed above, Brown et al. (1986b) also observed an important link between poor intimacy in marriage and lack of self-esteem. Furthermore the same group (Brown et al., 1988) reported that there was a relationship between the support provided by a close tie and recovery or improvement in women suffering from chronic depression. This recovery was independent of the effect of a reduction in the overall ongoing difficulty score and the occurrence of 'fresh start' events.

While the numbers of women in the general population were too few for a serious test of the vulnerability hypothesis concerning early loss of mother the high rate among the depressed patients suggested that it was a risk factor and that with larger numbers the vulnerability effect might be shown to hold in a general population series. However, the result might be due to some nosocomial effect, i.e., that women with early loss of mother might be more likely to seek or receive psychiatric treatment once they get depressed. There is in any case evidence that such early loss is only an indicator of a more crucial underlying factor — lack of adequate parental care in childhood (Bifulco et al., 1987).

Paid employment outside the home did not have a protective effect — if anything, the re-

Paykel, E.I In: E.I Illness Paykel, E relapse 485, Asykel, E denths

L-55L

rural and urban population: actiology of depression. Psychol. Med., 11, 581–599.
Brown, G. W. and Bitulco, A. (1985) Social support, life events and depression. In: I. Sarason (Ed.), Social Support: Theory, Research and Application. Martinus Vijhoff, Dorory, Research and Application.

Brown, G.W. and Prudo, R. (1981) Psychiatric disorders in a

Brown, G.W. and Harris, T. (1986a) Stressor, vulnerability and depression: a question of replication. Psychol. Med., 16, 739, 744.

16, 739–744.
Brown, G.W. and Harris, T. (1986b) Establishing causal links: the Bedford College studies of depression. In: H. Katchnig (Ed.), Life Events and Psychiatric Disorders. Cambridge

University Press, Cambridge. Brown, G.W. and Harris, T. (1989) Life Events and Illness. Guilford Press, New York, NY; Hyman and Unwin, Lon-

don.

Brown, G.W. and Bifulco, A. (1990) Motherhood, employment and the development of depression: a replication of finding.

a finding? Br. J. Psychiatry 156, 169–179. Brown, G.W., Andrews, B., Harris, T., Adler, Z., and Bridge, L. (1986) Social support, self-esteem and depression. Psy-

chol. Med., 16, 813-831.

Brown, G.W., Adler, Z. and Bifulco, A. (1988) Life events, difficulties and recovery from chronic depression. Br. J.

Psychiatry 152, 487-498. Campbell, E., Cope, S. and Teasdale, J. (1983) Social factors and affective disorders: an investigation of Brown and

Harris's model. Br. J. Psychiatry 143, 548–553. Coalello, C.G. (1982) Social factors associated with depression: a retrospective community study. Psychol. Med. 12,

Dean, C., Surfees, P.G. and Sashidharan S.P. (1983) Comparison of research diagnostic systems in an Edinburgh community sample. Br. I. Psychiatry, M. 2017, 267

munity sample. Br. J. Psychiatry 142, 247–256. Endicott, J. and Spitzer, R.L. (1978) A diagnostic interview: the Schedule for Affective Disorders and Schizophrenia. Arch. Gen. Psychiatry 35, 837–844.

Harris, T.O. and Brown, G.W. (1985) Interpreting data in actiological studies of affective disorders: some pitfalls and

ambiguities. Br. J. Psychiatry 147, 5–15.
Harris, T.O., Brown, G.W. and Bifulco, A. (1986) Loss of parent in childhood and adult psychiatric disorder: the Walthamstow Study. I. The role of lack of adequate parental care. Psychol. Med., 16, 641–659.

Katschnig, H., Pakesh, G. and Egger-Zeidner, E. (1986) Life stress and subtypes of depression. In: H. Katschnig (Ed.), Life Events and Psychiatric Disorders, Controversial Is-

sues. Cambridge University Press, Cambridge. Martin, C.J., Brown, G.W., Goldberg, D.P. and Brockington, I.F. (1989) Psychosocial stress and puerperal depression. J.

Affect. Disord. 16, 283–293.
Murphy, E. (1982) Social origins of depression in old age. Br.
J. Psychiatry 141, 135–142.
Parry, G. and Shapiro, D. (1986) Life events and social

support in working class mothers: stress buffering or inde-

pendent effect. Arch. Gen. Psychiatry 43, 315-323.

verse. However, in Camberwell this was only a second order factor after the other three factors had been examined. Furthermore, a recent analysis of employment in another population suggests that a much larger sample size is required to sort out the complex processes that may be involved, particularly as, for women with children at home, full-time work (in contrast to part-time work) appears to increase the risk of depression given a major crisis (Brown and Bifulco, 1990).

In conclusion, our study generally supported Brown and Harris's actiological model of depression in a quite different cultural setting; though this was limited to the role of provoking agents and one vulnerability factor (lack of intimacy). On the other hand it would have been surprising if in such a different sociocultural background the vulnerability factors were entirely the same. The original study should only be seen as serving as a original study should only be seen as serving as a chosocial stressors; it is hoped that research in chosocial stressors; it is hoped that research in other cultures may in time help to specify the basic underlying actiological processes that are involved.

Acknowledgements

We would like to thank Professor G.W. Brown and Mrs T.O. Harris for their help and support in all stages of our research and for helpful comments on the manuscript.

References

Barrett, J. (1979) The relationship of life events to the onset of neurotic disorders. In: J. Barrett et al. (Eds.), Stress and Mental Disorders. Raven Press, New York, NY.

Bebbington, P.E., Sturt, E., Tennant, C. and Hurry, J. (1984)
Misfortune and resilience: a community study of women.
Psychol. Med. 14, 347–364.

Bebbington, P.E., Brugha, T., MacCarlhy, B., Potter, J., Sturt, E., Wykes, T., Katz, R. and McGuffin, P. (1988) The Camberwell collaborative depression study – depressed probands: adversity and the form of depression. Br. J. Psychiatry 152, 754–765.

Bifulco, A., Brown, G.W. and Harris, T.O. (1987) Childhood loss of parent, lack of adequate parental care and adult depression: a replication. J. Affect. Disord. 12, 115–128. Brown, G.W. and Harris, T. (1978) Social Origins of Depression: A Study of Psychiatric Disorder in Women. Tavistock

Publications, London.

ers in a n. Psy-

events t: The-, Dor-

rability Med.,

l links: atchnig ibridge

Illness. 1, Lonmploy-

tion of Bridge,

n. Psy-

events, Br. J.

factors n and

lepresed. 12,

mparin comerview:

renia. ata in

lls and

r: the

equate

i) Life
(Ed.),

ngton, ion. J.

ial Is-

ge. Br.

social inde-

- Paykel, E.S. (1974) Recent life events and clinical depression. In: E.K. Gunderson and E.D. Rahe (Eds.), Life Stress and Illness. C.C. Thomas, Springfield, IL.
- Paykel, E.S. and Tanner, J. (1976) Life events, depressive relapse and maintenance treatment. Psychol. Med. 6, 481–485.
- Paykel, E.S., Myers, J.K., Dienelt, M.N., Klerman, G.L., Lidenthal, J.J. and Pepper, M.P. (1969) Life events and depression: a controlled study. Arch. Gen. Psychiatry 21, 753-760.
- Spitzer, R.L., Endicott, J. and Robins, E. (1978) Research Diagnostic Criteria: rationale and reliability. Arch. Gen. Psychiatry 35, 773-782.
- Tennant, C., Smith, A., Bebbington, P. and Hurry, J. (1981)
 Parental loss in childhood, adult psychiatric impairment
 and contact with psychiatric services. Arch. Gen. Psychiatry 38, 309-314.
- Weissmann, M.M. and Myers, J.K. (1980) Psychiatric disorders in a U.S. community. Acta Psychiatr. Scand. 62, 99-111.